COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT October 25, 2016 Meeting

4. CAR No. 16-140 (F. Cava)

512 North 29th Street Church Hill North Old and Historic District

Project Description:

Rehabilitate the existing home to include replacing vinyl siding with fiber cement siding, painting, and installing a new front door.

Staff Contact:

M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval rehabilitate an altered frame vernacular Italianate dwelling in the Church Hill North Old and Historic District. The applicant is proposes to remove the existing vinyl siding and install smooth Hardiplank lap siding in Gray Slate which is similar to Classic French Gray, #6 on the Commission's paint palette. The applicant proposes to paint the structure as follows:

- Trim to include lattice and porch railing, columns, and ceiling: Extra White to match the existing color
- Porch Floor and Concrete Steps: Online Gray SW7072 (Similar to Colonial Revival Gray, #5 on the Commission's palette)
- Brick Piers: Existing paint to be removed

The applicant proposes to remove the existing storm door and front door and install a 9-lite, wooden, simulated divided lite, front door to be stained Walnut.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* note that fiber cement siding is a product with limited applications which includes being used on secondary elevations with limited visibility from the public right of way (pg. 56). Staff does not know if any historic wood siding remains under the vinyl siding. Staff recommends the condition of the wood siding be assessed in coordination with CAR staff and if possible, a sufficient amount of existing wood siding be salvaged and installed with the historic reveals on the façade. Staff supports the installation of fiber cement siding on the secondary elevations with the condition that the siding be smooth, unbeaded, and installed with a reveal consistent with the historic reveal. Staff recommends approval of the proposed paint colors and approval of the removal of the paint on the brick piers with the condition that the paint on the piers shall be removed with non-abrasive cleaners as recommended by the Guidelines (pg. 59, Historic Masonry #1)

The Guidelines note that storm doors shall only be installed if the design allows the original door to show through (pg. 68, #15) and that molded faux panel doors with leaded, beveled or etched glass are not appropriate for the historic district (pg. #14). For these reasons, staff supports the removal of the storm door and

the existing front door as they do not meet the Guidelines noted above. Staff finds the multi-lite wooden door is appropriate for the district as the material and design are consistent with the doors found in the district.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the noted conditions, is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation in Section 30-930.7(b) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines,* specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.