

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT  
May 24, 2016 Meeting**

19. **CAR No. 16-087** (J. Gross)

**2123 East Marshall Street  
Church Hill North Old and Historic District**

**Project Description:** **Remove vinyl siding and windows and  
install fiber cement siding and wooden windows.**

**Staff Contact:** **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate the exterior of home in the Church Hill North Old and Historic District. The applicant proposes to remove all existing vinyl siding and vinyl windows from the altered frame vernacular Italianate structure. The applicant proposes to install smooth, unbeaded fiber cement siding in a 6 inch reveal and fiber cement corner boards and window trim. The applicant proposes to replace the current 1/1 vinyl windows with 1/1 wood windows to fit the existing window openings. The existing cornice will be maintained and repaired in-kind. The proposed paint scheme is:

- Siding: Sunbeam Yellow (#45 in the Commission's paint palette)
- Trim and Cornice: Rembrandt Ruby (#25 in the Commissions paint palette) and Umber (#54 in the Commission's paint palette)

**Staff recommends approval of the project with a condition.** In general, the proposed rehabilitation meets the Commission's guidelines for rehabilitation found on page 55 of the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* as the applicant is proposing to remove the vinyl windows and siding and replace these elements with a material that better replicates wood. Staff supports the installation of the new windows as they match the previous windows in configuration and are of an appropriate material for the District.

The *Guidelines* note that fiber cement siding is a product with limited applications which include being used on secondary elevations with limited visibility from the public right of way (pg. 56). The applicant has removed all the vinyl siding from the three most visible elevations and has forwarded pictures to staff of the condition beneath the siding. The applicant has not uncovered any historic siding beneath the vinyl siding and has instead uncovered primarily T1-11 plywood. Though the proposed fiber cement siding will be on three highly visible elevations, staff supports its installation as the applicant has shown there is no existing historic siding to restore.

As the *Guidelines* note that the walls and trimwork of Italianate structures should be painted greens, rusts, reds and browns in deep rich tones (pg. 58), staff supports the proposed paint scheme with the rich yellow, red and brown colors. The Guidelines note that individual details in cornices should not be emphasized

in cornices. For this reason, staff recommends that the cornice only be painted one color rather than the proposed two colors.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the above noted condition, is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation in Section 30-930.7(b) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.