

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT  
May 22, 2018 Meeting**

6. **COA-034549-2018** (S. Stein)

**123 West Broad Street  
Broad Street Old and Historic District**

**Project Description:**

**Replace 78 windows.**

**Staff Contact:**

**K. Chen**

The applicant requests approval to replace 78 windows on the 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> stories of a commercial structure at the corner of West Broad and North Jefferson streets in the Broad Street Old and Historic District. The applicant proposes to install 1/1 aluminum clad wood windows to match the existing, original 1/1 wood windows with ogee lugs.

**Staff recommends denial of the project.** The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* state that all original windows should be retained and repaired and should only be replaced when the windows have deteriorated beyond the point of repair (pg. 65, #1, 6, 7). Though there is evidence that some windows are in poor condition, staff does not believe the applicant has provided enough evidence that all of the existing windows have deteriorated beyond repair. As the *Guidelines* emphasize that original windows should be retained and damaged elements should be repaired not replaced (pg. 55, #5, 7), staff cannot recommend approval for the replacement of the windows which are visible from the public right-of-way. The Commission may wish to defer this application to allow the applicant the opportunity to provide a more detailed window survey which thoroughly illustrates the condition of each window.

It is the assessment of staff that the application is not consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation in Sections 30-930.7(b) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.