

City of Richmond

*City Hall
900 East Broad Street*



Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, December 19, 2023

3:30 PM

Virtual Meeting Link: <https://tinyurl.com/3cxx8j4t>

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Commission of Architectural Review

[PDRPRES
2023.086](#)

Public Access and Participation Instructions - Commission of
Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW.pdf](#)

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:30p.m.

Roll Call

Present -- 6 - * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, * Commissioner Andrew Moore, *
Commissioner Sean Wheeler, * Commissioner John Grier, * Commissioner
Mitch Danese and * Commissioner Larry Nutt

Absent -- 3 - * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and *
Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

Approval of Minutes

September 2023

Secretary Dandridge asked for an approval of the September Meeting Minutes. The
Commission approved the September Meeting Minutes.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by
Commissioner Nutt, to approve the September 2023 Meeting Minutes.**

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore,
Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner Larry Nutt

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner John Grier

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

October 2023

The October 2023 Minutes were not reviewed.

November 2023

The November 2023 Minutes were not reviewed.

Secretary's Report

Administrative Approval Report

Enforcement Report

UDC 2023 review - Commissioner Danese

Commissioner Danese presented the Urban Design Committee 2023 Review.

CONSENT AGENDA

When the Agenda was published, Staff had not put any items on the Consent.

Commissioner Moore made a motion to move Agenda Item # 4: 2219 M Street to the Consent Agenda. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion was approved with the following votes:

Yes: (6) Danese, Grier, (M) Moore, Nutt, (S) Rodriguez, Wheeler
No: (0)
Excused: (0)
Absent: (3) Brewer, Morgan, Pearson

Commissioner Rodriguez made a motion to move Agenda Item # 5: 1921 Princess Anne Avenue to the Consent Agenda. Commissioner Moore seconded the motion. The motion was approved with the following votes:

Yes: (6) Danese, Grier, (S) Moore, Nutt, (M) Rodriguez, Wheeler
No: (0)
Excused: (0)
Absent: (3) Brewer, Morgan, Pearson

Commissioner Moore made a motion to move Agenda Item # 6: 2710 East Clay Street to the Consent Agenda. Commissioner Nutt seconded the motion. The motion was approved with the following votes:

Yes: (6) Danese, Grier, (M) Moore, (S) Nutt, Rodriguez, Wheeler
No: (0)
Excused: (0)
Absent: (3) Brewer, Morgan, Pearson

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Larry Nutt

4. [COA-139549-2023](#) 2219 M Street - Replace non-original wood fiber/ pressboard siding and damaged wood siding on visible elevations.

Attachments: [Application & Plans.pdf](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

If there isn't enough lap siding to salvage from the left side of the dwelling, wood siding with the same reveal and profile as the historic be installed on the façade; and final exterior materials and colors be submitted for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Larry Nutt

5. [COA-139559-2023](#) 1921 Princess Anne Avenue (Jefferson Park) - Install a mural on a masonry building in Jefferson Park

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the application as submitted for the reasons stated in the staff report.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Larry Nutt

6. [COA-139665-2023](#) 2710 East Clay Street - Construct a new one story garden shed in a rear yard.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the application as submitted for the reasons stated in the staff report.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Larry Nutt

REGULAR AGENDA

1. [COA-139552-2023](#) 2417-2421 Carrington Street - Construct six new single family attached dwellings, configured as three pairs.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant proposed to construct six new single family attached dwellings, configured as three pairs.

Commissioner Wheeler asked about separating the addresses comments.

Secretary Dandridge said he will take specific comments with one vote.

Mr. Gillette, the applicant, said, the conditions of 2417 Carrington Street were from the previous owner. The current owner bought the house in 2023. Each of the new houses will be 'for sale, 'not rented units.' The two houses on the alley will be 'Affordable at

60-70% AMI.”

Commissioner Moore asked about 2417 and 2419 mirroring each other and having the same roof styles.

Commissioner Rodriguez questioned the use of a metal railing on one of the units.

Ms. Lambert of Union Hill, said the plans keep the neighborhood character.

Commissioner Moore made a motion to approve the project with Staff Conditions. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion.

Commissioner Moore asked again about the alignment of the stoops and porches. He asked for an additional two feet for the stoops. He thinks the porch is too shallow. The porch is 5' from the wall to the pillar.

Commissioner Wheeler said windows should be aligned vertically where applicable. He said the porches on 24127-2419 should be more prominent.

Commissioner Grier thinks the porch on 2419 could have bad water run-off.

Commissioner Rodriguez thinks the house design is traditional while black metal railings stick out.

Secretary Dandridge read the new motion: Approve the proposed project with Staff Conditions, also vertically align all windows, on each of the units where applicable. All commissioners approved the project.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

Final exterior colors be submitted for administrative review and approval; decking boards on all front porches be installed perpendicular to the face of the building and be wood or a synthetic material that matches the width and profile of decking boards found in Union Hill; the garage doors on 2417.5-2419.5 not feature any faux hardware; round downspouts and square or half round gutters be used on the dwellings. Final gutter and downspout specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval; fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded; all final material specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval; HVAC equipment at the rear of the proposed dwellings and screened from the public right-of-way; any new retaining wall and inset steps be a material that that is commonly found in the district such as concrete or parged masonry. Final material, extent, and dimensions of the wall submitted to staff for review and approval prior to construction; Any new privacy fencing be submitted for administrative review and approval; and windows on each unit must be vertically aligned where applicable.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Larry Nutt

- [2. COA-139775-2023](#) 411 Brook Road - Install a new transom window opening on a previously altered storefront.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant proposed to install a new transom window opening on a previously altered storefront.

Commissioner Rodriguez recommended a transom window with removable street numbers.

The Commissioners discussed compatible options for this opening.

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Nutt, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

The new transom window have a single-pane, clear glass, and may include a painted address number if the applicant chooses.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Larry Nutt

3. [COA-139779-2023](#) 2206 East Marshall Street - Replace an embossed tin roof with HardiShake shingles.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant proposes to replace an original embossed tin, mansard roof with HardiShake, a composite material. The replacement is the result of an emergency repair, due to water infiltration that was causing interior and exterior deterioration to the building. The house is apart of a grouping of 1880s Queen Anne dwellings. The houses have original tin roofs with anchor designs.

Commissioner Wheeler said tin roofs are no longer made. He said, the replacement roof should be embossed metal.

Commissioner Grier asked how much of the roof was damaged?

Mr. Friend, the owner, said the whole roof was damaged and caused damage to the siding.

Commissioner Wheeler said HardiShake can be a maintenance headache. He said HardiShake is porous and absorbs water.

The commissioners discussed potential temporary materials for the roof.

Commissioner Grier mentioned the possibility of working with the neighboring property.

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Danese to deny the application for the reasons stated in the staff report.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Larry Nutt

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

7. [COA-139550-2023](#) 2316-2318 Burton Street - Construct two single family attached dwellings.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant proposes to construct two attached dwellings on two vacant lots. The dwellings will be attached on the west elevation of an existing two-story frame Italianate dwelling. Historically, 2316-2318 Burton Street were the two end units of 2320-2326 Burton Street. These units were demolished sometime in the late 1970s or 1980s. The proposed new construction will be identical in design to the existing 2320-2326 Burton Street.

The Commission reviewed this item in an advisory capacity.

Ms. Lambert, of Union Hill, said the project is wonderful in keeping neighborhood character.

Commissioner Rodriguez suggested some differentiation should be added to the new construction to avoid false historicism.

Commissioner Wheeler agreed with Commissioner Rodriguez and thinks the windows on the new building should be larger.

Commissioner Nutt asked about colors of the new construction and wanted to know about the new cornice details on the new construction.

Commissioner Danese agrees with the previous comments and does not want the building to stand out. He asked if these buildings were worker housing for a warehouse.

Mrs. Chen wrote the National Register nomination for Union Hill and said these dwellings would have served as worker housing for neighboring manufacturing.

8. [COA-139541-2023](#) 611 North 26th Street - Construct a garage in a rear yard and a 2-story rear addition with a basement and covered rear/side porches.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant proposes plans to construct a two-story rear addition with a finished basement on the rear of the house. A rear, one-story addition will be demolished as part of the project. The applicant is also proposing to construct a new garage in the northeast corner of the lot, which will have a finished second floor.

The Commission reviewed this item in an advisory capacity.

Mr. Jarreau, the owner, had submitted plans for this project in March and May 2022. He did not like the previous plans and wanted to change them.

Ms. Lambert of Union Hill said landscape changes and should not be considered as a

factor to obscure buildings.

Commissioner Moore thinks the design is compatible.

Commissioner Rodriguez thinks the applicant should consider building the roof lower.

The applicant said the roof of the addition will be slightly lower than the primary dwelling. He said he is not planning any tall rooms, the rooms will be 9 feet tall.

Commissioner Grier asked about the compatibility of the large dormer on the garage.

Commissioner Wheeler explained this project is technically an amendment to a COA. The garage was already approved in May 2022. He still has an issue with the roof and height of the garage. Commissioner Wheeler likes the use of the hyphen and thinks different width of siding on the addition may not be necessary.

9. [COA-139547-2023](#) 972-974 Pink Street - Construct a rear garage with an accessory dwelling unit above.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant plans to construct a garage behind the historic house, with a finished living space on the second floor. The garage will be located northeast of the existing dwelling and set back from the street. The new building will be visible from the public alley and Carrington Street.

The Commission reviewed this item in an advisory capacity.

Commissioner Wheeler believes the project looks good.

Commissioner Danese thinks wooden rails could deteriorate and the applicant could consider another material.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 6:04p.m.