



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

4. COA-156672-2024	Final Review	Meeting Date: 11/26/2024
Applicant/Petitioner	Patrick W. McClane, AIA	
Project Description	Demolish a non-original valet parking booth.	
Project Location		
Address: 13 West Franklin Street, Second Baptist Church		
Historic District: West Franklin Street		
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <p>The applicant proposes to demolish a non-original valet parking booth at the rear of Second Baptist Church.</p> <p>The valet parking booth is a small masonry building with light colored brick and a hipped roof with faux slate. According to the CAR records, the building was constructed around 1993.</p> <p>Brick piers and metal fencing will be installed to the north (left side) of the demolished valet building to match the existing fencing.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov, (804) 646-6569	
Previous Reviews	In October 2024, Staff administratively approved exterior work to the primary building in accordance with the approved Part II Tax Credit approval, as the work was in-keeping with the Commissions' adopted Administrative Approval guidelines for Historic Tax Credit projects, and the work does not constitute a Substantial Impact as outline in the city ordinance.	
Staff Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff recommends approval of the proposed demolition for the following reasons: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff finds that the valet parking building does not contribute to the historic character of the West Franklin Street Old and Historic District. Based information provided by the applicant and the CAR files, the building is not original to the site and is not "historic". Demolition of the building will not have a negative and irreversible impact to the streetscape or district. 	

Staff Analysis

Guideline/Code Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Standards for Demolition, Pg. 82	<p><i>Under the provisions of Sec. 32-930.7., the Commission shall approve requests for demolition when:</i></p> <p><i>1) There are no feasible alternatives to the proposed demolition. "Feasible alternatives" include an appropriate new use and rehabilitation, relocation of the structure to a compatible site or re-sale of the property to an individual committed to suitable rehabilitation or relocation.</i></p> <p><i>2) A building or structure is deemed not to be a contributing part of the historic character of an Old and Historic District.</i></p> <p><i>(3) The Commission deems that a building or structure has deteriorated beyond the point of feasible rehabilitation. A determination that a building or structure no longer presents an opportunity for feasible rehabilitation is arrived at only after an on-site visit by Commission members and a thorough structural analysis has been undertaken by a licensed structural engineer experienced in historic preservation work..</i></p>	<p>The existing valet building is located at the rear of the former Second Baptist Church on West Franklin Street. The building was constructed in the 1990s as an auxiliary building for the parking lot behind Second Baptist Church. While constructed with modern materials, the brick color and roofing material were selected to be compatible to the primary building on the site. While its design and materials are like the historic Second Baptist church, this building is not historic or original to the site, being less than 50 years of age, and noncontributing to the historic district.</p> <p>The demolition of this non-original building will not have a detrimental impact on the integrity of Second Baptist Church, the Jefferson Hotel, or the context of the West Franklin Street City Old and Historic District.</p> <p>In addition to the demolition, new brick piers and metal fencing with a pedestrian gate in between will be installed on the north side (left side) the existing drive into the parking lot where the valet building currently stands. The brick piers and metal fencing will match the existing fencing that surrounds the entire site.</p> <p>This project is being performed in conjunction with the rehabilitation of the former Second Baptist Church building which is being completed using historic tax credits and has received Part II Approval. The rehabilitation will include in-kind repair and replacement of architectural features on the exterior of the building, as well as alterations including the addition of a new accessible entrance. This work was administratively approved by CAR Staff.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends approval of the demolition of the non-original valet parking building.</u></p>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures

Figure 1. North Elevation of Valet Building.



Figure 2. West Elevation of Valet Building.



Figure 3. South Elevation of Valet Building.



Figure 4. Existing fence. Brick piers and metal fencing. To be replication adjacent to demolished Valet Building.

