

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
May 26, 2013, Meeting**

14. **CAR No. 15-065** (J. & T. Moran) **414 North 28th Street
Church Hill North Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Replace three windows at the rear of the house**

Staff Contact: **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests permission to replace three second story windows at the rear of a structure in the Church Hill North Old and Historic District as part of a rehabilitation of the 1872 freestanding Greek Revival home. Though the application is for the replacement of three windows, the southernmost window is not visible from the public right-of-way and, therefore, is not under the purview of the Commission. Commission staff confirmed with the Department of Public Works staff that though during the site visit it appears a public alley runs behind the property, a portion of the alley is private property not public right-of-way. The portion of the alley behind the subject home is not accessible from the public right-of-way. Because of this condition, there is limited visibility of two of the windows, and the third window is not visible.

The applicant is proposing to replace the existing six over six wood windows with two over two Berkshire Elite "Traverse" vinyl windows. According the applicant, the existing windows are not original to the home, and the applicant proposes to install windows that would match the historic two over two windows found on the front elevation.

Staff recommends approval of the project with a condition. The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* state that all original windows should be retained, and windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair (pg. 65, #1, #7). The applicant asserts that the windows to be replaced are not original to the structure which is supported by the fact that these windows have a different muntin configuration as compared to the historic windows in the front of the home. The applicant also asserts that the windows have deteriorated beyond repair. Staff recommends that the proposed two windows can be replaced as they do not appear original to the structure and are minimally visible from the public right-of-way.

The *Guidelines* state that vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic buildings in historic districts because the material cannot be manufactured to model effectively the appearance of historic windows (pg. 65, #11). Staff recommends the applicant install true divided lite or simulated divided lite wood or aluminum clad wood windows rather than the vinyl windows.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the condition above, is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(b)

of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.