

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
July 28, 2015 Meeting**

3. **CAR No. 15-088** (M. Kiu Lo)

**2811 E. Marshall Street
Church Hill North Old & Historic District**

Project Description:

**Replace existing 1/1 window with
transom window on the rear elevation**

Staff Contact:

K. Chen

The applicant requests approval to replace an existing 1/1 window with a transom window on the rear elevation of the subject property within the Church Hill North Old and Historic District. The proposed alteration would be highly visible from the alleys on the east and south sides of the dwelling.

The applicant is proposing to replace an existing 53" by 34.5", 1/1 wood window with a 32" by 14" vinyl, hopper-style window on the second story of the rear elevation. The new window is set within the existing window opening but because of the reduced width no longer fully aligns with the window on the first story.

Staff recommends denial of the project. *The Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, Window Replacement and/or Reconstruction, page 65* notes several conditions for the replacement of windows with which this application does not comply.

7. Windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair. Any reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation.

8. The number, location, size or glazing pattern of windows should not be changed by cutting new openings, blocking out windows or installing replacement sash that do not fit the original opening. Changes to existing windows or the addition of new windows along a secondary elevation will be considered by the Commission on a case-by-case basis.

11. Because the material cannot be manufactured to model effectively the appearance of historic windows, vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic buildings in historic districts.

It is the assessment of staff that the application is not consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.