

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
May 22, 2018, Meeting**

16. **COA-034576-2018** (J. & A. Pardue) **3408 East Broad Street
Chimborazo Park Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Construct a new, 3-story single family dwelling.**

Staff Contact: **C. Jeffries**

Proposal: The applicant seeks conceptual review and comment on the construction of a new detached single-family house on a vacant lot in the Chimborazo Park Old and Historic District. From East Broad Street, the proposed structure appears to be a 2-story brick structure set on a high, brick foundation, with a balcony and a recessed third story with single lite French doors for access, vertically aligned with the windows below. The rooftop deck will be enclosed by a black metal rail. The structure has a 2-bay façade and a full façade front porch with classical detailing, a turned balustrade, and brick lattice below the decking. The façade has a dentiled cornice and ranked 2/2 triple windows. The front door will be wood with glazing, flanked with multi-lite sidelites with a single-light transom above. The window bay of the façade will project 1'-4". The rear of the dwelling appears to be four stories with a split-face block basement level. There will be two sets of full lite French doors vertically aligned on the basement and first story, with three evenly spaced 2/2 double hung windows on the second and third stories. The dwellings will have 2/2, wood composite windows and cementitious siding on the sides and rear as well as the recessed upper story. The structure will have a low-pitched shed roof clad in TPO.

Surrounding Context: The proposed new construction will be located on the north side of East Broad Street on a narrow lot between two historic houses. Chimborazo Park is directly across East Broad Street from the subject lot. Buildings in the immediate area include houses with Late Victorian and Queen Anne stylistic elements. The adjacent property to the east at 3406 East Broad Street is one of the later houses in the block constructed in 1931 in the Classical Revival style. The single-family dwelling in a simplified Late Victorian Style at 3404 East Broad Street was approved by the Commission in 2015. The property at 3400 East Broad Street is representative of the more typical, demonstrative, frame, Late Victorian dwellings found in this prominent block fronting on Chimborazo Park.

Previous Reviews: This is the Commission's first review of this project.

The applicant is seeking **Conceptual Review** for this project. Conceptual review is covered under Sec. 30-930.6(d) of the City Code: The commission shall review and discuss the proposal with the applicant and make any necessary recommendations. Such Conceptual Review shall be advisory only. Commission

staff reviewed the project through the lens of the “Standards for New Construction: Residential” on pages 46-51 of the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*.

S=satisfies

D=does not satisfy

NA=not applicable

S **D** **NA**

New infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns in the surrounding district

The front yard setback is shown as 16 ½ feet which will match the surrounding structures. Dimensions of the side yards were not provided though the minimal side yard setbacks appear to match the structures on the block. The owner is seeking an administrative variance to the side yard setback requirement on this narrow lot.

Where the adjoining buildings have different setbacks, the setback for the new building should be based on the historical pattern for the block

The adjacent properties have similar setbacks.

New buildings should face the most prominent street bordering the site

The structure addresses East Broad Street.

New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the district. Form refers to the combination of massing, size, symmetry, proportions, projections and roof shapes that lend identity to a building.

The project utilizes some elements found on structures on the block including a front door with sidelights and transom, a full façade porch, and a 2-bay, asymmetrical façade. The majority of the houses on the block have decorative cornices and shed roofs or false mansard roofs. Staff finds that the proposed recessed third story and balcony are not building forms found within the district. The majority of houses on this block are 2 or 2 ½ stories with a gable or false mansard roof and dormers. The Commission may wish to consider if the use of a more traditional rooftop balustrade at a lower height in combination with a more modern railing set back from the front of the structure would be more appropriate. The prominence of triple windows and a shallow projecting bay are also not forms found within the district.

New construction should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps.

The proposed project incorporates human-scale elements including a front porch, a decorative cornice, and front steps. Staff notes that the cornice design is not typical as it contains two rows of dentils. The proposed rear porch is also a human-scale element though staff notes that the deck does not extend to the second set of French doors on the first story. The sub-decking should be screened with wood latticework or with brick piers.

New construction should respect the typical height of surrounding buildings

The structure is similar in height to the structure to the west and significantly taller than the structure to the east. The block is characterized by a variation in heights, however structures are 2 or 2 ½ stories. As the third story is recessed 13'-8" from the front of the structure it may not be visible from the street. The applicant should submit context perspective renderings to demonstrate the 3rd story's visibility.

New construction should respect the typical width, organization of bays, vertical alignment and symmetry of surrounding buildings.

The proposed dwelling is similar in width to the adjacent houses and maintains the 2-bay configuration, vertical alignment, and symmetry of the surrounding buildings.

The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings should be compatible with patterns established in the district.

The typical fenestration pattern and window proportions on the façade is not consistent with patterns in the district. The fenestration pattern on the rear of the structure is more traditional, with the exception of the use of four French door openings.

Porch and cornice heights should be compatible with adjacent buildings

As a fully dimensioned context elevation was not provided, staff cannot determine whether the proposed porch or cornice heights are consistent with surrounding buildings.

Materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district. Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted.

The applicant is proposing to have brick veneer on the façade and fiber cement siding on the sides and rear of the structure. This combination of materials is not consistent with buildings found on the block or in the district. The Commission may wish to consider whether the brick should continue along the sides of the structure where it will be visible from East Broad Street. Staff also notes that the proposed brick screening under the front porch may not be compatible with materials used in the District and the Commission may wish to recommend a different treatment.

The following items will need to be included for final review (please refer to the Commission's New Construction Checklist and Required Dimensions document for additional details):

1. Dimensioned elevations to include the height from grade
2. Dimensioned context site plan
3. Dimensioned context elevation
4. List of windows and doors to include size, material, and design
5. Description of all materials (attach specification sheets if necessary)

6. Statement of how the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* informed the proposed work.