

City of Richmond

*City Hall
900 East Broad Street*



Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, April 25, 2023

3:30 PM

To access this meeting via Microsoft Teams, please use the following link: <https://tinyurl.com/2p8jfp4h>
5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Commission of Architectural Review

[PDRPRES](#) Public Participation and Instructions - Commission of Architectural Review
[2023.021](#)

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW.pdf](#)

Call to Order

This meeting was called to order at 3:30pm.

Alex Dandridge read the announcement for virtual public meetings.

Commission members are present in City Hall.

Staff present: Planner Alex Dandridge, Planner Samantha Lewis, Preservation Planner Annie Delaroderie, Planner Jackie Stephens, Senior Preservation Planner Kimberly Chen

Roll Call

Present -- 8 - * Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, * Commissioner Andrew Moore, * Commissioner Sean Wheeler, * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, * Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and * Commissioner Mitch Danese

Absent -- 1 - * Commissioner John Grier

OTHER BUSINESS

Approval of Minutes

March 2023

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve the March 2023 meeting minutes.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Excused -- 2 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez and Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Recused -- 2 - Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Kathleen Morgan

Administrative Approval Report

No comments.

Secretary's Report

Secretary Dandridge introduced new staff member, Planner Annie Delaroderie, to the Commission.

Richmond will be hosting the Department of Historic Resources (DHR) CLG training workshop on July 19th from 9am-4pm. It's a full day event that DHR hosts, and they

choose 3 cities each year. The public and CLG staff are invited. The event is being hosted at Parish Hall St. John's church and is capped to around 50 people.

Staff have developed an outreach plan for 2023. There is a CAR one-page flyer on the website which will be distributed in the field to City old & Historic Districts. It's also being included on property transfer letters. Those letters have also been changed to a yellow color, so they are more likely to be noticed and opened. In early summer an annual postcard will be sent out to all property owners. Staff are hoping to align that with advertised information sessions about CAR and its function.

Elections for Commission Chair and Vice Chair are coming up in June. Both of those positions have terms of one year with 2 consecutive terms allowed. Commissioner Neville Johnson's last meeting will be July 2023.

The April Quarterly meeting was canceled because many people couldn't make it. Dandridge discussed potential ideas for walking tours with Commissioners.

Enforcement Report

Dandridge updated the Commission on various violations. The cladding is being removed without approval at the Belgian building at Lombardy and Brook Streets. Staff communication has stopped with the property owners at 1830 W Grace Street for an ongoing active violation. Front porches at 2513 and 2515 E Franklin Street have been removed and reconstructed improperly while the nearby 2511 E Franklin Street has received new decking boards and posts. A painting violation at 2300 W Grace Street was taken care of after Staff had the owners apply for a COA. There are new triple hung vinyl windows in a very small opening on an Italianate row house at 121 W Clay Street. Staff have contacted the owners. Similarly, the installation of vinyl windows at 509 N 21st Street has led to Staff working on a resolution with the property owners.

CONSENT AGENDA

Rodriguez arrived at 3:56pm.

The consent portion of the meeting began at 4:00pm.

Mr. Dandridge re-read the announcement for virtual public meetings.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the Commissioners wished to move any items from the regular agenda to the consent agenda or vice versa.

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Pearson, to move 3909 Hermitage Road to the consent agenda.

The applicant is not comfortable with staff conditions.

Johnson withdrew his motion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Pearson, seconded by Commissioner Morgan, to move 1642 W Grace Street to the consent agenda without any staff conditions.

Dandridge said if Commissioners wish to change staff conditions, then the case should remain on the regular agenda and not be moved to the consent agenda.

Kimberly Chen said the consent agenda consists of cases that are approved based on

the staff report or as submitted.

Pearson withdrew his motion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Pearson, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to move 3601 E Marshall Street to the consent agenda with the added condition that the addition be inset slightly from the alley-facing elevation.

Wheeler wants to add a condition that the addition be differentiated from the main structure.

Brewer asked if projects that have been denied by staff can be added to consent agenda.

Dandridge said historically they've done it different ways, but he believes that if staff recommend something and the Commission doesn't want to change anything, the case is eligible for the consent agenda. If there is extensive Commission discussion, then it should be discussed at regular.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Wheeler, Danese, Brewer, Morgan, Moore, Pearson, Johnson, Rodriguez
Excused – 1 – Grier

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, to move 2915 Monument Avenue to the consent agenda.

The applicant is comfortable with staff conditions.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – 8 – Wheeler, Danese, Brewer, Morgan, Moore, Pearson, Johnson, Rodriguez
Excused – 1 – Grier

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve the consent agenda as amended.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

1. [COA-128340-2023](#) 14 S. 14th Street - Install wireless facilities on an existing building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was approved as submitted.

4. [COA-126429-2023](#) 3601 E. Marshall Street - Construct a one-story rear addition.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was approved with conditions.

9. [COA-128330-2023](#) 2915 Monument Avenue - Enlarge an existing rear garage and construct a rear brick wall.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was approved with conditions

REGULAR AGENDA

The regular portion of the meeting began at 4:21pm.

2. [COA-128339-2023](#) 1642 W. Grace Street - Paint exterior of a previously painted masonry building dark blue.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Annie Delaroderie presented this application.

The applicant, Adrienne Richie, was unaware of the CAR violation until it was taped to the door. There are other blue homes on the same street including dark purples. The paint was chosen to be more cohesive with other historic homes painted similar colors. The color enhanced the brick and made the house look much better.

Commissioner Johnson asked if Richie was aware that the house was in a historic district.

Richie said they knew they were in a historic district with a plaque but were unaware there were paint regulations.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked if there was any repointing.

Richie said no. There was previously a fire that altered the appearance of the façade and looked off. The paint helped rectify this.

Commission Chair Wheeler recalls approving blue colors on a case-by-case basis. There was recently a case approved like this in Church Hill.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Pearson, to approve the application as submitted.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

3. [COA-128332-2023](#) 3909 Hermitage Road - Construct a front yard asphalt driveway.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Samantha Lewis presented this application.

Commissioner Morgan asked if the Commission could request what can be done with the asphalt.

Lewis said the staff recommendation is to deny. If Commission approves, the applicant will have to tear up the asphalt.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked about the legality of driving over the sidewalk.

Lewis said there have been discussions with DPU and Zoning about these concerns.

Dandridge said it is a CAR and Zoning violation. The options are to reverse the work or follow the proper procedures to see if the work can be approved. If this case became an SUP, Planning Commission would be seeking out appropriateness as deemed by the Commission while DPW would comment on the feasibility of installing a curb cut in this location that is adjacent to a bike lane and on top of utilities. It will need many approvals.

The applicant, Kimberly Graziano, wanted a driveway in her front yard because the whole block has multiple asphalt driveways. The brand-new house across the street has a front-yard driveway. It's unsafe to walk through the parking in her alley and she would like to park in front of her home. She was unaware that there were historic regulations against this type of work.

Dandridge said 4002 Hermitage Road is one of the oldest homes in the area and had a driveway that predates CAR. It also runs along the side of the home along the secondary elevation rather than the front.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, to deny with staff recommendations.

Moore asked whether there were no zoning issues, if there would be anything in the guidelines that would forbid the driveway from being built by its own merit.

Dandridge said yes. Additionally, the district's national register form notes the significance of the front yards in this district.

Commissioner Danese said it doesn't have all the necessary things to make a driveway. There is no curb cut for the driveway.

Johnson said you can see curb cuts at the other homes that have driveways. The blue

house across the street was at one point a commercial office space and their curb cut was likely used for parking.

Moore said he's sympathetic to the applicant's concerns. The house and driveway next door are very similar to hers.

Wheeler said the asphalt is the hard stop on this project.

Morgan agrees with Moore. This neighborhood has concrete and asphalt driveways that land differently in yards. She thinks CAR would have crafted an approval if it came to the Commission before the work was done. Asphalt may not have been approved but they would have worked with the applicant on different materials.

Wheeler said the guidelines discourage front yard hardscaping.

Johnson said the Commission could defer the case.

Commissioner Brewer thinks that asphalt isn't an acceptable material. Perhaps a deferral would give the applicant the opportunity to convince the Commission it's compatible or whether another material would work better.

Morgan is more concerned with the width of the driveway. She questions if the Commission would be okay with adding a different color sealant on top of the asphalt.

Moore withdrew his motion.

Rodriguez said that staff has pointed out why the driveway is wrong in terms of the position, curb cut, and materials along with the historic nature of the neighborhood.

Morgan pointed out that proper curb cuts are coordinated outside of CAR.

Brewer agrees that there should be a curb cut but the Commission only has purview to look at hardscaping.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to defer the application to allow the applicant time to determine an appropriate solution.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

- 5. COA-128465- 2210 E Marshall Street - WITHDRAWN by applicant
2023**

Attachments: Application & Plans

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was withdrawn.

- 6. [COA-128343-2023](#) 907 N. 24th Street - Construct a two-story single-family dwelling on a vacant lot.**

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Alex Dandridge presented this application.

Staff received one letter of opposition.

Commissioner Chair Wheeler pointed out that the site plan still indicates that the building will be 3 stories which should be clarified.

The applicant, Will Gillette from Baker Development Resources, noted that they were unaware of any letters of opposition. The 3-story design in conceptual review was altered to 2 stories based on Commission feedback. The material will be cementitious lap siding. The new design is 150 sq ft less than the previous design but it makes it up in the rear.

Commissioner Brewer asked how it relates to the neighboring buildings if it's 18 feet longer.

Gillette imagines that it won't be very visible from the public right-of-way.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment.

Heather Phibbs, a resident at 905 N 24th Street, spoke in opposition. She has concerns about the HVAC units on the side which will be up against her home. She is asking if the applicant has considered the provision of a privacy wall between the HVAC units and her lot.

Commissioner Danese doesn't know why the applicants can't move the HVAC units closer to the rear.

Commissioner Morgan said she can't make a decision on the height given the lack of information. She is concerned with the overall height. There is over 6 feet of height in the attic. With the smaller heights of the lower levels, it might look a bit strange.

Vice Chair Moore said the cornice line appears to be lower than the cornice line of the neighboring green house.

A motion was made by Commissioner Pearson, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: a site map with labeled setbacks be submitted for administrative review and approval, and that the building's setback generally align with the two neighboring buildings to the north and the south; and a dimensioned context drawing be submitted for administrative review that labels the height of the proposed building and the neighboring buildings; and final window specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval; and final materials selections be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval including the dimensions and color of the proposed faux slate; and any new retaining wall, steps, or curbing on the site associated with the new construction be labeled on a final site plan and that the material be compatible with the district as listed in the Guidelines; and revised drawings to be administratively approved by staff and to be shown to the Commission of Architectural Review.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

7. [COA-128341-2023](#) 1801, 1805-1809 E. Broad Street - Construct a new five story multi-family building and rehabilitate existing buildings.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)
[1801, 1805-1809 Additional Materials](#)

Brewer left at 5:21pm.

Alex Dandridge presented this application.

Applicants Dave Johannas and Anne Durkin shared a presentation that provided context on the underlying zoning regulations of the subject area as well as recent and projected development trends that support the building of 5-story structures. They wanted the building to stand out from the former bathhouse and smokestack that's adjacent. They provided material samples such as corrugated metal for Commissioners to view. The colors are designed to be neutral with warm rather than harsh, cool tones. Their goal is to go to the Board of Zoning Appeals because they don't have the fenestration required. The applicants' clients are committed to 5 stories, not 4.

Commissioner Johnson asked how much taller that building will be than the smokestack.

Johannas said it's probably around 7 feet higher.

Commissioner Morgan asked what the applicants will be using for drainage.

Johannas said all the drainage is internal. There will also be a solar field and mechanical that is hidden by parapets on the rooftop.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Johnson thinks the applicants have done a lot of work in minimizing the 5th floor. The building stands out from the adjacent residential structures, but they still need to clarify which materials will actually be used.

Vice Chair Moore thinks the drawings are very helpful and clarifying. He still has concerns that the stair tower is obtrusive on the Broad Street side. There is not enough acknowledgement of the two-story precedent. There should be something architectural that divides story two from story three which was previously mentioned in conceptual review.

Wheeler agrees with staff comments about the small windows on the Broad Street side. There could be some articulation.

Pearson is not bothered by the height. The applicants have established a precedent for the height, and it is compatible with the area. Reducing the height would disservice the project.

Morgan thinks the corrugated paneling on 18th street may be more appropriate. She is advocating for a finish that is not reflective.

Dandridge said anything material-wise can be approved administratively by staff.

Morgan asked what material is being used for the balconies.

Durkin said it'll be metal. There will probably be cable rails.

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Pearson, to approve the application as submitted.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

No -- 3 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Andrew Moore and Commissioner Sean Wheeler

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

8. [COA-128344-2023](#) 207 W. Franklin Street - Construct a new rear addition and accessory dwelling unit.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[207 W Franklin_Carriage House Dimensions.pdf](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Alex Dandridge presented this application.

The applicant, Dave Johannas, doesn't think the dormer will be very visible from the public right-of-way.

Vice Chair Moore thinks the former height is indeed a noticeable feature, so he supports staff comments. It looks like an ill-conceived detail.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Johnson to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: final material selections for the additions and carriage house be submitted for administrative review and approval; and plans be revised so that the peak of the western-most dormer window on the carriage house and the peak of the main roof align, revised plans be submitted for administrative approval; and any subsequent revisions required by the Virginia Department of Historic Resources to be administratively reviewed and approved by Staff.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

10. [COA-128334-2023](#) 2315 Monument Avenue - Various exterior alterations including a side addition and a second-story trellis.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Samantha Lewis presented this application.

Wheeler asked about the trellis work above the garage. It appears to stop abruptly and then return on the other side of the garage. It looks awkward freestanding instead of wrapping around the corner.

The applicant, Matson Roberts, said the project is attempting to bring some contemporary features to the home. They believe the latticework was always there and they would like to reconstruct them. In the plans, they have the latticework go across all the way but in the renderings it's not shown. Shutters will be returned to the home; they have been sitting in the basement and will be restored. Windows and doors have not been selected yet, but they may go with steel windows and doors. They are happy to submit them for staff review. The wood fence in the rear will be replaced with a stucco wall. They never heard from the Fan District Association but met with other neighbors who had positive feedback.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked if there were pillars where the latticework would stop.

Roberts said yes, they would have to rebuild those pillars.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked the applicant to speak to the staff condition of simplifying the parapet.

Roberts will work with staff on toning the parapet down, so it doesn't appear as a full roman arch.

Commission Chair Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

Rodriguez thinks the parapet is a good design. She has concerns about the transparency of the western front trellis gate. The pattern feels broken and your eye gets drawn away from the existing gate.

Vice Chair Moore said the trellis gate being transparent isn't necessarily a bad thing.

Rodriguez thinks the trellis is too busy and changes the character of the front. It should be secondary.

Wheeler thinks maybe if it's a different color, that can differentiate it enough.

Commissioner Morgan concurs.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Morgan, to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: a paint color for the latticework to be installed be submitted for administrative review and approval; and any new windows or doors on the main dwelling other than that approved in this application be submitted for administrative approval; and the western front trellis and gate have a consistent design that matches the side panels of trellis as proposed, and that

the western front trellis be painted a color such as dark green in order to further subordinate the trellis from the primary building, final color submitted for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Kathleen Morgan, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson and Commissioner Mitch Danese

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

None.

Adjournment

This meeting was adjourned at 7:00pm.