



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, July 24, 2018

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Call to Order

James Klaus, the Chairman, called the July 24th meeting of the Commission of Architectural Review to order at 3:30 pm.

Roll Call

Present -- 6 - * Commissioner David C. Cooley, * Commissioner Sanford Bond, * Commissioner James W. Klaus, * Joseph Yates, * Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

Absent -- 1 - * Commissioner Gerald Jason Hendricks

Approval of Minutes

April 10, 2018 (Quarterly Meeting)

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., seconded by Yates, that the April minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 3 - Commissioner James W. Klaus, Joseph Yates and Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr.

Recused -- 4 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

June 26, 2018

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., seconded by Yates, that the June minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner Sanford Bond

July 10, 2018 (Quarterly Meeting)

The July quarterly minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Jeffries announced that Ms. Carey Jones would be assuming the position of

Secretary to the Commission of Architectural Review. Ms. Jeffries further announced that City Council appointed three new commissioners: Sean Wheeler, Kathleen Morgan, and Lane Pearson.

Noting that staff prepared new administrative guidelines and edits to approved guidelines for the July quarterly meeting, Ms. Jeffries stated that she will continue to update the guidelines with new edits.

Administrative Approvals

Ms. Jeffries announced that staff approved a few permits for larger projects that the Commission had approved. Administrative approvals issued that month were primarily for fences, storm windows, and siding.

Enforcement Report

Ms. Jeffries noted that staff had issued a few citations, anticipating that applications for approval would reach the Commission next month, as a result. Ms. Jeffries further noted that the homeowners of 3422 East Broad Street would be meeting with staff in mid-August to reach a resolution.

Other Committee Reports

There were no other committee reports.

*****Please Note*****

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

CONSENT AGENDA

Chairman James Klaus announced the presence of two items: COA-037944-2018, 106 Shockoe Slip and COA-038275-2018, 2423 East Grace Street on the consent agenda.

The Chairman invited the Commission to suggest projects that they would like to move from the regular agenda to the consent agenda.

a) Mr. Bond made a motion to move the seventh item, COA-037930-2018, 2401 East Broad Street to the consent agenda. Mr. Cooley seconded the motion. The Commission approved moving the item, with only Chairman Klaus opposed.

b) Mr. Bond made a motion to move the ninth item, COA-037932-2018, 2308 Jefferson Avenue to the consent agenda. Mr. Yates seconded the motion. The Commission unanimously approved moving the item.

c) Mr. Bond made a motion to move the 13th item, COA- 038258-2018, 600 North 28th Street to the consent agenda. Mr. Klaus seconded the motion. The Commission unanimously approved moving the item.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment concerning any of the items on the consent agenda.

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that the Consent Agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 1 [COA-037944-2018](#) 106 Shockoe Slip - Convert two existing windows to two double doors in an office building.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner McRoberts, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the reasons cited in the staff report.

- 2 [COA-038275-2018](#) 2423 East Grace Street - Replace front porch roof with a membrane roof.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner McRoberts, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: the membrane roof be black to match the existing roof.

- 7 [COA-037930-2018](#) 2401 East Broad Street - Install a condensing unit on the rear of the actor's studio building, with screening.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner McRoberts, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: the paint color for the enclosure be submitted for administrative review and approval.

- 9 [COA-037932-2018](#) 2308 Jefferson Avenue - Install a fence around a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner McRoberts, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the proposed Option 2 be installed; the spacing between the

palings not exceed 3/4 inches; the paint or opaque stain color for the front portion of the fence be submitted for administrative review and approval.

- 13 [COA-038258-2018](#) 600 North 28th Street - Amend previously approved plans for a new single family home to alter the foundation material and basement windows.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner McRoberts, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the reasons cited in the staff report.

REGULAR AGENDA

- 3 [COA-037934-2018](#) 523 North 29th Street - Replace two doors and remove a door opening on a side porch.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Staff recommended approval of the proposed door replacement with the condition that the applicant submit additional photographs that demonstrate that the existing door is beyond repair.

The applicant, Connor O'Callaghan, presented photos to the Commission to demonstrate that the existing door is beyond repair and to show the image of the door that he proposes as a replacement.

Mr. Cooley asked the applicant if the door that he proposes as a replacement is a fixed, closed, period-appropriate door on the first floor. Mr. O'Callaghan confirmed that the door fits the above criteria.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Commissioners stated that the applicant's plans looked good and that the applicant agreed to abide by the Commission's requirements.

A motion was made by Commissioner Bond, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be partially approved as presented for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission denied the proposed removal of the first floor door to allow the opening to be closed only on the interior, maintaining the exterior appearance of the opening. The Commission approved the proposed installation of three salvaged doors for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: additional photographs that demonstrate the existing door is beyond repair be submitted to staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 4 [COA-037939-2018](#) 1609 West Grace Street - Replace 11 wood windows on the facade of a home with new cellular composite windows.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Staff recommended denial of the proposed window replacement, because staff did not recognize the windows as being beyond repair while the proposed cellular composite windows did not match the appearance of the existing windows.

The applicant, Eli Holi, insisted that although the windows may appear from the exterior to be in standing form, the windows are, in fact, internally non-functional. Mr. Holi claimed that when he tries to open the windows, the sashes come apart from the actual frame. He further stated that he had more pictures that would show the non-functional nature of the windows, suggesting that the use of the current windows presents a safety concern.

Chairman Klaus asked Mr. Holi if he consulted with a window restoration company. Mr. Holi explained that the contractors at the company that he consulted informed him that they would be unable to commit to repairing the windows without replacing them. Mr. Cooley insisted that, as a contractor, he can validate that the applicant's windows are repairable, adding that contractors often, in their financial self-interest, press for window replacement even when windows are repairable. Therefore, a contractor's reluctance to replace windows does not indicate that the windows are irreparable.

Chairman Klaus further added that since the proposed cellular composite windows contain materials that fail to match the materials used on the existing windows, the difference, if the windows were to be replaced, would definitely be noticeable.

Mrs. Holi asked the Commissioners if they ever consider the cost that the applicant would incur to repair windows before they require an applicant to repair, rather than replace, windows. Commissioners admitted that in order to preserve historic homes, they need to require that windows remain for as long as they can possibly be repaired, even if repairing the windows is more expensive for the applicant than replacing them would be. Chairman Klaus explained that the Commission receives frequent requests to replace windows and consistently prohibits, consistent with Commission guidelines, applicants from replacing repairable windows, even if many applicants find replacement cheaper and much more convenient. The Chairman recommended that the applicant reach out to multiple contractors and even have contractors bid against one another to find a contractor that can feasibly repair the windows. Chairman Klaus further advised the applicant that additional Commission approval will only be necessary at a future date if the applicant cannot repair certain windows, and if so, the applicant should present the Commission with a letter from a contractor that explains why the windows would be irreparable.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he called the question.

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., seconded by Commissioner Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be denied for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

5 [COA-037936-2018](#) 813 North 24th Street - Construct a new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Staff recommended that the TPO noted in the application or flat lock metal be used on the front porch roof, rather than the standing seam metal noted on the plans.

The applicant, Aaron Ogburn, stated that the staff report was reasonable. Addressing Chairman Klaus's concern about the proposed windows, Mr. Ogburn noted that the proposed PVC windows are identical to the windows on the house next to the proposed project, suggesting that the windows are not foreign or unprecedented in the historic area.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Both Chairman Klaus and Mr. Cooley expressed concern that allowing the applicant to construct a home with the proposed PVC windows would create a slippery slope where more applicants would justify the addition of vinyl windows into a historic district. Because the Commission's guidelines strongly oppose the addition of vinyl windows into a historic district, the Commission would undermine its guidelines if the Commission allowed the applicant to include even a potentially more attractive set of PVC windows. Aside from the concern with the proposed PVC windows, the Commissioners expressed their approval of the remainder of the applicant's design.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the windows be wood or aluminum clad wood; column details be submitted to staff for administrative review; and the TPO noted in the application or flat lock metal be used on the front porch roof, rather than the standing seam metal noted on the plans. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

6 [COA-037946-2018](#) 3309 Monument Avenue - Demolish an existing porch and sunroom to construct a rear addition; construct a two-car garage in the rear.

Attachments: [Application and Plans \(7/24/2018\)](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report \(7/24/2018\)](#)

[Application and Plans \(08/28/2018\)](#)

[Staff Report \(08/28/2018\)](#)

Staff recommended approval of the proposed demolition; that the siding be smooth and without a bead and that colors be submitted for administrative review and approval; that

the double hung windows in the addition be 6/6 with true or simulated divided lites with a spacer bar between the glass; that the exterior jambs of the two fixed windows align with those of the windows above on the side elevations; that the entire structure be painted or opaquely stained a neutral color to be administratively approved; and that details of the proposed garage doors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

The applicant, Kim Cho, explained the general concept of the proposed construction was designed but admitted that she did not have a defined, detailed plan of the materials that she would like to use and the floor plan of the construction. Mr. Yates added that he does not believe that the Commission could ever approve large, fixed glass windows on a residential property. Chairman Klaus and Mr. Yates both emphasized that Ms. Cho should return to the Commission after she has a better idea of what she will be doing with more accurate, detailed drawings.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Commissioners agreed that the application should be deferred until Ms. Cho can provide more detail.

A motion was made by Yates, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to provide more detailed plans. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

10 [COA-037911-2018](#) 2411 M Street - Construct a two-story mixed use building on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Staff recommended that consideration be given to allowing for the introduction of additional doors on the Jefferson Avenue elevation by creating breaks in the wall below the storefront; that window material and light configuration be clarified and administratively approved by staff; and that final material selections, especially brick colors, be submitted to staff for review and administrative approval.

The applicant, Todd Dykshorn, confirmed that access to individuals with disabilities is off of M Street. He further noted that the windows would be two over two. Mr. Yates asked if the applicant had thought about the brick coloring. The applicant affirmed that there is a sample at the office that he has been working around, but he admits that he would aim for a more contemporary image. The applicant further stated that he would be glad to get all of the samples out. Mr. Cooley asked the applicant if there were three or four parking spaces before to gauge how many the applicant would propose. Mr. Dykshorn clarified that there were six parking spaces before but noted that there are 21 on-street parking spaces in the area. Mr. Dykshorn further clarified that he would keep the parapet while still dropping it on 24th and M to give a little bit of distinction to the corners and would, additionally, have no deck on the roof.

Nancy Lambert expressed her support for the application, considering it an improvement to the neighborhood.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Commissioners expressed their support for the application.

A motion was made by Commissioner Bond, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: consideration be given to allow for the introduction of additional doors on the Jefferson Avenue elevation by creating breaks in the wall below the storefront so that it can be easily removed and doors installed; the window material and light configuration be clarified and submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; and final material selections, especially brick colors, be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 11 [COA-037931-2018](#) 1816 West Grace Street - Paint the facade of a previously painted brick home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Staff recommended denial of the proposed sage green color that the applicant wishes to use to paint the home, since it would not be a natural brick color. Staff further recommended that the applicant paint the home the same color that it is currently painted without prior review or approval or can paint the home a color from the paint palette that can be administratively reviewed and approved.

The applicant, Randolph Jefferson, stated that he did look at the suggested brick colors but was not particularly drawn to any of them. Mr. Jefferson suggested that the color that he picked is compatible with the diversity of house paint colors in the area.

Chairman Klaus explained that the paint color does not need to be identical to the paint palette and need only be within a range of colors suitable to a brick home. Sage green is not a traditional brick color. Mr. Jefferson conceded that he is open to considering alternative paint colors that staff could approve.

The Chairman asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Commissioners agreed that if the applicant can find a color within the paint palette, staff would be able to administratively approve the paint color without requiring the applicant to return to a future Commission meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., seconded by Yates, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be denied for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 12 [COA-036774-2018](#) 3408 East Broad Street - Construct a new single family dwelling on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application and Plans \(6/26/2018\)](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report \(6/26/2018\)](#)

[Application and Plans \(7/24/2018\)](#)

[Staff Report \(7/24/2018\)](#)

Staff recommended that a siding color that closely matches the brick color be used and that a brick sample and siding color be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

As black is not a color recommended for trim on the Commission's paint palette, staff further recommended that the applicant use a color that would be consistent with the palette. Details of the proposed lattice should, also, be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

Josh Pardue, the applicant, expressed that he had put forth his best effort to incorporate the Commission's recommendations into his design and remained eager to obtain the Commission's approval for the application. Alex and Josh Pardue confirmed that they accepted staff recommendations, in general, but admitted that they preferred black trim even though they were willing to adapt to colors that staff would prefer, if necessary.

Mr. Yates suggested that the second floor windows on the façade should be lowered six inches. Mr. Yates further stated, however, that the applicants had done a good job with converting their home's design to a contemporary style.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Mr. Yates restated his appreciation for the applicants' adaptation to a contemporary approach, expressed support for staff recommendations, and conceded that although he would like the window heads to align, he will not aggressively insist on the alignment.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: a siding color closely matching the brick color be used; a brick sample and siding color be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; details of the proposed lattice be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the second floor windows on the façade be lowered to align with the structure to the east; the third story railing design be modified to create even spacing between the posts; and the spacing of the brick piers of the front porch be modified to appear more symmetrical. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner Sanford Bond, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 8 [COA-037947-2018](#) 514 West 19th Street - Amend previously approved rehabilitation plans to alter the front and rear porches and a window on the side elevation.

Attachments: Application and Plans

Site Map

Staff Report

Staff recommended approval of the proposed rear porch roof with the condition that the porch posts be painted or stained a neutral color. Staff further recommended denial of the new front porch design, approval of the proposed changes to the siding, denial of the proposed alteration to the historic window, and approval of the proposed removal of the window from the design.

The applicant, Chad White, presented the Commission with a few pictures of front porches in the historic neighborhood. Mr. White, also, affirmed his general support for staff recommendations but expressed a desire for certain modifications. He proposed bringing the brick column back up thirty inches above the porch decking to substantiate the design and return it to the original configuration. The window in the kitchen, he added, is barely visible from the street, and he suggested replacing this window with a new aluminum clad window.

Chairman Klaus stated that applicants can make changes to their home's interior without the Commission's approval, and he encouraged Mr. White to make internal changes, if making those internal changes would prevent him from making external changes to the home. Mr. Yates emphasized that the Commission guidelines, generally, strongly discourage the replacement of windows, unless the window replacement is functionally necessary. Mr. White admitted that his desire to replace the window is partially motivated by the cost of window rehabilitation being equal to the cost of window replacement.

The Chairman asked if there was any public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. The Commission expressed support for Mr. White's proposed porch alterations, but both Mr. Yates and Mr. Cooley asserted that the Commission cannot support window replacement when it is functionally unnecessary.

A motion was made by Commissioner Klaus, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be partially approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission denied the proposed window replacement on the side elevation for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission approved the proposed front porch design based on the physical evidence presented provided that the following condition is met: the wood posts be square, and a detail be provided to staff for administrative review. The Commission approved the proposed alterations to the rear porch and rear window for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the porch posts be painted or stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure. The Commission approved the proposed wood siding for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Commissioner James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts, Joseph Yates, Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Sanford Bond

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- 14 [COA-037950-2018](#) 514 North 26th Street - Construct a new single family home on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Staff recommended that a square post be used, rather than the round posts shown in the renderings.

The applicant, Maria Lyn McGinnis, stated that her goal is to be as consistent as possible, but she voiced her support for the staff recommendation that square posts be used. Chairman Klaus stated that Ms. McGinnis had done a good job with the design, and he further emphasized that since the Commission is more lenient with new construction than it is with existing historic structures, Ms. McGinnis would not be required to construct a home that is an exact replica of historic homes in the area. Ms. McGinnis conceded that she just wishes to construct an exterior that the Commission can approve and is personally more concerned with the internal appearance of the home.

Chairman Klaus advised Ms. McGinnis to know the materials that she will be using to construct the home and present the Commission with a context drawing when she appears before the Commission for final review; he further suggested that the construction could benefit from another window on the first floor of the rear elevation. Mr. Yates cautioned Ms. McGinnis to make absolutely sure that the roof tresses will work as shown to ensure that she ends up with the correct distance between the head height of the windows and the bottom of the cornice. Mr. Cooley further cautioned the applicant to ensure that the construction prevent the roof from sagging and holding water.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed.

Adjournment

Chairman Klaus adjourned the meeting at 6:15 p.m.