

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT  
October 25, 2016 Meeting**

18. **CAR No. 16-157** (M. Magnes) **3112 East Marshall Street  
St. John's Church Old and Historic District**

**Project Description:** **Construct a three story single family dwelling.**

**Staff Contact:** **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests conceptual review and comment on the construction of a single family dwelling on a vacant lot in the St. John's Church Old and Historic District.

The residential character of the subject block consists of 2 story structures in a mix of Italianate and Queen Anne architectural styles. The structures on the even side of the block are primarily 3 bay structures while the structures on the odd side of the block include both 3 bay and 2 bay structures with double windows. The neighborhood is a mix of frame and brick structures, and Chimborazo Elementary School, a Beaux Arts brick institutional building, is located at the northern corner of the intersection of East Marshall and North 31<sup>st</sup> Streets.

The applicant is proposing to construct a three story frame Italianate inspired single family structure. The mass of the third story will be set back approximately 32 feet from the façade with a stairwell set back 19 feet from the façade. The home will be approximately 38 feet in height at the roof of the third story and 28 feet at the two story portion. The structure will have a front setback of 15 feet and side yard setbacks of 3 feet on both sides. The façade of the two story portion has a three bay composition with a center entrance and a single story full façade covered front porch. The applicant is proposing to clad the building in fiber cement siding of both a 4 ½" and 7" exposure in an earth toned color though it is unclear as to where the different sidings will be installed. The applicant is proposing all windows to be 2/1 aluminum clad wood windows. The applicant is proposing cornice details that will match the historic cornices found in the district in design and will be constructed of composite materials. On the rear elevation, the applicant is proposing balconies with double doors and double windows and a first floor deck.

The applicant is seeking **Conceptual Review** for this project. Conceptual review is covered under Sec. 30-930.6(d) of the City Code: The commission shall review and discuss the proposal with the applicant and make any necessary recommendations. Such Conceptual Review shall be advisory only. Commission staff reviewed the project through the lens of the "Standards for New Construction: Residential" on pages 44 and 45 of the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* utilizing the checklist below.

**S=satisfies**

**D=does not satisfy**

**NA=not applicable**

**S**   **D**   **NA**  
     

**New infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns in the surrounding district**

The applicant has not provided a context site plan; therefore, staff is unable to confirm if the proposed setbacks are consistent with the adjacent properties.

    

**Where the adjoining buildings have different setbacks, the setback for the new building should be based on the historical pattern for the block**

Though a context site plan showing the setbacks of the adjacent structures was not provided, it appears that the adjacent structures have similar setbacks therefore this guideline does not apply.

    

**New buildings should face the most prominent street bordering the site**

The structure addresses East Marshall Street.

    

**New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the district. Form refers to the combination of massing, size, symmetry, proportions, projections and roof shapes that lend identity to a building.**

The construction of a third story extension at the rear of a two story structure is not a single family residential building form found in the district.

    

**New construction should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps.**

The proposed project incorporates human-scale elements including a cornice, front and rear porches, and front steps as part of the project.

    

**New construction should respect the typical height of surrounding buildings**

The typical height of the surrounding buildings is 2 stories. The proposed structure is 3 stories. The applicant has attempted to minimize the impact of the height by locating the taller portion of the building at rear of the project. As the context drawing provided emphasizes the height of the building in comparison to the adjacent structure, staff encourages the applicant to provide additional perspective drawings that show the visibility of the third story from the street when the applicant returns for final review.

    

**New construction should respect the typical width, organization of bays, vertical alignment and symmetry of surrounding buildings.**

The proposed project does maintain the typically width, vertical alignment, the 3 bay organization, and symmetry of the surrounding buildings.

- The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings should be compatible with patterns established in the district.**

The proposed windows are vertically aligned and symmetrically placed which is consistent with patterns in the district. Staff finds the center entrance as proposed is an element that is not found on the majority of structures in the surrounding block as the primary entrance is typically found in an outer bay. As the subject block contains multiple properties with double windows, staff supports the use of double windows on the property as seen in the rear of the structure.

- Porch and cornice heights should be compatible with adjacent buildings**

The porch and cornice heights of the two story portion of the structure relate to those of the adjacent structures.

- Materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district. Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted.**

The proposed construction utilizes cementitious lapped siding, trim, and panels; wooden front porch details; composite porch flooring and rear railings, and aluminum clad windows. Though lapped siding is a material that is found in the district, the mix of exposures is not something typically found in the district. As the plans are unclear as to where the different sizes of siding will be located, staff is unable to fully comment on this use of material.

The following items will need to be included for final review:

1. A dimensioned context drawing illustrating the vertical relationship of the proposed new construction and the adjacent buildings
2. A dimensioned context site plan illustrating the setbacks on the adjacent properties.
3. Details of mechanical unit and trash locations and screening.
4. Details of front porch roof material and column dimensions.
5. Details of where the various siding exposures will be used.
6. Roof Plan
7. A detailed statement of how the project conforms to the *Guidelines*.