

City of Richmond

*City Hall
900 East Broad Street*



Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, December 17, 2024

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Commission of Architectural Review

[PDRPRES
2024.063](#)

Public Access and Participation Instruction - Commission of Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW.pdf](#)

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:30p.m.

Roll Call

Present -- 8 - * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, * Commissioner Andrew Moore, * Commissioner John Grier, * Commissioner Mitch Danese, * Commissioner Larry Nutt, * Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, * Commissioner Erik Bootsma and * Commissioner Catherine Easterling_
Absent -- 1 - * Commissioner Emily Striffler

OTHER BUSINESS

Approval of Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Nutt, to approve the May-November 2024 Minutes.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Erik Bootsma

Minutes 2024

Secretary's Report

Bylaw Revisions

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve the revisions to the Commission's Bylaws.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Erik Bootsma

CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to move Item #8 2516 East Leigh Street to the Consent Agenda.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: (6) (S) DANESE, GRIER, HILL, MOORE, NUTT, (M) RODRIGUEZ

No: (0)

Excused: (2) BOOTSMA, STRIFFLER

Recused: (1) EASTERLING

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to move Item #9 400 West Clay Street to the Consent Agenda; however, the motion and second were withdrawn due to lack of support from fellow Commissioners.

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to move Item #6 1809 West Grace Street to the Consent Agenda; however, the motion and second were withdrawn due to lack of support from fellow Commissioners.

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to approve the revised Consent Agenda.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt and Commissioner Gina Marie Hill

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Erik Bootsma

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

8. [COA-158301-2024](#) 2516 East Leigh Street - Alter a rear parking lot to include new hardscaping, landscaping, and site features.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)

[Gazebo.pdf](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt, seconded by Commissioner Hill to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: the final fence structure meets any zoning ordinance requirements and that the final design and material of the proposed fence is submitted to Staff for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt and Commissioner Gina Marie Hill

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Erik Bootsma

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

REGULAR AGENDA

1. [COA-158347-2024](#) 2607 East Marshall Street - Construct a two story semi-attached building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The proposed buildings feature light configurations more common in the district such at one-over-one, two-over-two, or six-over-six. Final window specifications to be included with the final review. Applicant consider using a metal roof for the main roof and dormers. Final roof materials submitted for administrative review and approval. Gutters be square or half round, and downspouts be rounded. Final specification submitted for administrative review and approval. Fencing design be submitted later for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_
- No --** 1 - Commissioner John Grier

2. [COA-158351-2024](#) 2609 East Marshall Street - Construct a two story semi-attached building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hill, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The proposed buildings feature light configurations more common in the district such at one-over-one, two-over-two, or six-over-six. Final window specifications to be included with the final review. Applicant consider using a metal roof for the main roof and dormers. Final roof materials submitted for administrative review and approval. Gutters be square or half round, and downspouts be rounded. Final specification submitted for administrative review and approval. Fencing design be submitted later for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_
- No --** 1 - Commissioner John Grier

3. [COA-158353-2024](#) 2611 East Marshall Street - Construct a two story detached building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The proposed buildings feature light configurations more common in the district such as one-over-one, two-over-two, or six-over-six. Final window specifications to be included with the final review. Applicant consider using a metal roof for the main roof and dormers. Final roof materials submitted for administrative review and approval. Gutters be square or half round, and downspouts be rounded. Final specification submitted for administrative review and approval. Fencing design be submitted later for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_
- No --** 1 - Commissioner John Grier

4. [COA-158302-2024](#) 2609 East Leigh Street - Remove a rear, deteriorated, standing seam metal roof and install a new asphalt shingle roof.

WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

This application was withdrawn by the applicant.

5. [COA-158297-2024](#) 500 North Arthur Ashe Boulevard - Enclose a side porch and remove a rear projection and porch to construct an addition.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: The proposed work as described in the application as the rear porch removal and addition will not be visible from the public right of way; a simplified design of corridor addition in order to differentiate this addition from the original structure. Final design submitted for Chair & Vice Chair Approval.

The motion failed by the following vote:

Yes: (3) GRIER, NUTT, RODRIGUEZ
No: (5) BOOTSMA, DANESE, EASTERLING, MOORE, NUTT
Excused: (1) STRIFFLER
Recused: (0)

A motion was made by Commissioner Easterling, seconded by Commissioner Danese to defer the application to allow the applicant to provide additional

information to the Commission. Specifically, the Commission requested more information on the intent of the applicant regarding the porch enclosure and its use. The Commission also requested a revised design of the conservatory enclosure that features a simplified window and base paneling design, and that the location of any exterior HVAC equipment for the enclosures on visible elevations be submitted. Overall, the Commission found the design to be appropriate in terms of preserving historic materials but were hesitant, and mostly not in support of the enclosure of the side porch, given the visibility of the porch and its connection to the street, as well as the guidelines specific recommendation that porches on primary elevations should not be enclosed. There was concern that enclosing the porch could reduce the building's interaction with street, and installation of interior blinds would ruin the intent of the openness of the design; although the Commission acknowledged that if enclosed, their purview is limited to the exterior.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_
- No --** 1 - Commissioner John Grier

6. [COA-158358-2024](#) 1809 West Grace Street - Reconstruct a covered front porch.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to continue this application to the January meeting, as the applicant was not present to speak on their application.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_
- Excused --** 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

7. [COA-158299-2024](#) 2228 Cedar Street - Construct a second story rear addition.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Bootsma, seconded by Commissioner Hill, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: Any historically original or significant features are retained and repaired where possible. Any salvaged material that are used be aligned with historically appropriate elements for the final building's design. Any remaining original historic features, particularly the engaged front porch column (right side), are prioritized for preservation or replaced in-kind if beyond repair. The front porch roofing should reflect flat lock or field formed standing seam

design. On the façade, the second floor retains its historic design and fenestration pattern; any replacement door including, one with a half-light, be submitted for administrative approval; On the façade, any door that is to be removed on the ground-level should be replaced with a window and infill that fit within the existing doors exact dimensions. Additionally, any door that is to be restored and retained shall be submitted to Staff for administrative review and approval. Applicant receives all necessary permitting approvals. Any evidence of lap siding is found beneath the asphalt shingles of the rear addition it should be preserved if possible or if deteriorated beyond repair may be replaced with a smooth, unbeaded composite siding. Final siding to be submitted to Staff for administrative approval. Existing chimney is referenced or retained on the exterior. Final fence design and material to Staff for administrative approval; and exterior trim pieces be installed on the rear and side elevations that demarcate the new second story addition from the original portion of the building, following the original roof line.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

9. [COA-158354-2024](#) 400 West Clay Street - Rehabilitate an existing dwelling.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Additional Photos and Paint.pdf](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to partially approve this application. Staff Recommends approval of: Replacement of front porch metal railing with sawn pickets; matching those seen in the 1950s photograph and at 402 & 404 West Clay Street. Any new rail on the east elevation's stoop be a simple design, such as Richmond Rail, or a design substantiated by historic documentation; final materials and design submitted for Administrative Approval. Installation of new turned posts that match those at 402-404 West Clay Street, or a simplified design matching the proportions/dimensions (turned to square portion ratio) of original posts. Final design submitted for Administrative Approval. If the existing cornice remains, it be retained/repared. If a new cornice is installed, it replicates the neighboring cornice or be a simplified design and aligned with 402 West Clay Street; final treatment/design submitted for Administrative Approval. Original dentil detailing be retained/repared. If new detailing is to be installed, it be based on historic documentation or be a simplified design that matches the proportions of the original, aligning with 402 West Clay Street. New porch roof material be flat lock metal, or a dark colored membrane submitted for Administrative Approval. Original doors, windows, frames, transoms, and decorative features be retained/repared. New rear widows be two-over-two with SDLs; the muntin's of which match the width of the existing as closely as possible. Painting of previously painted brick only using a color that is similar to the color of the original brick. New wooden fence be submitted for Administrative Approval. Repointing match original mortar joints in depth and profile. The painting of the

rear stucco; color to be submitted for Administrative Approval; and the approval of using a red lime wash on unpainted masonry on the eastern side elevation only.

The Commission denied: The painting of all unpainted masonry. The selected replacement turned posts.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

Excused -- 2 - Commissioner Mitch Danese and Commissioner Erik Bootsma

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 6:26p.m.