

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT  
June 28, 2016 Meeting**

12. **CAR No. 16-104** (R. Peacock)

**303 Brook Road  
Broad Street Old and Historic District**

**Project Description:**

**Construct a 2<sup>nd</sup> story addition  
at the rear of the structure**

**Staff Contact:**

**M. Pitts**

The applicant requests approval to construct a second story addition at the rear of a mixed use property in the Broad Street Old and Historic District. The property is developed with a three story structure which fronts Brook Road near the intersection of Broad Street. At the rear of the primary structure, there is a two story deck set back from the alley and an existing sliding garage door at the alley. The applicant is proposing to construct an addition attached to the second story deck. The proposed addition will have a metal roof, be clad in stucco, and include a pair of 10-lite windows. The proposed addition will be approximately 15 feet taller than the existing garage door at the roof peak and slope to 10'-6" taller at the alley.

The applicant is seeking final approval for the design. Commission staff reviewed the project through the lens of the "Standards for New Construction: Residential" on pages 44 and 45 of the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* and the resulting comments follow.

**Staff Findings based on Commission of Architectural Review Guidelines**  
**STANDARDS FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION**

*All new residential and commercial construction, whether in the form of additions or entire buildings, should be compatible with the historic features that characterize their setting and context. To protect the context of the surrounding historic district, new construction should reference the materials, features, size, scale, proportions, and massing of the existing historic building or buildings in its setting. However, compatibility does not mean duplicating the existing buildings or environment. In order to avoid creating a false sense of history, new construction should also be discernible from the old. Perhaps the best way to think about a compatible new building (or addition) is that it should be a good neighbor; one that enhances the character of the existing district and respects its historic context, rather than being an exact (and misleading) reproduction of another building.*

**Staff recommends approval of the project with a condition.** The proposed addition appears generally to be in keeping with the Standards for New

Construction outlined in the *Guidelines*. The addition will be located on the rear of the property and will be visible from the rear alley and minimally visible from West Marshall Street as the property on West Marshall is currently developed with a parking lot. The proposed addition is subordinate in size to the three story primary structure. The proposed addition will not obscure or destroy any original architectural elements as the addition will attach to a non-historic rear deck and gate. The proposed stucco cladding is appropriate for the structure as it is a material found in the District including the new construction at 307 Brook Road. As details were not provided, staff recommends the approval of the windows be conditioned with the windows being true or simulated divided lite wood or aluminum clad wood windows. Additionally, staff recommends that details of the proposed metal roof and paint colors be provided to staff for administrative review and approval.

It is the assessment of staff that with the acceptance of the above condition the application is consistent with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Section 30.930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of code.