

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
August 25, 2015 Meeting**

12. CAR No. 15-112 (J. Coffey)

**2805 E. Clay Street
Church Hill North Old and Historic District**

Project Description: Replace siding, windows, and front door

Staff Contact: K. Chen

The applicant requests approval to replace the siding, windows, and front door on a dwelling in the Church Hill North Old and Historic District. The application is the result of enforcement activity.

The applicant has replaced the lap wood siding on the house with Hardie Plank, un-beaded, Cedarmill, textured siding in Iron Gray. The windows have been replaced with 1/1, Majesty aluminum clad windows. The damaged front door was replaced.

Front Door

Photographic documentation from 1977 and 2014 show a four panel front door with side lights and transom. The current door has the same four panel configuration and the side lights and transoms have been retained.

Windows

Photographic documentation from 1977 and 2014 show that there were 6/6 double-hung wood windows. The windows have been replaced with 1/1, aluminum clad windows. The Standards for Rehabilitation on page 55 of *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* states that original windows, including both functional and decorative elements such as frames, sash, muntins, glazing, sills, hood molds, paneled or decorated jambs and molding, shutters and exterior blinds should be retained. Page 65 of the *Guidelines* further states that the architectural appearance of original windows should be used as a model for new windows. Changes in the sash, depth or reveal, muntin configuration, frame or glazing is strongly discouraged. Staff recommends that the five sash on the front and the two sash on the west elevation (first bay) be replaced with 6/6 simulated divided light sash.

Hardie Plank Siding

The Substitute Materials section of the *Guidelines*, as cited on page 56, restrict the use of fiber cement siding to new freestanding buildings, secondary elevations with limited visibility from the public right-of-way, new additions with limited visibility from the public right-of-way, and new outbuildings. The use of fiber cement siding products as a substitute material for original wood trim and siding on historic buildings is discouraged. Fiber cement siding should reveal a smooth surface, rather than faux "wood grain". The color is compatible with those recommended on page 60 and 61 of the *Guidelines*. Staff recommends that smooth Hardie Plank, be installed on the façade.

Staff recommends partial approval of the project with conditions. The proposed work appears mostly consistent with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*. Staff recommends the approval of the project with the following conditions:

- That the five sash on the front and the two sash on the west elevation (first bay) be replaced with 6/6 simulated divided light sash.
- That smooth Hardie Plank be installed on the façade.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(b) of the City Code and with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.