



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, February 27, 2018

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

BEGINNING AT 3:30 PM

Call to Order

Mr. Yates called the meeting to order at 3:30 pm.

Roll Call

Present -- 6 - * Bryan Green, * Gerald Jason Hendricks, * James W. Klaus, * Joseph Yates, * Neville C. Johnson Jr. and * Carey L. Jones
Absent -- 3 - * David C. Cooley, * Sanford Bond and * Andrew Ray McRoberts

Approval of Minutes

November 28, 2017

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Green, that the November minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Abstain -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

January 16, 2018 (Quarterly Meeting)

The January quarterly minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

January 23, 2018

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that the January minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Gerald Jason Hendricks

Review of National Register Nominations

[NR 2018-1](#) Oliver Chilled Plow Works Branch House (908 Oliver Hill Way)

Attachments: [National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Ms. Chen stated that as a certified local government, as a courtesy, the Commission is given an opportunity to review and comment on National Register nominations.

Ms. Chen presented the nomination for the Oliver Chilled Plow Works Branch House and stated that staff recommends support of the nomination of the structures under criteria A and C at the local level but questioned whether the building possesses architectural significance on an individual level.

Mr. Green inquired if the buildings are currently in a historic district. Ms. Chen replied that there has been a lot of demolition around these buildings so they are not in an existing district nor are they close enough to an existing district to suggest the expansion of a district boundary.

Mr. Green stated that the buildings do not rise to the level of an individual listing. Mr. Yates agreed, stating that he would recommend expanding the existing historic district. Ms. Chen commented that a discontinuous expansion of the district could be recommended.

Ms. Jones commented that the nomination didn't make a strong enough case for architectural significance and though it doesn't have great architectural merit, it might have good industrial engineering.

Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Pitts announced the request to remove a portion of the White House of the Confederacy from a City Old and Historic District would be going through a zoning change process through Planning Commission. Planning Commission will be seeking a recommendation from the CAR. Ms. Chen added that Planning and Preservation staff will be writing the staff report for the Ordinance and Resolution.

Ms. Pitts reminded the Commission of the attendance policy. Per the Commission's rules of procedure, if a commissioner misses four meetings in a calendar year, the Commission will ask the City Council to remove them from the Commission.

Administrative Approvals

Ms. Pitts announced that the guidelines for administrative approval of signage determine whether signage meets the Commission's guidelines and explained that she can give her approval if the signage meets the guidelines. Ms. Pitts further announced that she had been bringing blade signs before the Commission, but that since the Commission had consistently recommended approval for blade signs as a sign type appropriate for an Old and Historic District, she has approved two blade signs administratively.

Enforcement Report

Ms. Pitts announced that staff visited a house at 2617 East Grace Street that is in very poor condition, and the owners were doing emergency stabilization work. She further commented that the owners are also getting tax credits for the project but have not yet

received approval. Staff was following up with several neighbors who were concerned about the work that was being done.

Other Committee Reports

Mr. Green announced the approval of the final Location, Character, and Extent review of George Washington Carver Elementary, an Enterprise Center, and new Richmond Transit Network Bus Shelters. He further announced a conceptual Character and Extent review of a new outdoor classroom pavilion at Patrick Henry School.

Mr. Green noted there is a project coming up at the Checkers House in Monroe Park next month and mentioned that he has been working on some minor updates to the Commission's guidelines.

Please Note

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

BEGINNING AT 4:00 PM

CONSENT AGENDA

Yates made a motion, seconded by Klaus, to move item 7, COA-029600-2018, 211 North Foushee Street to the consent agenda. The commission approved moving the item.

Klaus made a motion, seconded by Yates, to move item 3, COA-029595-2018, 2608 East Grace Street to the consent agenda. The commission approved moving the item.

Klaus made a motion, seconded by Jones, to move item 9, COA-030052-2018, 514 West 19th Street to the consent agenda. The commission approved moving the item.

The Chairman asked for public comment on the consent agenda which included items COA-029600-2018, 211 North Foushee Street; COA-029595-2018, 2608 East Grace Street; and COA-030052, 514 West 19th Street.

Janice Carter Lovejoy, a neighbor at 604 West 19th street, announced her enthusiastic approval of the construction concerning item nine on the agenda.

There being no further public discussion, the Chairman called the question.

Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the consent agenda as amended with staff's recommended conditions. Commissioner Klaus seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

- 1 [COA-030309-2018](#) 2510 East Franklin Street - Rehabilitate front porch.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: the new porch columns match the remaining engaged columns, the railing be Richmond rail, the porch cornice be reconstructed to match the 1989 photograph, and the porch colors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. Commissioner Klaus seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

- 3 [COA-029595-2018](#) 2608 East Grace Street - Construct a new one-story brick garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: the color of the garage door be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. Commissioner Klaus seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Aye -- 6 - Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

- 7 [COA-029600-2018](#) 211 North Foushee Street - Install a wireless antenna on the roof of a commercial building.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: the antenna be mounted to the inside of the parapet wall in a way that avoids damage to the historic brick. Commissioner Klaus seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Aye -- 6 - Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

- 9 [COA-030052-2018](#) 514 West 19th Street - Remove rear porch enclosure and construct rear addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: the siding be smooth and without a bead, the proposed addition be set in at least six inches from the existing north building wall to differentiate the new construction from the existing structure, the windows be true or simulated divided lite windows with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar, the deck be painted or stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure, and the sub-decking, if visible, be screened with wood lattice work or with brick piers.

Commissioner Klaus seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Aye -- 6 - Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

REGULAR AGENDA

- 2 [COA-028609-2018](#) 2901 Monument Avenue & 708-712 Colonial Avenue - Amend previously approved plans for three attached single family homes to alter the fenestration on the alley elevation.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was withdrawn by the applicant.

- 4 [COA-029596-2018](#) 509 West Clay Street - Rehabilitate an existing home, expand rear porch enclosure.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Commissioner Yates moved to approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: details of the porch railing and shutters be provided for administrative review and approval; the last bay of the 2nd story porch not be enclosed; the side and rear elevation of the porch enclosure be modified in a manner to be administratively reviewed and approved by staff to limit the use of vertical siding by including additional glazing and shutters if the addition of glazing does not accommodate the desired floor plans; for the proposed modified opening at the rear of the structure, the existing arch be maintained and the door fit between the jambs of the existing opening; the landings and stairs be painted or opaquely stained a color to be administratively approved by staff; any unpainted masonry should not be painted; the work be performed in conformance with a Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions; and any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service be submitted to CAR staff for administrative review and approval. Commissioner Hendricks seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Aye -- 6 - Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

- 5 [COA-029597-2018](#) 2609 Monument Avenue - Construct a second story addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Dan Ensminger, the architect representing the owner, stated that his desire was to use the space in a way that it would be less disruptive to the house. Mr. Ensminger expressed concern about blocking light into the back of the house and affirmed his attempt to make the proposed construction as minimally noticeable as possible. He further expressed his hope that the Commission would offer some suggestions as to how the proposed construction could be optimally built and insisted that the proposed construction involved the clever use of dead space in a unique way. He noted, even though aware that his proposed construction conflicted with the Commission guidelines, that there is no other house on the street that he believes could have a basis for using his proposed construction as a precedent, due to the house's unique setting.

There was no public comment.

The Commission confirmed that the guidelines are very clear that the front views of important houses should not be impacted in the manner in which the proposed construction purported to impact. The Commission further noted that its members have not allowed people to change the façade view of a house on Monument Avenue, regardless of how beautiful the work of the architect would be. The Chairman added that the home at the site of the proposed construction was not designed to accommodate a more modern lifestyle.

Commissioner Green moved to defer the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the applicant the opportunity to discuss the application with the Monument Avenue Preservation Society. Commissioner Johnson seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Aye -- 6 - Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

6 [COA-029598-2018](#) 815 North 24th Street - Install a front yard fence.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mayme Donohue, the owner, admitted that ignorance of the guidelines was not a valid defense. However, Ms. Donohue claimed that the Richmond Planning and Development Review website provided inaccurate information that she had relied upon, leading her to believe that constructing the fence would be consistent with city guidelines. Ms. Donohue added that vinyl fences also appear in the neighborhood. She affirmed her intention to adhere to city guidelines but noted that the city does have the ability to approve certain changes on a case by case basis based on facts and circumstances. She further mentioned that she considered the fence to be highly aesthetically pleasing and that neighbors approved of the fence's construction. Ms. Donohue insisted that the lack of uniformity in the neighborhood lends itself to a misunderstanding of what the rules are. In light of reading an incorrect version of the guidelines on the city's website, Ms. Donohue asserted that she should not carry the financial burden of correcting the issue with the fence.

There was no public comment.

Ms. Pitts confirmed that the Commission notifies new property owners of Commission guidelines and requirements through public notice letters, adding that public information post cards had also been sent to all owners within a City Old and Historic District last

summer. She affirmed that the applicant had been notified of adjacent projects reviewed by the CAR as well.

Mr. Yates stated that the guidelines concerning vinyl fences are clear enough that he cannot foresee making an exception for the applicant. The commissioners further explained that applicants cannot solely rely on the website to determine Commission guidelines but should take initiative to contact the Planning and Development Department by phone as well. Mr. Green further suggested that the parcel map on the Commission of Architectural Review's website provided notice that the applicant's home is within a historic district.

Ms. Donohue interjected with the request that the Commission permit the fence to remain in place until the construction activity that requires the fence's presence subsides.

Mr. Yates stated that he didn't want to proceed with any action that would put the Commission into possible legal conflict with the City Attorney. He recommended deferring the application for 30 days and getting a ruling from the City Attorney as to how and whether the Commission can provide the applicant with permission to temporarily keep the fence in place. The Commission made a motion for deferral to the attorney's office.

Commissioner Yates moved to defer the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow Commission staff the opportunity to discuss alternatives including temporarily allowing the existing fence to remain with the City Attorney's Office. Commissioner Klaus seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Aye -- 6 - Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

8 [COA-029601-2018](#) 100 East Leigh Street - Replace eleven windows.

Attachments: [Staff Report \(3/27/18\)](#)
[Application and Plans \(2/27/18\)](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report \(2/27/18\)](#)

Gus Johnson, the owner, acknowledged that he received a letter from the Commission of Architectural Review that notified him that he would be required to obtain CAR approval for any exterior changes to the appearance of the house. He did not interpret replacing windows as a change in the external appearance of the house and was not aware that vinyl windows were inappropriate for his home.

Public comment:

John Meara, a neighbor in Jackson Ward, stated that maintaining the presence of the old windows is vital to the preservation of the historic district in which the subject house resides. Mr. Meara found that approving the replacement of windows in a historic district equates to 'creeping modern innovation' and strongly objected to such changes. He also objected to any suggestion that the windows needed replacement and did not consider them inoperable or in disrepair.

Gus Johnson reacted to Mr. Meara's statement, insisting that he has no intention of changing the exterior appearance of the house. Mr. Johnson added that since Mr. Meara

has never lived in the home, he is in no position to judge the issues within his home and insisted that without replacement, the windows would not allow for reasonable livable conditions. He stated that cold air would leak into the house continuously, and the old windows imposed a financial burden on his gas bill.

Public comment closed.

Mr. Yates affirmed that the guidelines clearly prohibit the replacement of original windows with vinyl windows, and the guidelines further establish that windows are a significant feature of the exterior of any historic house. He further noted that it is very rare that windows need to be replaced to maintain their functionality.

Mr. Johnson interrupted the Commission discussion with the plea that because residents put forth their best effort to follow, essentially, unclear guidelines, he would ask the Commission to more clearly communicate the guidelines to residents. On a personal note, he admitted that complying with the Commission's guidelines would be a financial burden for him.

Commissioners affirmed that if they created exceptions to the guidelines for every person that claimed ignorance, historic neighborhoods would be completely changed.

Commissioner Hendricks moved to defer the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the applicant the opportunity to work with Commission staff on a revised submittal. Commissioner Yates seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Aye -- 6 - Bryan Green, Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

- 10** [COA-029971-2018](#) 2108 1/2 East Broad Street - Construct a new three-story single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: the siding be smooth and without a bead, details of the porch and deck railings be submitted for administrative review and approval, paint and brick colors be submitted for administrative review and approval, the rear of the deck be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found in the main structure to be reviewed and approved by staff, and details of the garage door be submitted for administrative review and approval. Commissioner Yates seconded the motion. The motion was approved by a vote of 4-2.

Aye -- 4 - Gerald Jason Hendricks, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

No -- 2 - Bryan Green and James W. Klaus

- 12** [COA-028538-2018](#) 1131-1137 West Grace Street - Construct a new multifamily building.

Attachments: [Application and Plans - 2/27/18](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report - 2/27/18](#)

[Application and Plans - 1/23/18](#)

[Staff Report - 1/23/18](#)

Commissioner Klaus moved to approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: the windows be aluminum clad wood windows with true or simulated divided lites to include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar, final brick and paint colors be submitted for administrative review and approval, and any changes to the courtyard columns in response to community concerns be submitted for administrative review and approval by staff. Commissioner Johnson seconded the motion. The motion was approved by a vote of 5-1.

Aye -- 5 - Gerald Jason Hendricks, James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

No -- 1 - Bryan Green

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- 13 [COA-029603-2018](#) 512 West 19th Street - Construct a single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Chad White, the owner, noted the difficulty in building a three bay house on a narrow lot. He further noted that certain details were absent from the submitted elevations. He attested to his openness to consider staff recommendations to further guide his decision-making.

Public comment:

John Crohn and Janice Carter Lovejoy, neighbors in the area of the proposed construction, expressed their support for the proposed construction.

Public comment closed.

Commissioners noted that the porch roof should not run the full width of the house; the front door should be centered under the upstairs window; the porch columns would need to be wider; the double window needs to be centered under the window above; and more glazing should be added to the facade. Mr. Green noted that the trim would need to be wider and have some depth.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

- 14 [COA-029720-2018](#) 6 North 31st Street - Construct a new duplex.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report](#)

Carl Scott briefly introduced himself as the owner of the property and noted that one of his plans was to have demolished three of the units which were previously shown.

Public comment:

Martha Broughton, representing the zoning committee of the Churchill Association, professed her trust in the Commission's ability to improve the appearance of her neighborhood and noting that this street will become a gateway to Churchill. She commented on the proposed height of the structure, noting that the new construction nearby is tall.

Public comment closed.

Mr. Green commented that he was concerned with the third story, as unlike around the corner where they had been allowed, there is some existing context in this location. Mr. Yates agreed, stating that the new construction should not overwhelm the existing houses. Ms. Jones stated her indecision about the height of the proposed construction, adding that the proposed construction may provide balance with the three story new construction nearby. Commissioners stated that seeing the proposed structure in context with the existing homes would further inform their opinion about the proposed construction's height.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

- 11 [COA-030046-2018](#) 2200-2202 M Street - Amend plans for the facade of a previously approved duplex.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)[Site Map](#)[Staff Report](#)

Ms. Pitts explained that the Commission approved plans for a duplex with mirrored facades at this location but the applicant has returned with a design with two identical facades.

There was no public comment.

Mr. Green commented that it would be easier for the applicant to build the approved design.

Ms. Pitts commented that staff had informed the applicant of this and that staff was concerned with the column placement. She further added that if staff has concerns about the porch design that the applicant doesn't share, staff will require the design to go back before the Commission.

Commissioner Klaus moved to approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: the applicant revise the porch design to modify the column placement and locate the porch cornice proud of the projecting bay or to redesign the porch roof to not engage with the projecting bay in a manner to be administratively reviewed and approved by staff. Commissioner Jones seconded the motion. The motion was approved

unanimously.

Adjournment

Mr. Yates adjourned the meeting at 7:01 pm.