

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
February 28, 2017 Meeting**

15. **CAR No. 17-023** (T. Dykshorn)

**125 North 25th Street
St. John's Church Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Modification to previously approved plans to include the demolition of existing addition and construction of a new addition.**

Staff Contact: **M. Pitts**

This application is to modify previously approved plans for the construction a two-story addition on the rear of a dwelling located in the St. John's Church Old. The existing dwelling was constructed in two phases. The two-story side-gable portion fronting on 25th Street was constructed in 1849 and a two-story shed roof addition was added to the east (rear) elevation ca. 1890. A small, one-story mud room addition was constructed on the rear elevation in 2007. On July 26, 2016, the Commission approved the applicants request to demolish the 2007 addition and construct a two story primarily glass addition on the alley and rear elevations of the existing structure.

Unfortunately, while performing selective demolition prior to constructing the approved addition, the existing 1890 addition was demolished by the applicant without Commission review or approval. With this application, the applicant is requesting permission for the demolition the 1890 addition, reconstruction of a similar addition, and the replacement of siding on the 1849 section.

Staff recommends approval of the project with a condition.

Demolition: The *Guidelines* note that demolition is considered an option of last resort for contributing historic properties (pg. 78). The Guidelines also note that changes to property over time that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be preserved. Staff believes that the 1890 addition had obtained significance in its own right and should have been preserved. The Guidelines note that demolition may be appropriate when a building or structure has deteriorated beyond the point of feasible rehabilitation (pg. 78). The applicant has submitted documentation of the condition of the structure which illustrate the level of deterioration. Staff recommends approval of the demolition of the structure with the condition that the visible portion of the remaining historic fabric (one chimney) remain and be incorporated into the new addition.

Addition: The applicant is proposing to reconstruct the demolished two story addition with setbacks to meet the current zoning. The proposed addition will be

setback from the north property line which differs from the 1890 structure. This setback will accentuate the historic gable roof and differentiate the addition from the historic structure. As The *Guidelines* state that new construction should be compatible with the historic features that characterize their setting and context while being discernible from the old (pg. 44), staff supports the construct of the addition which is modeled after the historic addition yet is differentiated from the historic gable structure and the previous addition by the different setback and the use of a wider siding profile.

Siding. The applicant has uncovered what is thought to be the original siding for the 1849 section on the rear wall of the structure. Staff supports the applicant's request to reside the 1849 structure with wood siding in a profile to match the historic profile.

It is the assessment of staff that the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation, New Construction, and Demolition outlined in Sections 30.930.7(b), (c), and (d) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of code.