



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

5. COA-156644-2024	Final Review	Meeting Date: 11/26/2024
Applicant/Petitioner	Timothy R. Deegan Jr.	
Project Description	Enclose a rear, second story porch.	
Project Location		
Address: 323 North 36 th Street		
Historic District: Church Hill North		
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <p>Note: This is an historic tax credit project.</p> <p>The applicant proposes to enclose the second-floor rear porch of the primary building, which was constructed circa 1916. The enclosure will feature a design split into two sections: the half closest to East Marshall Street will consist of floor-to-ceiling glass storefront, while the half farther from the public right-of-way will be framed and clad with board-and-batten siding. The existing roof and posts supporting the porch will be retained, with straps added at the top and bottom of the three existing posts for reinforcement.</p> <p>The building's footprint will remain unchanged, and all existing windows will be retained. Additionally, all exterior components of the building will be preserved, except for the removal of the asphalt cladding currently installed over the wood siding. Any rotten or damaged materials will be replaced in-kind to ensure consistency with the historic character of the building.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov, (804) 646-6569	
Previous Reviews	In August 2024, Staff administratively approved the repair and replacement of non-original asphalt siding and wood lap siding	
Conditions for Approval	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff recommends approval of the project, provided the applicant collaborates with staff to incorporate a horizontal element around the entirety of the porch enclosure to better reference a porch railing. Final design to be administratively approved. 	

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Building Elements: Porches, Entrances & Doors, pg. #71	<p><i>2. Hardware and locks that are original or important to the historical evolution of the building should be reused.</i></p> <p><i>4. Do not remove or radically change entrances and porches important in defining the building's overall historic character. Front and side porches are architecturally more ornate than utilitarian back porches.</i></p> <p><i>8. Do not strip entrances and porches of historic material and details that should be retained in any repair or partial replacement.</i></p> <p><i>12. Do not enclose porches on primary elevations.</i></p> <p><i>13. Porch enclosures to aid in energy conservation are only appropriate on secondary elevations. Solid materials are not recommended for use in enclosure projects since they can radically alter the historic appearance of a porch. Glass enclosures which reveal decorative porch elements are strongly preferred.</i></p> <p><i>14. Do not remove original doors and door surrounds. Replacement doors and door surrounds with stamped or molded faux paneling or leaded, beveled, or etched glass are strongly discouraged and rarely permitted. Stamped or molded faux paneled doors are inappropriate substitutes for door types found in historic districts.</i></p>	<p>The proposed scope of work is limited to the rear porch, located on a secondary elevation, which aligns with the guidelines permitting porch enclosures on non-primary elevations. While staff could not identify documentary evidence to confirm whether this porch is original to the building, its placement on the rear elevation and away from the primary façade reduces its visibility and potential impact on the historic character as seen from the public right-of-way along East Marshall Street. The proposal does not include any alterations to existing doors or windows, ensuring compliance with the guidelines prohibiting the removal or replacement of original doors and surrounds.</p> <p>The design retains the three existing posts supporting the porch roof and incorporates two distinct sections for the enclosure. The half of the porch farthest from East Marshall Street will feature solid wood panels framed with 2x4" wood studs and clad in fire-rated plywood. The half closest to the public right-of-way will utilize floor-to-ceiling glass and aluminum storefront, adhering to the guidelines that strongly encourage glass enclosures to preserve visibility of decorative elements and minimize changes to the historic appearance. While the entire porch is not enclosed in glass, the use of transparent materials on the more visible portion mitigates potential adverse impacts on the building's historic character.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends approval of the project, provided the applicant collaborates with staff to incorporate a horizontal element around the entirety of the porch enclosure to better reference a porch railing. Final design to be administratively approved.</u></p>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures

Figure 1: Primary residence at intersection of E. Marshall St. and N. 36th St.



Figure 2: South façade of property with second-floor rear porch.



Figure 3: Rear façade, facing West towards 36th Street.

