



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

7. COA-109653-2022	Final Review Meeting Date: 4/26/2022
Applicant/Petitioner	Bryan Green, Commonwealth Architects
Project Description	Exterior rehabilitation of an existing multi-family building.
Project Location	
Address: 501 N. Allen Ave.	
Historic District: West Grace Street	
High-Level Details: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The applicant proposes to rehabilitate an existing 6-story, brick building constructed in 1906; added on to in 1915. The building was originally constructed as an apartment building, but was last used as an assisted living facility. Post rehabilitation, the building is intended for hotel use. The building will be rehabilitated using state and federal rehabilitation tax credits; review has not yet been completed. A Special Use Permit is also in process for this building. The applicant proposes to replace non-original, 1/1, double hung windows in-kind, remove and install new canopies, install new signage, and to alter 2 masonry openings on the rear façade. 	
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov , (804) 646-6569
Previous Reviews	None.
Conditions for Approval	Staff recommends the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> final sign specifications, including design and colors, be submitted for administrative review and approval, and that all sign hardware be installed in a way that does not damage existing historic material, and that the applicant adhere to any additional sign regulations required by the

	<p>SUP.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> the canopies be installed in a way that does not damage existing historic material, final design and color submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. final window schedule be submitted for administrative review and approval. any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR Part II approval be submitted to CAR staff for administrative review and approval.
--	---

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Pg. 4	<p>5. <i>Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.</i></p> <p>6. <i>Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. When the severity of deterioration requires replacement or a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.</i></p>	<p>All cast iron balconies, exterior brick and mortar, stone lintels and sills, quoins, will be preserved. Any components of these elements that have been replaced with incompatible materials pre-district, or are found to be deteriorated beyond repair will be replaced to match the original in material and design.</p> <p>All existing entrances and exterior doors will be retained and repaired.</p> <p>The metal cornice will be retained, and repaired in-kind if necessary. The existing roof will be retained and repaired.</p>
Standards for signage, pg. 73-74	<p><i>Banner Signs can provide welcome color accents to a retail district. They should only be used on a temporary basis, and their design and placement should be carefully reviewed. Individual banner signs are:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>limited to one per storefront;</i> <i>considered to be part of an individual business' maximum allowable signage, and;</i> <i>cannot exceed eight (8) square feet in size</i> 	<p>Various banner, flag, canopy, and plaque signs are being proposed on the exterior of the building at the first and sixth floors. The proposed signage will be placed at the corners, roofline, and entrances and will not obstruct character defining features of the building. The signage will be made of metal and canvas which are materials compatible with the district. The canopies appear to respect the width of the entrances and do not obscure any significant architectural elements. <u>Staff recommends that final sign specifications, including design and colors, be submitted for administrative review and approval, and that all sign hardware be installed in a way that does not damage existing historic material, and that the applicant adhere to any additional sign regulations required by the SUP.</u></p>

<p>Building Elements, Awnings, Design & Placement,</p>	<p>1. <i>Awnings should be placed carefully so that building elements or existing materials are not damaged or obscured.</i></p> <p>2. <i>The size and placement of awnings should not interfere with existing signs, distinctive architectural features of the building or with street trees or other elements along the street.</i></p>	<p>There are two awnings being proposed; one at on the western, front elevation and another at the eastern rear elevation. The canopies will replace existing ones, and will be constructed of metal supports and canvas sheeting.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the canopies be installed in a way that does not damage existing historic material, final design and color submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.</u></p>
<p>Site Improvements, Landscaping, pg. 76</p>	<p>8. <i>Appropriate landscaping should buffer the visual severity of surface parking lots from view. Vacant lots, large expanses of blank wall and other unattractive streetscape features (i.e. utilities, rear yard trash depots, etc.) can also be screened effectively with appropriate landscaping.</i></p>	<p>New landscaping will be planted around the building, as well as around the trash enclosure and rear parking lot.</p>
<p>Building Elements, Windows,</p>	<p>5. <i>Original masonry openings for doors and windows should be maintained. Infilling original masonry openings is strongly discouraged</i></p> <p>7. <i>Windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair. Any reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation.</i></p> <p>8. <i>The number, location, size or glazing pattern of windows should not be changed by cutting new openings, blocking out windows or by installing replacement sash that do not fit the original window. Changes to existing windows or the addition of new windows along a secondary elevation will be considered by the Commission on a case-by-case basis</i></p> <p>9. <i>The architectural character of windows should not be altered by inappropriate materials or finishes that radically change the sash, depth of reveal, muntin configuration, the reflective quality or color of the glazing or the appearance of the frame</i></p> <p>10. <i>The architectural appearance of original windows should be used as a model for new windows. Changes in the sash, depth or reveal, muntin</i></p>	<p>The existing 1/1 wood windows are not original to the building, being installed during the 1998-2002 rehabilitation of the building. The existing windows are poor quality and in need of replacement.</p> <p>The applicant proposes to replace the double-glazed window sash with new high-quality sash, to match the existing window sash, which were presumably designed to match the original windows that were replaced. The existing window frames will be retained, repaired in kind as necessary, scraped, and painted as necessary. The new window sash will be wood-framed (or aluminum-clad wood), with double-glazed low-E clear glass, to match the existing.</p> <p>The existing, fixed stained glass windows (in bay windows on the west elevation) will be retained. Where necessary, any gaps around the frames will be infilled (without removing the glass).</p> <p>On the south elevation, the stamped-metal cladding on the bay windows will be retained, replaced in-kind as necessary; all rust will be removed, they will be painted with a rust-inhibiting primer, and painted with a rust-inhibiting paint as necessary to match existing.</p> <p>5th and 6th floor masonry window openings on the east faced will be enlarged to become</p>

	<i>configuration, frame or glazing is strongly discouraged. New glass should not be tinted or receive reflective coatings</i>	doors. Staff recommends approval of the alteration of these masonry openings, and believes that the alteration will be minimally visible given its location behind the existing stair tower, and located at the upper stories of the building. <u>Staff recommends that final window schedule be submitted for administrative review and approval.</u>
Administrative Approval Guidelines - Light Fixtures	<i>B. Items not delegated for Commission Secretary Review 1. Up lighting or down lighting of architectural features. 2. The installation of lighting on a post in front of a building. 3. Lighting that is a part of a signage installation.</i>	The existing non-historic coach lights flanking the west (primary) entrance will be removed. They will be replaced by custom-designed, historically-compatible coach lights that are more appropriate to the scale and character of the building. Up lighting will be installed on the north elevation. The lighting will be minimal. Staff finds that the lighting being proposed is compatible with the building.
Paint, Historic Masonry, pg.63	<i>1) Do not paint historic brick or stone masonry that has not previously been painted. Painting previously unpainted masonry is historically inaccurate and is not permitted. Property owners who wish to remove paint from masonry should work with a qualified contractor knowledgeable in the use of non-abrasive cleaners.</i>	All existing brick walls will be preserved in place. The painted block at the base will be repainted. The unpainted brick and terra cotta quoins and keystones will remain unpainted, and will be repointed as necessary to match the existing mortar color and joint profile. Paint selections: Masonry base to match the existing color, white. Rear stairs to be painted black and the metal panels Sherwin Williams SW0046 White Hyacinth Iron balconies to be painted black to match existing.
Mechanical Equipment, HVAC Equipment, pg. 68	<i>2. Rooftop units should be located so that they are minimally visible from the public right-of-way, and screening should be considered.</i>	The existing mechanical units will be removed. New mechanical equipment will be located on the existing steel dunnage located at the center of the roof. The steel framework will be expanded slightly; though the new units will be lower than the existing rooftop units. The new units will not be visible from the district. There will be less equipment on roof than at present, and the new equipment will be lower than the current equipment. Staff believes that the new mechanical will not be visible from the public right-of-way due to the height of the building.

Figures



Figure 1. West, Primary Elevation



Figure 2. Primary entrance and existing canopy.



Figure 3. View from Allen and W. Grace



Figure 4. North, secondary entrance



Figure 5. South elevation



Figure 6. Rear, east elevation. Non-original stair towers, addition, and existing canopy.

