

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW  
STAFF REPORT  
July 22, 2014 Meeting**

6. **CAR No. 14-74** (Mangrove Properties LLC)

**2319 M Street  
Union Hill Old & Historic District**

**Project Description:**

**Repair deteriorated features and  
construct new rear addition**

**Staff Contact:**

**W. Palmquist**

The applicant requests permission to repair and replace damaged exterior materials, paint the structure, construct a rear one-story addition, and remove a window and relocate a door on the rear elevation. This work is being done as part of a larger effort to rehabilitate the structure into a duplex from its current use as a single-family dwelling. The applicant will also be applying for historic tax credits.

Various exterior repairs and replacements are needed where exterior features are either damaged beyond repair or are missing entirely. The brick foundation and piers will be repointed as needed. The existing windows will be repaired and are not going to be replaced.

The applicant proposes to paint the building's exterior in colors which are part of the palette of sixty colors that have been developed to help guide staff and property owners in selecting appropriate paint schemes for buildings within City Old & Historic Districts. These colors include Colonial Revival Gray for the siding, Downing Slate for the trim, and Pure White for the porch. The applicant also will be repainting the previously painted brick foundation white.

The most significant changes are occurring at the rear of the structure, which includes a new bathroom addition to be located within the English basement, beneath the rear screened in porch. The addition will be 10' by 6'10" and will be situated on the existing 5" concrete slab and between the southeastern brick foundation and the southernmost brick pier. However, the applicant has indicated that the bathroom may have to encompass the southernmost pier in order to provide adequate width for the bathroom. There will be a 12" roof overhang with TPO roofing. The exterior of the addition will be finished with 1" by 6" wood siding. While contained within the existing footprint of the English basement, the rear of the new addition will be highly visible from the public right-of-way since the existing structure is located immediately adjacent to the sidewalk.

Other work that is being done in conjunction with the addition includes the relocation of a door on the rear elevation. The door on the rear of the 1<sup>st</sup> floor that is used to access the screen porch is being removed and the opening is being filled in. The window on the rear elevation that looks out onto the screened porch is being removed, the opening is being enlarged, and the prior-mentioned door is being installed. The window does not appear to be historic. There is some

question as to whether the entire rear porch is original to the structure or not. Sanborn fire maps show a rear porch on the structure that appears to be narrower than the depth of the existing porch. Furthermore, it is unclear whether the rear door and window openings which are being modified are original to the structure as well.

**Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions.** The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* states that new additions should be subordinate in size to the main structure and should not destroy important architectural features (pp. 44-45). The proposed addition will clearly be subordinate to the main structure, and will sit in the current footprint of the English basement. Staff recommends that the addition be approved so long as it is located between the brick foundation and the brick pier, but should not encompass the pier. Leaving the brick pier exposed would allow an historic element to remain visible and will result in a cleaner finished project.

Staff recommends that the applicant enumerate to the Commission any exterior elements which are being proposed to be replaced in order to ensure that no historic elements which are repairable are replaced, or are replaced with an adequate substitution.

Staff recommends that the applicant provides information in satisfaction of the Commission explaining the historic nature of the rear porch and the rear openings which are proposed to be modified, as well as exactly how the current window opening will be modified to accommodate a door. If the rear window and door openings are indeed historic, staff recommends that their infill and/or modification be done in a manner which respects the historic openings and preserves evidence that openings once existed at this location on the structure.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions noted above, the work outlined in the proposal complies with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 114-930.7(b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code. Staff recommends that any changes required by the National Park Service or the Virginia Department of Historic Resources for tax credit purposes be deferred to Commission staff for final review and approval.