

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
October 24, 2017, Meeting**

14. **COA-024487-2017** (Eastern Edge Development) **2108 ½ East Broad Street**
St. John's Church Old and Historic District

Project Description: **Construct a new 3-story single family dwelling.**

Staff Contact: **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests conceptual review and comment for the construction of a new detached single family house on a vacant lot in the St. John's Church Old and Historic District.

The proposed new construction will be located on the north side of East Broad Street on a narrow lot between two historic houses. The two flanking houses are frame, two-story, 2-bay vernacular Italianate-style dwellings with decorative porches, window hoods and cornices. The majority of the houses on this side of the street have shallow gable roofs. In addition to the historic structures, there is a three story multifamily home near the intersection of North 21st Street. The structures across the street include a mix of Italianate and Greek Revival masonry and frame homes that are 2 to 3 stories in height. Due to the slope and street, the grade greatly varies from North 21st to North 22nd Streets.

The applicant is proposing to construct a 3-story, 2-bay home. The home includes a full façade porch with a low sloped hipped roof. The façade includes 2/2 windows with a pair of first story windows and a door with a transom above. The structure will have a front yard setback to align with the adjacent homes and 2'-4" and 1'-2" side yard setback. Per the site plan, the applicant is proposing an inset side porch and a large rear deck.

The applicant is seeking **Conceptual Review** for this project. Conceptual review is covered under Sec. 30-930.6(d) of the City Code: The commission shall review and discuss the proposal with the applicant and make any necessary recommendations. Such Conceptual Review shall be advisory only. Commission staff reviewed the project through the lens of the "Standards for New Construction: Residential" on pages 44 and 45 of the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* utilizing the checklist below.

S=satisfies

D=does not satisfy

NA=not applicable

S **D** **NA**

New infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns in the surrounding district

The front yard setback matches the adjacent properties. The minimal side yard setbacks are consistent with the adjacent structures.

Where the adjoining buildings have different setbacks, the setback for the new building should be based on the historical pattern for the block

The siting is consistent with the adjacent buildings.

New buildings should face the most prominent street bordering the site

The structure addresses East Broad Street

New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the district. Form refers to the combination of massing, size, symmetry, proportions, projections and roof shapes that lend identity to a building.

The project utilizes elements found on structures on the block including a shed roof, full façade porch, and a 2-bay composition. Staff recommends the symmetry of the façade should be maintained on the first story by replacing the paired window with a single window to align with the windows above. The proposed structure is longer than the adjacent buildings though it has a depth similar to the new construction at 2102-2104 East Broad Street.

New construction should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps.

The proposed project incorporates human-scale elements including a front porch, a simple cornice, and front steps.

New construction should respect the typical height of surrounding buildings

The proposed project is taller than the adjacent structures, and the height difference with respect to 2108 East Broad Street is exaggerated due to the change in grade. The structures on the subject block of East Broad Street vary in height as there are several taller homes with English basements on the south side of the street in addition to the two story historic homes and three story new construction on the north side of the street. Staff finds the proposed 3-story building does not overwhelm the adjacent structures as it is a narrow structure. Staff believes that height is consistent with the diversity of heights found on the block.

- New construction should respect the typical width, organization of bays, vertical alignment and symmetry of surrounding buildings.**

The project is narrower than the historic structures on the block due to the lot size constraints. The proposed project façade does maintain the 2-bay configuration, vertical alignment, and the symmetry of the surrounding buildings. Staff recommends the symmetry should be maintained on the first story by replacing the paired window with a single window to align with the windows above.

- The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings should be compatible with patterns established in the district.**

The typical fenestration pattern in the district includes evenly spaced ranked windows. The proposed fenestration is consistent with patterns in the district though staff recommends the symmetry should be maintained on the first story by replacing the paired window with a single window to align with the windows above.

- Porch and cornice heights should be compatible with adjacent buildings**

Due the slope of the street, the porch heights do not align. The proposed porch height from grade appears to be consistent with the adjacent structures. The cornice height is taller than the adjacent buildings but is compatible with the heights of taller buildings on the block.

- Materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district. Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted.**

The applicant has not provided a description of materials. As frame construction dominates the subject block face, staff encourages the applicant to utilize a compatible siding material.

The following items will need to be included for final review (please refer to the Commission's New Construction Checklist and Required Dimensions document for additional details):

1. Fully dimensioned elevations
2. Roof plan
3. List of windows and doors to include size, material, and design
4. Description of all materials (attach specification sheets if necessary)
5. Site plan to include parking, trash, and mechanical equipment locations
6. Dimensioned context elevation
7. Statement of how the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* informed the proposed work.