



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

3.COA-156665-2024	Final Review	Meeting Date: 11/26/2024
Applicant/Petitioner	Robert Carrel	
Project Description	Remove two windows and two doors on the first story and install a wide glass door.	
Project Location		
Address: 2209 East Broad Street		
Historic District: St. John's Church		
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <p>The applicant request approval for exterior alterations to a brick, Greek Revival Style dwelling otherwise known as the Miles Turpin House circa 1861.</p> <p>The applicant requests approval to alter the fenestration of the west elevation of a rear projecting wing, removing two doors and two windows on the first floor and installing a large patio door.</p> <p>This alteration will be minimally visible from the public right of way.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Deferral	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov, (804) 646-6569	
Previous Reviews	None.	
Conditions for Approval	<p>Staff recommends deferral of the application.</p> <p><i>If the Commission defers the application,</i> Staff recommends that a design that retains or references the existing masonry openings be submitted for review.</p> <p><i>If the Commission finds that the application may be approved given the limited visibility of the proposed work,</i> Staff recommends that the applicant submit the final window specifications for administrative review and approval. Staff would also recommend that the windows be installed in a way that does as little damage to historic material as possible.</p>	

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Building Elements, Windows, pg. 69.	<p>5. Original masonry openings for doors and windows should be maintained. Infilling original masonry openings is strongly discouraged.</p> <p>8. The number, location, size or glazing pattern of windows should not be changed by cutting new openings, blocking out windows or by installing replacement sash that do not fit the original window. Changes to existing windows or the addition of new windows along a secondary elevation will be considered by the Commission on a case-by-case basis.</p> <p>10. The architectural appearance of original windows should be used as a model for new windows. Changes in the sash, depth or reveal, muntin configuration, frame or glazing is strongly discouraged. New glass should not be tinted or receive reflective coatings.</p>	<p>The applicant proposes to alter the first floor of the west elevation of a two-story rear wing of the building. This elevation features a two-story covered porch with square posts and Richmond Rail. Windows are six-over-six and the doors feature transom windows above them. The windows and doors are vertically aligned.</p> <p>This portion of the building is documented as being a service building to the main house, and the configuration of this rear wing creates a courtyard. The dwelling is identical to 2215 East Broad Street, the William J. Yarbrough House, which was constructed at the same time, Yarbrough being the business partner of Turpin.</p> <p>The applicant proposes to remove two windows and two doors on the northmost portion of the wing's first floor and to install a grouping of full-light glass, patio doors.</p> <p>This area is beneath a rear side covered porch and is minimally visible from the public right of way due to screening from existing foliage, walls, and auxiliary buildings.</p> <p>Staff finds that the alterations proposed to the fenestration of the first floor of the rear wing will have a detrimental impact on the historic integrity of the building. The vertically aligned windows and doors will be altered in a way that would no longer portray the building's significance as service quarters.</p> <p>After several site visits, Staff has determined that this alteration may be minimally visible from the public right-of-way, but not completely. Most of the screening was from evergreen trees.</p>
Building Elements, Porches, Entrances & Doors, Entrance and Porch Removal, Replacement and Reconstruction pg. 71	<p>4. Do not remove or radically change entrances and porches important in defining the building's overall historic character.</p> <p>8. Do not strip entrances and porches of historic material and details that should be retained in any repair or partial replacement.</p> <p>14. Do not remove original doors and door surrounds and color should match the original door.</p>	<p>The doors and windows proposed for removal are likely original to the building.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends deferral of the application.</u></p> <p><u>If the Commission defers the application, Staff recommends that a design that retains or references the existing masonry openings be submitted for review.</u></p> <p><u>If the Commission finds that the application may be approved given the limited visibility of the proposed work, Staff recommends that the applicant submit the final window specifications for administrative review and approval. Staff would also recommend that the windows be installed in a way that does as little damage to historic material as possible.</u></p>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures (next page)

Figure 1. View from rear alley. Screening from Fence, Carriage House, and evergreen tree.



Figure 2. View from rear alley. Screening from Fence, Carriage House, and evergreen tree



Figure 3. View from North 22nd Street.

