



**Staff Report**  
**City of Richmond, Virginia**



**Commission of Architectural Review**

1. COA-101636-2021	<b>Final Review</b> <b>Meeting Date: 11/23/2021</b>
<b>Applicant/Petitioner</b>	Timothy Dickson
<b>Project Description</b>	Replace a tiled front porch with a concrete floor.
<b>Project Location</b>	
<b>Address: 2609 W. Grace St.</b>	
<b>Historic District: West Grace Street</b>	
<b>High-Level Details:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The applicant requests permission to replace a tiled front porch floor on a Ca. 1910 masonry Colonial Revival residence with a concrete front porch floor</li> <li>The original tiled front porch floor was removed without receiving approval from the Commission of Architectural Review</li> <li>The applicant requests permission to replace the front porch floor with concrete, as the original tile was damaged beyond repair and cannot be easily replicated or obtained</li> </ul>	
<b>Staff Recommendation</b>	<b>Partial Approval</b>
<b>Staff Contact</b>	Alex Dandridge, <a href="mailto:alex.dandridge@richmondgov.com">alex.dandridge@richmondgov.com</a> , (804) 646-6569
<b>Previous Reviews</b>	None.
<b>Conditions for Approval</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Denial of the use of concrete for the new porch floor.</li> <li>The front porch floor be replaced in-kind, or with a material that conveys the same appearance of the historic front porch floor; material submitted to staff for review and approval.</li> </ul>

## Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Standards for Rehabilitation, Residential Construction, 6-9, pg. 59	<p>6. <i>Retain original entrances and porches including doors, frames, fanlights, sidelights, steps, balustrades, pilasters, entablatures, columns and decorative features.</i></p> <p>7. <i>Repair damaged elements instead of replacing them. Use materials that match the original in type, or use physically and chemically compatible substitute materials that convey the same appearance as the surviving elements or sections. Use available documentation when reconstructing missing elements. Pictorial, historical or physical documentation can be helpful.</i></p> <p>9. <i>Do not remove or radically alter fundamental architectural features such as windows, roofs or porches.</i></p>	<p>The scope does not include the alteration of any other front porch features other than the front porch floor. The existing foundation, stairs, portico, and entrance will be retained.</p> <p>The applicant has stated that the original tiled front porch was damaged beyond repair and needed to be removed.</p> <p>The applicant proposes to install concrete rather than a new tile, mosaic design. The concrete will not match the original tiled porch in appearance or material.</p> <p>While there are examples of front porch floors constructed of concrete on the subject block, Staff finds that the original tiled front porch and mosaic design are character defining features of 2609 W. Grace Street. <u>Staff recommends that the front porch floor be replaced in-kind, or with a material that conveys the same appearance of the historic front porch floor.</u></p>
NPS Preservation Brief #16 Substitute Materials	<p><i>In order to provide an appearance that is compatible with the historic material, the new material should match the details and craftsmanship of the original as well as the color, surface texture, surface reflectivity and finish of the original material. The closer an element is to the viewer, the more closely the material and craftsmanship must match the original.</i></p>	<p>Concrete does not provide an appearance that is compatible with the historic material. Staff finds that the front porch floor is visible from the street, and recommends that the new porch floor material resemble the historic as closely as possible.</p>

# Figures



Figure 1. 2609 W. Grace Original Front Porch Floor



Figure 2. 2609 W. Grace Street Front Porch Floor Removed



Figure 3. Remnants of Original Tile Removed from Porch Floor



Figure 4. 2609 W. Grace Street 1950



Figure 5. Remnants of Original Tile Removed from Porch Floor



Figure 4. 2609 W. Grace Street Front Porch Floor Removed