

3. COA-066673-2020

PUBLIC HEARING DATE

January 28, 2020

PROPERTY ADDRESS

2800 East Marshall Street

DISTRICT

Church Hill North

APPLICANT

C. Farrar



Commission of Architectural Review

STAFF REPORT

STAFF CONTACT

C. Jeffries

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Replace 11 existing windows with two-over-two, aluminum clad wood windows.

PROJECT DETAILS

- The applicant requests approval to install 11 aluminum-clad wood windows on a two-story brick Queen Anne row house built ca. 1890.
- The windows on the side and rear of the home were replaced by a previous owner over time, resulting in multiple NOVs. The current application is also a result of enforcement action.
- Historic Richmond has an easement on this property.



The City of Richmond assumes no liability either for any errors, omissions, or inaccuracies in the information provided regardless of the cause of such or for any decision made, action taken, or action not taken by the user in reliance upon any maps or information provided herein.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

PARTIAL APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS

PREVIOUS REVIEWS

A previous owner received administrative approval to replace five windows on the sides and rear of the home in October and December 2018. These approvals were consistent with the Commission's approval of the replacement of windows on the sides and rear in 2013 after the windows had been installed. The Commission had initially denied the application in 2009, finding that the replacement windows did not effectively replicate the windows that were removed.

STAFF RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS

- The applicant install replacement windows or modify the existing replacement windows on the façade to match the previous 1/1 light configuration.
- Staff recommends **denial** of the 2/2 light configuration on the façade.

STAFF ANALYSIS

Windows #1, pg. 69	<i>Retain all original windows...</i>	In previous applications for window replacement for this building the owner at the time stated that the existing windows were salvage windows installed by a previous owner in 1988 during a full renovation. Staff has been unable to locate any documentation that substantiates this claim as the Church Hill North City Old and Historic District was established in 2007.
Windows #7, pg. 69	<i>Windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair. Any reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation.</i>	As the majority of the windows were replaced without CAR approval or a building permit, a determination of the condition of the existing windows cannot be made.
Windows #10, pg. 69	<i>The architectural appearance of original windows should be used as a model for new windows. Changes in sash, depth or reveal, muntin configuration, frame or glazing is strongly discouraged.</i>	<p>The previous property owner received administrative approval for the replacement of five windows in 2018: the five remaining wood windows on the sides and rear of the home. It appears that the current owner replaced four of those windows with aluminum clad wood windows with a 2/2 light configuration. Though approval had been granted for the replacement, a condition of approval was that the new windows must match the existing light configuration. The applications for the replacement of these five windows indicates that two on the North 28th Street elevation were 1/1, however the replacement windows are 2/2.</p> <p>In addition, the façade windows which were removed without approval were also 1/1. Photo documentation from both 1934-1956 and 1957-1977 confirm that the façade windows were 1/1 previous to the 1988 renovation. The historic photographs also illustrate 2/2 windows on the attached house to the east and 2/2 windows are the current prevailing pattern on the block. However, there are several inconsistencies between the design of the subject house and the attached houses, which could suggest that the block was developed at different times.</p> <p>The replacement of 1/1 windows with a 2/2 light configuration is not substantiated by physical evidence or photo documentation. As no evidence exists that the seven façade windows and the two west elevation windows were ever 2/2, <u>staff recommends approval of the window replacement but denial of the installation of 2/2 windows on the facade. Staff recommends that applicant install new 1/1 windows on the façade or modify the existing façade windows to match the previous 1/1 light configuration.</u></p>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

FIGURES



Figure 1. Assessor's card, 1934-1956



Figure 2. Assessor's card, 1957-1977



Figure 3. Facade, 2011



Figure 4. Second story windows on east elevation, 2015, courtesy Historic Richmond