

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
June 23, 2015 Meeting**

12. **CAR No. 15-016** (J. Ogrodnik)

**713 North 24th Street
Union Hill Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Rehabilitate home to include front porch repair and installation of new windows, doors, siding, and side and rear decks**

Staff Contact: **W. Palmquist**

The applicant requests approval for rehabilitation work proposed on the exterior of this structure in the Union Hill Old and Historic District. The application was initially the result of enforcement activity and was deferred at the February 2015 Commission meeting. Meeting minutes from that meeting are included for reference. The applicant has proposed several modifications to the application to address the concerns of the Commission.

The applicant is seeking to rehabilitate the structure, taking cues and direction from the attached, neighboring house at 715 N. 24th Street. The applicant is proposing doors and windows to replace the ones currently installed, installing front steps and handrails, installing a rear privacy fence, replacing the deteriorated siding with beaded HardiPlank siding, replacing the deteriorated front porch roof, replacing deteriorated wood with in-kind materials, and constructing a covered deck on the sides and rear of the structure. Following is a detail of each work item.

Front, rear, and side doors

The front and rear doors have been replaced with molded faux paneled doors with upper lights. The doors do not properly fit the openings and the transom has been omitted from the front entrance. Documentation of the original doors could not be found, all images from 2007 forward show the openings boarded. The applicant is proposing to install a "Rustic Mahogany" front door instead, as well as six-lite, two-paneled wood doors at the side and rear. Staff recommends that the proposed front door be replaced with a simpler, wood, paneled door and that the transom window be restored in the opening above.

Front and rear windows

The front and rear windows have been replaced with 1/1, Pella ThermaStar vinyl windows. Some of the windows are not appropriately sized for the historic rough openings. The windows have been removed from openings on the south and east elevations, the rough openings framed to receive new windows and boarded. The applicant is instead proposing to install 6/6 wood, double-hung windows which would be 30 ½" X 53 ½" to match the windows of the neighboring property. The spec sheet of the windows state that they have "grid between the glass." Staff recommends that the windows have true or simulated-divided lites instead of grid-between-the-glass.

Installation of front steps, handrails, and railings

The applicant proposes installing front steps and handrails, as well as new front porch railings. The applicant appears to be proposing wooden, Richmond-style railings, but has not provided details or accurate drawings of these elements. Staff recommends that the applicant provide staff with details and drawings of these elements to receive administrative approval.

Rear Privacy Fence

The applicant proposes installing a privacy fence in the rear yard. Staff recommends that the applicant have staff review the fence placement, design, and paint or opaque stain color for administrative approval.

Installation of HardiPlank siding

The applicant proposes replacing the deteriorated wood siding with HardiPlank beaded siding. The *Guidelines* do provide for the use of fiber cement siding, as cited on page 56, so long as the finish is smooth, with no faux wood grain or beading. Staff recommends that smooth HardiPlank, with no beading, be installed on the sides and rear of the structure, and that wood siding be salvaged from the structure to be installed on the front elevation of the structure.

Replacement of front porch roof

The existing front porch roof at the property is a severely deteriorated standing seam metal roof. The applicant is proposing to replace this with rib steel panels which is not an appropriate in-kind replacement for a standing seam metal roof. The *Guidelines* state that, "pre-fabricated and pre-finished metal roofs typically have ridge and valley pieces that are installed on top of the seams, creating visible shadow lines not typical of historic buildings. These prefabricated metal roof systems are particularly inappropriate on historic front porches" (p. 62 #6). Therefore, staff would recommend that the front porch roof be replaced with a standing seam metal roof, or in the absence of the availability of such a roof, a black membrane roof be installed instead.

Repair and In-Kind Replacement of Front Porch

The applicant proposes to repair and replace in-kind missing and damaged elements of the front porch. This work as proposed is compatible with the Standards for Rehabilitation found on page 55 and the Design Guidelines for Porches, entrances and Doors found on page 67 of the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* which emphasizes the retention and repair of historic materials.

Painting of structure

The applicant states that the structure will be painted a color consistent with the CAR Paint Color Palette, and that all trim will be painted white. Staff recommends that the applicant seek administrative review and approval of any proposed paint colors.

Construction of a covered side and rear deck

The applicant proposes to construct a new side and rear deck which would be covered by rib steel panel roofing. The side deck is proposed to be 3' wide and

25' long, while the rear deck is proposed to be 4'-8" deep and 12' wide. The deck would be 3' from the ground, and roof would be 8'-6" high as measured from the height of the deck. Staff recommends that the applicant provide additional drawings of the proposed deck and roof structure, as only a description and plan drawing of the deck are provided. As outlined in the CAR Application Submission Requirements document, new porches and decks require plans including footprint dimensions, construction details, and elevations showing screening, stairs, and railings.

Staff recommends partial approval of the project with conditions. The proposed work appears mostly consistent with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*. Staff recommends that approval of the project, except for the proposed side and rear deck, with the following conditions:

- That the proposed front door be replaced with a simpler, wood paneled door and that the transom window be restored in the opening above.
- That the proposed windows have true or simulated-divided lites instead of grid-between-the-glass.
- That the applicant provide staff with details and drawings of the proposed steps, handrails, and front porch railings for administrative approval.
- That the applicant have staff review the privacy fence placement, design, and paint or opaque stain color for administrative approval.
- That smooth HardiPlank, with no beading be installed on the sides and rear of the structure, and that wood siding be salvaged from the structure to be installed on the front elevation of the structure.
- That the front porch roof be replaced with a standing seam metal roof, or in the absence of the availability of such a roof, a black membrane roof be installed instead.
- That the applicant seek administrative review and approval for the proposed painting scheme.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is partially consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(b) of the City Code and with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.