



**Commission of Architectural Review**

4. COA-132789-2023	<b>Final Review</b> Meeting Date: 7/25/2023	
Applicant/Petitioner	Elizabeth Kincaid	
Project Description	Paint the exterior of a commercial building and install signage.	
Project Location		
Address: 305-307 Brook Road		
Historic District: Broad Street		
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <p>The applicant requests approval to paint the exterior of two existing buildings: 307 Brook Road which is an infill construction ca. 2012 &amp; 305 Brook Road which is a masonry Italianate building ca. 1920</p> <p>A flat wall sign and a projecting wall sign are proposed on the exterior of the two buildings in the same locations as existing signage.</p>		
Staff Recommendation		
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, <a href="mailto:alex.dandridge@rva.gov">alex.dandridge@rva.gov</a> , (804) 646-6569	
Previous Reviews	The Commission reviewed and approval the infill building located at 307 Brook Road in 2012.	
Conditions for Approval	<p>Staff recommends the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>the stone/engineered stone sills on the front façade of 307 Brook Road remain unpainted, or painted a gray color that is lighter than the proposed body color; any color selections submitted to staff for review and approval.</li> <li>For the wall sign: the letters be applied to a wooden or metal sign board that is then secured to the front façade in order limit the number of penetrations into the face of the building.</li> <li>the projecting signage be installed in the exact location of the existing signage as to use the existing holes in the brick and mortar in order to not further damage or disturb historic material.</li> </ul>	

## Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis						
<p><b>Paint, Frame Buildings (Including Stucco), pg. 63</b></p>	<p>1) <i>High quality paint should be used following directions for preparation and application. A paint professional should be consulted before beginning your project.</i></p> <p>2) <i>It is important that color selections blend with and complement the overall color schemes on the street.</i></p> <p>3) <i>Fluorescent and obtrusive colors are not appropriate as these were not traditionally used on local historic structures. (The high Victorian “painted ladies” of San Francisco and other western cities represent a phenomenon never adopted in Richmond.)</i></p>	<p>On the subject block, there are a variety of architectural styles and colors. Most buildings are mixed-use, masonry, Italianate dwellings with decorative cornices and ground floor store fronts. Some of these buildings are unpainted masonry. Those that are painted are neutral colors that closely resemble the color of historic brick or stone.</p> <p>307 Brook Road is an infill construction that was completed in 2013. The building has a simple design. It is clad in stucco and features large vertically aligned windows with cast stone sills, a large storefront, and a staggered front parapet wall that references that of the pedimented front façade parapet wall at 305 Brook Road.</p> <p>307 Brook Road is currently painted a yellow/beige color. The applicant proposes to paint the front faced body and trim SW6006 Black Bean, a color found on the Commission approved color pallet. Staff finds that it is uncommon in the Broad Street City Old and Historic District for entire buildings to be painted such a dark color; however, black is often used on store fronts. Given that this is an infill construction with a more contemporary design, <u>Staff recommends approval of the use SW6006 Black Bean on body of the front façade of 307 Brook Road.</u></p>						
<p><b>Paint pg. 65</b></p>	<table border="0"> <tr> <td>Lintels</td> <td>Natural stone or brick colors, as body colors above.</td> <td>Previously-painted stone only. Match original stone lintel color. Previously-painted brick lintels are to be painted the body brick color.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Headers</td> <td>Natural stone or brick colors, as body</td> <td>Previously-painted stone only. Match original stone color.</td> </tr> </table>	Lintels	Natural stone or brick colors, as body colors above.	Previously-painted stone only. Match original stone lintel color. Previously-painted brick lintels are to be painted the body brick color.	Headers	Natural stone or brick colors, as body	Previously-painted stone only. Match original stone color.	<p>307 Brook Road features cast stone sills on its front façade windows that appear to be somewhat stained, but unpainted. <u>Staff recommends that the cast stone sills on the front façade of 307 Brook Road remain unpainted, or painted a gray color that is lighter than the proposed body color; any color selections submitted to staff for review and approval.</u></p>
Lintels	Natural stone or brick colors, as body colors above.	Previously-painted stone only. Match original stone lintel color. Previously-painted brick lintels are to be painted the body brick color.						
Headers	Natural stone or brick colors, as body	Previously-painted stone only. Match original stone color.						

	<p>colors above.</p> <p>Previously-painted brick lintels are to be painted the body brick color. Unless the lintel is stone, do not pick out the lintel in a contrasting color.</p>	<p>Staff finds that leaving the sills unpainted or as a lighter color is in-keeping with the <i>guidelines</i> and will provide some contrast on the front façade between the body of the building and trim/window articulation.</p>
<p><b>Paint, Historic Masonry, pg. 63</b></p>	<p><i>1) Do not paint historic brick or stone masonry that has not previously been painted. Painting previously unpainted masonry is historically inaccurate and is not permitted. Property owners who wish to remove paint from masonry should work with a qualified contractor knowledgeable in the use of non-abrasive cleaners.</i></p> <p><i>3) Colors associated with the colors of natural brick are strongly encouraged and are preferable to less appropriate colors (white, green, blue, etc.).</i></p>	<p>305 Brook Road is a historic masonry building that has been previously painted. Currently, the building is painted red color that resembles natural red brick. The applicant proposes to paint the brick façade SW2822 Downing Sand and to paint the stone lintels and sills SW077 Classic French Gray. While Downing Sand does not resemble red brick, it is listed as an appropriate color for previously painted masonry. Classic French Gray is an appropriate color for the stone sills and lintels. <u>Staff supports the color scheme proposed for 305 Brook Road.</u></p>
<p><b>Standards for Signage, Flat Wall Signs, pg. 76</b></p>	<p><i>Flat Wall Signs are wooden or metal sign panels applied directly to a building façade when a storefront cornice is not present.</i></p> <p><i>Generally, these signs are intended to be viewed from a moderate distance.</i></p> <p><i>Flat wall signs should be designed to enhance the facade by blending with the architectural features of the building. They should not be merely applied to the surface of the building, nor should they cover or obscure important architectural elements.</i></p>	<p>The applicant is planning to install a metal wall sign on the front façade, second-story of 307 Brook Road. This sign will be located in the same location as the previous signage and appears to be a similar size (See figure 5). Rather than a panel like the existing sign, the new signage will be individually mounted letters that will be non-illuminated.</p> <p>Rather than each letter being mounted individually to the face of the building, <u>Staff recommends that the letters be applied to a wooden or metal sign board that is then secured to the front façade in order limit the number of penetrations into the face of the building.</u> This will limit the amount of material that is disturbed and will enhance the reversibility of the installation.</p> <p>The sign will be painted pink. On page 75 of the guidelines, it states that “Signs should not display colors that clash or conflict with a building”. While pink signage is not generally appropriate for the district as a whole, Staff finds that the pink colored signage doesn’t conflict with the new color scheme proposed for the building.</p>

<p><b>Standards for Signage, Projecting Wall Signs, pg. 76</b></p>	<p><i>Projecting Wall Signs may be made of wood or metal and may be hung from brackets or otherwise mounted on buildings in order to hang perpendicular. These signs are intended to be viewed from a moderate distance and close at hand by pedestrians. Projecting signs should be mounted at least eight (8) feet above the sidewalk, should project from the building façade no more than four (4) feet and should not obscure the storefront display area.</i></p>	<p>The proposed projecting signage that will be located on 305 Brook Road will be a similar design and size and located in the same location as the existing projecting signage. It will be constructed of metal and feature neon letters. Staff finds that the signage meets the <i>Signage Guidelines</i>. While neon signage is uncommon in the Broad Street City Old and Historic District, staff finds its use appropriate in this location as it was previously existing in this location, and the Broad Street National Register Historic District contains buildings from the early 20<sup>th</sup> century when it may have been more likely for one to use such signage.</p> <p>The sign will be painted pink, while the neon letters will be white. On page 75 of the guidelines, it states that “Signs should not display colors that clash or conflict with a building”. While pink signage is not generally appropriate for the district as a whole, Staff finds that the pink colored signage doesn’t conflict with the new color scheme proposed for the building.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the projecting signage be installed in the exact location of the existing signage as to use the existing holes in the brick and mortar in order to not further damage or disturb historic material.</u></p>
--	---	--

*It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.*

## Figures

Figure 1. Existing conditions of 305-307 Brook Rd.



Figure 2. Black painted storefronts along Broad St.



Figure 3. Existing projecting neon sign, 305 Brook



Figure 4. Painted & unpainted masonry on subject block. Brick painted to resemble brick color.



Figure 5. Original wall sign on 307 Brook Rd., *removed*



Figure 6. 2011, subject block prior to the infill construction at 307 Brook Rd.

