

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
May 23, 2017, Meeting**

10. **COA-016782-2017** (Cava Capital, LLC)

**717 North 24th Street
Union Hill Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Rehabilitate attached single family home and construct a rear addition.**

Staff Contact: **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate an attached single family home in the Union Hill Old and Historic District to include the construction of a rear addition. The existing structure is one half of a 2-story, 4-bay, gable-roof, frame double house. The structure has an existing single story addition at the rear.

The applicant proposes to construct a small single story addition and a second story addition. The primary roof of the addition will be a gable which will intersect with the existing gable roof. Additionally, the applicant is proposing a small two story projection with a shed roof to extend past the mass of the addition on the second story. The applicant is proposing first and second floor rear porches. The applicant proposes to clad the new upper story in vertical fiber cement siding and the remainder of the structure will be clad in horizontal lap fiber cement siding. The proposed project will remove one window opening and replace a single window with a double window on the visible side elevation of the existing structure. Due to existing vegetation, the rear of the structure is minimally visible from the public right of way.

On March 28, 2017, the applicant came before the Commission for conceptual review of this project. The Commission expressed concerns regarding the clarity of the plans and a need to have an understanding of the difference between the existing conditions and the proposed rehabilitation and addition. In response to the Commission's concerns, the applicant has provided plans to illustrate the existing conditions. The other change to the plans is the applicant is proposing to clad the 2nd story addition in vertical siding to differentiate this portion of the structure.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. The proposed addition is generally in keeping with the Commission's Guidelines for New Construction found on pages 44-46 of the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*. The *Guidelines* state that additions should be subordinate to their main structure and be as inconspicuous as possible (pg. 44, Siting #1). The applicant has proposed the addition at the rear of the structure. The *Guidelines* note that additions should not destroy original architectural elements (pg. 45, Materials & Colors #1). Though the proposed addition has been designed to maintain the existing gable roof form at the front of the structure, the applicant is proposing to alter two visible window openings on

the side elevation. Staff has concerns with the removal of the opening closest to the façade as this opening is highly visible from North 24th Street and is in the same location as a window opening in the attached house which leads staff to believe it is an original window opening. Though the Guidelines note that changes to existing windows on secondary elevations will be considered by the Commission on a case-by-case basis (pg. 65, #8), staff recommends this front window opening on the side elevation be maintained as it appears to be original to the structure and is highly visible.

The *Guidelines* note that new additions should be differentiated from the old and compatible with the property and the district (pg. 5, #9). The applicant has altered the plans to clad the structure in vertical siding to differentiate the structure. To further differentiate the addition, staff recommends the proposed addition be inset from the historic building walls as to not give the impression that the structure was developed with a two story rear wing.

The Guidelines note that materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the surrounding neighborhood (pg. 45, Materials & Color #2). To achieve this, staff recommends the following conditions:

- The fiber cement siding be smooth, unbeaded, and with a reveal to match the historic reveal.
- The windows be wood or aluminum clad wood windows with true or simulated divided lites to include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar. Specifications of the proposed window be provided to staff for administrative review and approval.
- Railing details be provided to staff for administrative review and approval.
- The deck be painted or stained a neutral color, to be reviewed and approved by staff, that complements one or more of the colors found in the main structure.

It is the assessment of staff that with these conditions, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Sections 30-930.7(b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.