

City of Richmond

*City Hall
900 East Broad Street*



Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, September 24, 2024

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Commission of Architectural Review

[PDRPRES 2024.054](#) Public Access and Participation Instructions - Commission of Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW.pdf](#)

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:30pm

Roll Call

Present -- 8 - * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, * Commissioner Andrew Moore, * Commissioner Mitch Danese, * Commissioner Larry Nutt, * Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, * Commissioner Erik Bootsma, * Commissioner Emily Striffler and * Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

Absent -- 1 - * Commissioner John Grier

Approval of Minutes

No minutes were approved at this meeting.

Secretary’s Report

Administrative Approval Report

Enforcement Report

CONSENT AGENDA

- 1. [COA-153793-2024](#) 2120 M Street - Construct a shed in a rear yard.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt , seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: that the applicant’s proposed fiber cement siding be smooth, not beaded. and installed with a reveal consistent with the historic reveal.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

- 2. [COA-153862-2024](#) 111 Pulliam Street - Replace rear deck with proposed custom 7' x 18' wood deck.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt , seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: that proposed deck be painted or stained a neutral color that complements one or more of the colors found on the main structure and that the applicant abide by all applicable zoning regulations.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

- 3. [COA-153769-2024](#) 2711 East Clay Street - Replace aluminum siding with fiber cement siding on a secondary elevation.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt , seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: that should fiber cement siding be installed on the East side that the siding be smooth, not beaded. and installed with a reveal consistent with the historic reveal, that final proposed paint color be submitted for administrative review and approval, and that staff recommends against the implementation of PVC corners and rakes, in favor of a paintable composite trim alternative.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

- 6. [COA-153782-2024](#) 6 North Arthur Ashe Boulevard - Construct a third-story rear addition.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Nutt, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve this application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided the following conditions are met: that the proposed cornice details on the sides and rear of the building be removed from the design, and that no new decorative trim or molding be added to the exterior of the building; that any new electrical or mechanical equipment be located adjacent to a secondary elevation and be screened from view of the street and alley.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

REGULAR AGENDA

4. [COA-153788-2024](#) 817 North 22nd Street - Construct two new, attached, three-story dwellings.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

In addition to the staff recommendations listed in the staff report, below is a summary of the Commission's recommendations:

- Some commissioners were supportive of the overall design; however, felt that there were major details not included, including trim and molding details as well as a context elevation.
- The commission would like to see a height comparison to other historic buildings nearby to better understand how the new construction will relate.
- Consider moving the entrances to the sides of the dwellings and opening up the corners to have a small porch.
- Consider adding a trim piece/gable end on side elevation to make the third floor look like a true gable that has been "bumped out" off the rear.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hill, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve this application with staff conditions. The motion was withdrawn by the mover and seconder due to lack of support.

A motion was made by Commissioner Bootsma , seconded by Commissioner Nutt, to defer this application.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

5. [COA-153790-2024](#) 2201 Venable Street - Construct a new, three-story dwelling

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Bootsma , seconded by Commissioner Striffler, to defer this application in order to allow the applicant additional time to revise the plans to reflect the following recommendations of Staff and the Commission: Staff recommends that the design of the chamfered corner be further studied and revised to incorporate more transparent and human scale elements that relate to the context of the surrounding district; If greater transparency is not provided at the ground floor, Staff recommends that the setback for the new dwelling be like that of the existing residential properties

along Venable Street; Staff recommends that the facade roof terrace be removed from the design of the building; Staff recommends that the downspouts be round. Staff recommends that gutter and downspout specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval; Staff recommends that details on any proposed fencing be submitted for Administrative Review.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Larry Nutt, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling_

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

7. [COA-153792-2024](#) 2120 M Street - Construct an accessory dwelling unit in a rear yard.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Conceptual

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. A recording of the meeting is available at the following link: [City of Richmond - Meeting of Commission of Architectural Review on 9/24/2024 at 3:30 PM \(legistar.com\)](#)

In addition to the staff recommendations listed in the staff report, below is a summary of the Commission's recommendations:

- Consider mimicking some of the primary buildings front porch detailing on the ADU's porch.
- Consider the feasibility of asphalt shingles on the roof of the ADU. The slope of roof could cause potential issues with water runoff.
- Consider a hipped roof on the ADU rather than the proposed shallow gable.
- Could increase the pitch of the ADU's proposed gable roof.
- Could use either the proposed pine siding, or a composite, fiber cement siding with a smooth finish could be acceptable.
- Stay away from K-Style gutter. A square or half-round gutter could be more appropriate.

8. [COA-153810-2024](#) 2108.5 East Broad Street - Construct a new single-family dwelling.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. A recording of the meeting is available at the following link: [City of Richmond - Meeting of Commission of Architectural Review on 9/24/2024 at 3:30 PM \(legistar.com\)](#)

In addition to the staff recommendations listed in the staff report, below is a summary of the Commission's recommendations:

- Consider adding more dimension to the cornice to ensure that it doesn't appear to be flat.

- The Commission liked the use of material and the contemporary design of the side and rear elevations.
- Consider the type of brick used for foundation. What type is most compatible with the district?
- The Commission appreciated the completeness of the application.
- Consider the width of the front porch brick piers. Be sure they are properly dimensioned and do not appear too thin.

9. [COA-153783-2024](#) 401 West Marshall Street - Construct a new three-story multi-family building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. A recording of the meeting is available at the following link: [City of Richmond - Meeting of Commission of Architectural Review on 9/24/2024 at 3:30 PM \(legistar.com\)](#)

In addition to the staff recommendations listed in the staff report, below is a summary of the Commission's recommendations:

- Demonstrate the plan for the location of trash and its screening.
- Consider rearranging the interior of the building to bring the façade of the building closer into alignment with the historic buildings on the block.
- Consider an uncovered porch on the third-story façade.
- Present a more cohesive application at the final review and ensure that there are not any discrepancies between the plans, site plan, and renderings.
- 207-209 E. Leigh Street is a good example of this building typology in Jackson Ward. Could be used as reference.
- The Commission was not concerned with lot width.

10. [COA-153811-2024](#) 1906, 1908, 1910 East Broad Street - Construct a new five story multi-family building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The Commission reviewed this application in an advisory capacity. A recording of the meeting is available at the following link: [City of Richmond - Meeting of Commission of Architectural Review on 9/24/2024 at 3:30 PM \(legistar.com\)](#)

In addition to the staff recommendations listed in the staff report, below is a summary of the Commission's recommendations:

- The scale of the building may be inappropriate, consider reducing the scale.
- The building should be articulated well to better reflect the context of the Shockoe Valley COHD.
- Concerned about the garage openings onto E. Broad Street. Doesn't promote pedestrian activity.
- Could there be a buffer of trees or open space between the rear of Elm Tree Row and the new building?
- Most successful, large infill in the district has been brick and simple in design to reflect the design and massing of the historic industrial/warehouse buildings.
- Consider the private spaces that are being impacted by the development.
- The Commission liked the subtle stepped parapet on the façade.

Adjournment

The Meeting was adjourned at 6:28pm