



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, April 26, 2022

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

This meeting will be held in person. General Public - see agenda for virtual access and participation instructions.

[PDRPRES 2022.010](#) Public Access and Participation Information - Commission of Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW](#)

Call to Order

The meeting began at 3:32pm.

Alex Dandridge read the announcement for virtual public meetings.

Commission members are present in City Hall.

Roll Call

Staff in Attendance: Planner Alex Dandridge, Planner Emily Routman, Planner Alyson Oliver

Commission Chair Johnson explained that the meeting's first half hour is for business matters, which may not be of interest to the general public, though they are welcome to attend.

Present -- 9 - * Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Mitch Danese, * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, * Commissioner Andrew Moore, * Commissioner Sean Wheeler, * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, * Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and * Commissioner John Grier

Approval of Minutes

None.

OTHER BUSINESS

Secretary's Report

Mr. Dandridge said that staff is still working on the Admin Approval Guidelines for sheds, and the last step is to run it by the legal team. After that, it will be voted on by the Commission.

Administrative Approval Report

There were no comments from the Commission.

Enforcement Report

Mr. Dandridge gave an update on enforcements: 420 N. 24th St., 3111 E. Broad St., 615 N. 21st St., 2017 Venable St., and 2323 Venable St.

The business portion was adjourned at 3:38pm.

Administrative Approval Guidelines - Sheds

CONSENT AGENDA

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the Commissioners wished to move any items from the regular agenda to the consent agenda or vice versa.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commission Chair Johnson, to move 405 N. Allen Ave. to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant didn't have a problem moving their application to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion. There was none.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler

Excused – 1 – Grier

A motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commission Chair Johnson, to move 501 N. Allen Ave. to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. Brian Green, the applicant, said he had no problem moving his application to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion.

Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez asked where on the building the signage will be located. Mr. Green said that nothing will be illuminated and the signage is part of the SUP process, because they are asking for more signage than is allowed by-right. Commission Chair Johnson said that she heard some neighborhood feedback that the signage is too large for a historic building. Mr. Green said the intent is for the signs to look like flags.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler

Excused – 1 – Grier

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to move 3820 Hermitage Rd. to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. Charlie Field, the architect, said he had no problem moving his application to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion. There was none.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 7 – Brewer, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler

Abstain – 1 – Danese

Excused – 1 – Grier

A motion was made by Commissioner Pearson, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to move 313 N. 32nd St. to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. Brian Spencer, the applicant, said he had no problem moving his application to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if the roof hatch is for security. Mr. Spencer said yes.

Commissioner Moore stated that featuring paired windows on the projecting bay rather than the proposed two, singular windows would be more in-keeping with the district's existing fenestration patterns.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler

Excused – 1 – Grier

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Morgan, to move 2019 Monument to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, said she had no problem moving the application to the Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion.

Commissioner Wheeler said his biggest comment was just to make it more rectilinear.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Brewer, Danese, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler

Excused – 1 – Grier

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, to remove 604 W. 19th from the Consent Agenda to the Regular Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. Janice Carter-Lovejoy, the applicant, said she was okay moving it to the Regular Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment.

Jason Hendricks said he was comfortable with the metal railings as proposed, because the proportions are about the same. The owner has kept up on the maintenance, but the soft woods these days just don't hold up.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion.

Commissioner Moore asked what the difference between this application and 2608 E. Grace. Mr. Dandridge said that it just has to do with newer construction versus older construction – he said that staff is hoping for a more durable material than new wood.

Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez asked if aluminum railing would be allowed on new construction. Mr. Dandridge said that it would have to be considered on a case-by-case basis.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 5 – Danese, Moore, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler

No – 3 – Danese, Johnson, Morgan

Excused – 1 – Grier

Commissioner Moore asked about the visibility of the carport on 3108 E. Broad Street. Mr. Dandridge said it would be visible. Ms. Oliver said that the Commission has approved similar designs in the past.

Commissioner Moore asked about PVC vs. wood in 3108 E. Broad as well. Ms. Oliver said that the Guidelines talk about PVC, but not very specifically. She said that for more visible items like the pergola and gate, staff is not comfortable with PVC. The Guidelines generally discourage PVC.

He also asked about the roof material on the carport being bright copper. Mr. Dandridge said that it's actual copper and slanted away from the alley so it might not be visible.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any Commission discussion on the

Consent Agenda.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there was any public comment. There was none.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 7 – Brewer, Johnson, Moore, Morgan, Pearson, Rodriguez, Wheeler

Abstain – 1 – Danese

Excused – 1 – Grier

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

2. [COA-109601-2022](#) 3108 E. Broad Street - Rebuild a rear deck and fence, and construct a pergola.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The pergola be constructed of wood and painted or stained a neutral color that complements the main building. Final colors submitted to staff for review and approval; The carport columns be wrapped in wood and painted or stained a neutral color to complement the main building; If the existing rear privacy fence is removed, it be reconstructed of wood and painted or stained a neutral color that complements the main building. Any new rear fencing must incorporate a traditional privacy fence design with vertically-oriented pickets. Final design and colors to be submitted to staff for review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

3. [COA-107855-2022](#) 313 N. 32nd Street - Construct a new 2-story duplex with a roof-top deck on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [313 N 32nd - Application and Plans \(3/22/2022\)](#)
[Staff Report \(3/22/2022\)](#)
[Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The proposed lap siding be smooth and without a bead. Final material and color specifications to be submitted to staff for review and approval; the detached garage use a material and color palette that matches the principal dwelling. The garage should also use a simple garage door design that does not incorporate any faux hardware. Final design to be submitted to staff for review and approval; and Final design and material specifications for the proposed fence be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

7. [COA-109653-2022](#) 501 N. Allen Avenue - Exterior rehabilitation of an existing multi-family building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: final sign specifications, including design and colors, be submitted for administrative review and approval, and that all sign hardware be installed in a way that does not damage existing historic material, and that the applicant adhere to any additional sign regulations required by the SUP; the canopies be installed in a way that does not damage existing historic material, final design and color submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; final window schedule be submitted for administrative review and approval; and any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR Part II approval be submitted to CAR staff for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

8. [COA-109608-2022](#) 2019 Monument - Increase the height of an existing, rear brick wall and construct a free-standing fireplace.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the new brick placed on top of the existing brick wall use a different brick bond or brick finish, as approved by the CAR, final material and/or bond pattern submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; and the chimney be clad in brick, and be more rectangular in form.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

9. [COA-109613-2022](#) 405 N. Allen Avenue - Enclose a rear, screened-in porch and replace a wooden railing with metal.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: Staff recommends that the porch enclosure be clad in a horizontal siding with a differing width from the existing.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

Abstain -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

10. [COA-109609-2022](#) 3820 Hermitage Road - Construct a new 2-story rear garage.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: Final material and color selection for the roof and siding to be submitted to staff for review and approval; and Final window specifications be submitted to staff for review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- Excused --** 1 - Commissioner John Grier
- Abstain --** 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

REGULAR AGENDA

1. [COA-109599-2022](#) 604 W. 19th Street - Replace front and rear wooden porch railings with aluminum.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commissioner Moore asked Mr. Dandridge to reiterate the logic behind the recommendation.

Mr. Dandridge said that staff looked for precedent for this type of approval – it has been approved before – and finding because it is newer construction, the material might be more in-keeping with that dwelling. Staff finds that aluminum generally appears to be wood.

Commissioner Chair Johnson said that his concern is setting the precedent.

Commissioner Moore said he has a more liberal reading of the Guidelines – there is no intrinsic advantage to put in a substandard material if there is a more durable material. He would be more concerned if it's a facsimile of the Richmond rail.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Janice Carter-Lovejoy, responded yes. She said the house is 6 years old, she's maintained the railing and the builder used the proper material. The style will still look like Richmond rail.

In the neighborhood, there are 6 properties that do not have wooden railings – none of them are new construction, but they are aluminum, cast iron, etc.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the dimension, profile, and design of the new aluminum railings match that of the existing wooden railings, specifications submitted to staff for review and approval.

Commissioner Wheeler said maybe the Commission should not recommend Richmond rail if it's going to continue to fail. Commissioner Danese and Commissioner Moore discussed different potential materials. Commissioner Danese said many materials today are not easily identifiable. Commissioner Moore said that he would be more inclined to allow a homeowner to do a project with a less expensive material that might be PVC.

Commissioner Wheeler said that it seems Richmond rail is the default because of cost. Commission Chair Johnson said that this would be a good point of discussion for the next Quarterly Meeting.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the dimension, profile, and design of the new aluminum railings match that of the existing wooden railings, specifications submitted to staff for review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

4. [COA-109603-2022](#) 2 W. Leigh Street - Construct a new 3-story, multi-family building on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any questions for Staff from Commissioners.

Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez asked what the railing is made of. Mr. Dandridge said he believes it's wood.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Bruce Shirley, said he is fine with all staff recommendations. He also said that the front railing is wood and the rear railing is metal.

Commissioner Moore said the windows on the 2nd floor on the front façade seem to be set low, and houses of this type would usually be closer to the entablature.

Mr. Shirley said that it's a good point and would have no issue raising those. He said it would probably help the side elevation to raise the windows 4 inches.

Commissioner Moore also asked about the dimension of the front porch. Mr. Shirley said it's 6'5" in depth.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The cornice be simplified; The rear metal fence be a simple design and abide by all applicable zoning regulation, final design and material submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; All final material and color specification be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; Final design and extent of the rear concrete patio be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; Either box or half-round gutters be used in lieu of the proposed k-style gutters, final specifications submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; Provide additional screening of the HVAC equipment from W. Leigh Street, specification on screening material submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; All second-floor windows be raised by at least 4"; front porch depth be no greater than 6' 5"; and all final material and color specifications to be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

Commissioner Pearson said that the mansard roof still looks off to him, and doesn't exactly seem to fit and be consistent with the architectural styles of the neighborhood; maybe moving it to a hipped or gable roof.

Commissioner Moore said that it's not in CAR's purview to design the building. There are many elements in this house pointing to a more contemporary interpretation.

Mr. Dandridge said that in the immediate area, there are examples of faux mansards with dormers. The 2D drawings are hard to gauge. Commissioner Danese said that colors make a big difference.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The cornice be simplified; The rear metal fence be a simple design and abide by all applicable zoning regulation, final design and material submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; All final material and color specification be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; Final design and extent of the rear concrete patio be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; Either box or half-round gutters be used in lieu of the proposed k-style gutters, final specifications submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; Provide additional screening of the HVAC equipment from W. Leigh Street, specification on screening material submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; All second-floor windows be raised by at least 4"; front porch depth be no greater than 6' 5"; and all final material and color specifications to be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

5. [COA-109606-2022](#) 1634 W. Grace - Replace a slate roof with faux slate.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Reports](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Bill Gallasch, responded yes. He said they're just doing the porch roof, not the main roof, and there is precedent of approving this material at 2237 W. Grace. He said the slate roof is not practical anymore.

Commissioner Pearson asked what the current material is. Mr. Gallasch said it's just water shield.

Commissioner Moore asked if they knew the size of the original slates. Mr. Gallasch said the width was about the same.

Commission Chair Johnson said this changes his opinion. He asked if they investigated another type of product like standing seam metal, because it'll probably do better leakage-wise. Commissioner Danese said as long as it's installed correctly, it should last just as long as TPO.

Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez asked if other Grace Street porch roofs have slate. Mr. Gallasch said he's seen it all.

Commissioner Pearson is wondering if the porch roof was originally some other type rather than the slate. Mr. Gallasch said he didn't think so.

Commissioner Brewer asked if he considered any other materials. Mr. Gallasch chose this faux slate because it was approved on other properties nearby.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: new synthetic slate match the color and dimension of the original authentic slate as closely as possible; applicant to provide a sample of the original authentic slate and the proposed synthetic slate for comparison to staff for review prior to installation.

Commissioner Danese said he thinks it should last 30 years.

Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez asked if it'll match the color of the existing slate on the upper roof. Mr. Gallasch said it should be the same.

Commissioner Pearson said that the Guidelines say that if it's historically slate, and there's a way to make it slate, that's what should stand.

Commissioner Brewer asked staff if their recommendation would change knowing it's the porch roof. Mr. Dandridge said no, staff would still recommend real slate instead of faux slate.

Commissioner Moore asked if Mr. Gallasch has an in-tact piece of the slate. Mr. Gallasch said he can bring it to the next meeting.

A Motion was made by Commissioner Morgan, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: new synthetic slate match the color and dimension of the original authentic slate as closely as possible; applicant to provide a sample of the original authentic slate and the proposed synthetic slate for comparison to staff for review prior to installation.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 5 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson
- No --** 4 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner John Grier

6. [COA-109611-2022](#) 2608 E. Grace Street - Replace deteriorated wooden rear porch elements with new materials and taller side rails.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application was presented by Alex Dandridge.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if there were any question for staff from Commissioners.

Commissioner Moore asked specifically what part of this project staff is recommending approval for.

Commissioner Danese asked about the thought process for changing the design. Mr. Dandridge said that there's a parking lot on the other side, so increasing the height for privacy is acceptable.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Dennis Fairbanks, responded yes. The primary reason is that the porch extends the entire width of the house. It's 5 feet off the level of the ground and is about 30 feet up. The wood is rotting, and they hope to replace it with a longer lasting material. They're open to suggestions other than wood, though.

Commissioner Moore asked if the PVC material is milled & cut like wood. Mr. Fairbanks said he wasn't sure, but that it is supposed to snap into place on the column instead of slide on.

Commissioner Wheeler asked why they want to cover the rafters. Mr. Fairbanks said it's not a critical part, and would match the bottom.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Commission Chair Johnson opened floor for Commission discussion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to partially approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: denial of the PVC privacy panels on the western elevation of the rear porch; denial of the installation of the PVC tongue and groove ceiling on the second-floor of the rear porch; the new rear aluminum railings wrap around to the western side of the rear porch on the first and second floors, and a removable screening element be used behind the railing for desired privacy; material used to wrap the square posts and fascia be a material that is milled, cut, and painted or stained such as PVC, fiberglass composite wood or another substitute material that resembles wood in appearance.

Commissioner Pearson said he agrees with Commissioner Moore's points, but is not ready for PVC for railings. Commissioner Danese said he has used fiber glass posts in construction projects and it looks better than PVC.

Commissioner Morgan said that this is not a historic feature of the house, so that may help on the discussion. She said they should not approve the bead board on the ceiling of the 2nd floor because it might conflict with one of the window openings.

Commissioner Wheeler said he'd agree. He also said wrapping the columns could still lead to rot. He said staining the wood may last longer than paint and could be acceptable for a secondary elevation.

Commissioner Danese said that hardie comes pre-painted and the lifespan of the paint is 15 years.

Commission Chair Johnson said that there are so many different types of PVC so the approval should be clear on that.

Commissioner Wheeler said that the Guidelines say PVC is allowed in certain situations, and it's best for curved materials.

Commissioner Pearson said he'd like to take PVC off the table completely. Commissioner Morgan said it's been approved before on new construction.

Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez said that she has a problem with the 6-foot panel on the end. Ms. Fairbanks said that right across from their porch is eye-to-eye with condos. Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez said maybe a screen could allow for privacy. Commissioner Grier asked if staff could approve a temporary, seasonal screening element. Mr. Dandridge said that it would be Administratively Approvable. Commissioner Moore said he would amend his motion to include the porch wrap around and to allow aluminum railings.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to partially approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff

report provided the following conditions are met: denial of the PVC privacy panels on the western elevation of the rear porch; denial of the installation of the PVC tongue and groove ceiling on the second-floor of the rear porch; the new rear aluminum railings wrap around to the western side of the rear porch on the first and second floors, and a removable screening element be used behind the railing for desired privacy; material used to wrap the square posts and fascia be a material that is milled, cut, and painted or stained such as PVC, fiberglass composite wood or another substitute material that resembles wood in appearance.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 9 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner John Grier

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

11. [COA-109598-2022](#) 601-603 W. 19th Street - Construct a new single-family dwelling and rear garage on a vacant lot, and construct a new garage at the rear of an existing dwelling.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Reports](#)

The application was presented by Alyson Oliver.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the roof is designed for solar panels. Ms. Oliver said it was.

Commission Chair Johnson asked if the applicant was present. The applicant, Jason Hendricks, identified himself. The form is typical of the neighborhood – there are a lot of front gabled roofs. He extruded the form to make it more contemporary. There's a smaller recessed area in the back. The low sloped roof on the side is utilitarian, enclosing the stairs to the attic. The roof line of the ADUs roof is designed to accommodate solar, oriented to receive the greatest amount of sunlight. In regards to the pedestrian scale on the front entrance, the overall form addresses the street. The concrete steps are centered on the bay. The Applicant stated that he took precedent from 618 W. 20th for the 45 degree angled roof. He's trying to make the attic more usable.

Commissioner Pearson asked about zoning. Mr. Hendricks said they're getting an SUP for ADUs and setbacks.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for public comment.

Janice Carter-Lovejoy said that Springhill is a unique district – every property except for 3 has a front porch, and it contributes to the character of the neighborhood. She thinks it's missing here. She said that she doesn't want the height to be any taller than the adjacent houses. Lastly, she thinks the Commission to consider new builds in infill areas to require off-street parking.

Commission Chair Johnson opened the floor for Commission discussion.

Commissioner Moore asked about the materials. Mr. Hendricks said the roof will probably

be asphalt shingles, and the side form will be metal panels with board & baton siding. The recessed area will either be natural finished wood or cedar shakes. The extrusions will probably be hardie plank.

Commissioner Moore asked for more detail on where the wall plane meets the roof. Mr. Hendricks said there will probably be a gutter. Traditionally, the houses have the eave with soffit material. Commissioner Moore said having the eave would be a way to tie in to the neighborhood. He also stated that the form of the front porch should be changed to include more transparency.

Commission Chair Johnson said a porch is an element that makes it known that it's the front of the structure.

Commissioner Moore said especially since this is a corner lot.

Commission Chair Johnson said he wasn't sure if there was a better way to present the height.

Commissioner Morgan said she agreed with holes in the side walls. The adjacent porches are somewhat enclosed. She is concerned about the square footage of the ADU compared to the historic building, as the Guidelines state they should be subordinate to the main structure.

Commissioner Wheeler said that it being a corner lot, punching openings would be beneficial to address the corner. He thinks the massing is fine but could bring it more in line with the neighborhood. Specifically the pitch of the roof, and the overall design of the front porch, suggesting that the front porch roof could be a shade structure or an open trellis. He thinks the material selection will be key. Commissioner Wheeler also suggested that perhaps there should be an internal gutter.

Commissioner Butler-Rodriguez asked about the ownership structure. Mr. Hendricks said that he would live in the new house and rent out 603 and the ADUs. She said she thinks the ADUs' roof lines are cute and she likes the scale. She does agree about the front porch.

Commissioner Pearson expressed concern over the pitch of the main roof combined with the height of the proposed dwelling will make it stick out literally and figuratively.

The application was conceptually reviewed. The Commission discussed the proposal with the applicant and made recommendations in an advisory capacity. A record of the comments will be made available to the applicant upon the approval of the meeting minutes.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 6:45pm.