

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
January 24, 2017 Meeting**

12. **CAR No. 177-010** (Blane, LLC)

**508 W. Marshall Street
Jackson Ward Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Construct a new single family dwelling**

Staff Contact: **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests approval to construct a new single family dwelling on a vacant lot in the Jackson Ward Old and Historic District. The applicant came before the Commission on June 28, 2016, for the conceptual review of the construction of a two-story, three-bay, frame, Italianate-style dwelling with a full façade front porch and bracketed cornice. The Commission had the following concerns regarding the proposal:

- The proposed Italianate design is not appropriate for the location. The Commission encouraged the applicant to not mimic the historic architecture and to incorporate modern detailing while maintaining the massing of the historic structures. The Commission suggested a more blocky profile like the Greek Revival structures on the street.
- The foundation should be raised to align with the adjacent structures. The Commission had concerns with the proposed home being lower than the two adjacent structures which have English basements.

The applicant has modified the plans to respond to the Commission's concerns as follows:

- The applicant has replaced the full façade porch with a single bay Greek Revival-style entry porch. Though the plans show round columns, it is noted that the proposed columns are turned columns.
- The applicant is proposing a simple sloped "stylized" frieze rather than the previously proposed cornice with corbels.
- The home will be set on a 5'-3" parged CMU foundation. The proposed porch floor will align with the porch floor at the adjacent home (510 West Marshall). The home is proposed to be 29' in height which is 4'-5" taller than the home which was conceptually reviewed.
- The first floor windows on the façade are proposed to include unequal 1/1 sashes with a multi-lite transom above.

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted with the noted conditions. Staff believes the proposed new construction is consistent with the Commission's *Guidelines*. Staff found that the proposed new construction is largely compatible with the historic features that characterizes its setting and context. The setting and context is a mixture of brick and frame, two-story, three-

bay, Italianate and Greek Revival dwellings. Some of the houses are set near grade and others have raised basements which lends an interesting vertical rhythm to the block faces. The applicant has responded to the Commission's concerns by revising the design of the structure to accentuate its blocky massing and not replicate the Italianate design of the neighboring structures. The applicant has also increased the height of the structure to be more compatible with that of adjacent structures.

Staff recommends the Commission's approval be conditioned on the follow:

- The fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded.
- The Guidelines note that materials used in new residential construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district (pg. 45, Materials & Colors #2). As the raised foundations in the District are predominantly brick, staff recommends the proposed foundation be clad in brick rather than the proposed parged CMU.
- The porch columns be the round columns as illustrated not the turned columns as noted.
- Dimensioned details of the proposed frieze, soffit, and fascia be provided to staff for administrative review and approval.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the noted conditions, is consistent with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Section 30.930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of code.