COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STAFF REPORT February 27, 2018 Meeting

8. **COA-029601-2018** (A. Johnson IV)

100 East Leigh Street
Jackson Ward Old and Historic District

Project Description: Replace eleven windows.

Staff Contact: C. Jeffries

The applicant requests approval to replace eleven windows on the front and side of a single family structure in the Jackson Ward Old and Historic District. This application is the result of enforcement activity as the applicant replaced the windows with vinyl windows without obtaining approval from the Commission of Architectural Review. A building permit was also not obtained for the work.

The applicant replaced the windows on the facade which were 1/1 replacement windows installed sometime prior to 2011 with 1/1 vinyl windows to fit the existing openings. Based on photographic evidence, the windows on the façade were 1/1 wood with ogee lugs. In addition, one original window, located beside the front door, remains and is a 1/1 wood window with ogee lugs.



Virginia DHR Survey, 1987

On the side elevation, visible from North 1st Street, the applicant replaced two 6/6 wood windows (windows 10 and 11) with 6/6 grid-between-glass vinyl windows and two 2/2 wood windows (windows 8 and 9) with 12/12 grid-between-glass vinyl windows. The remaining windows on the side and rear elevations were replaced sometime prior to 2011 and are not part of this review. With this application, the applicant is requesting to maintain all of the currently installed windows.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. The Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines state that all original windows should be retained and repaired and should only be replaced when the windows have deteriorated beyond the point of repair (pg. 65, #1, 6, 7). Staff was unable to determine the condition of the existing windows as they were removed without CAR approval. Though the Guidelines note that when replacing elements, the replacement should match the original in appearance, the Guidelines specify that vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic buildings in historic districts (pg. 65, #11). Therefore staff cannot recommend the approval of the installation of vinyl windows that are visible from the public right of way on this historic structure. Additionally, staff does not consider the grid-betweenglass windows as effectively conveying the appearance of the original true divided lite windows without the presence of interior and exterior muntins. Staff recommends approval of the replacement of the eleven windows with the condition that the currently installed windows be replaced with new wood or aluminum clad wood windows. Staff also recommends that Windows 8, 9, 10 and 11 match the historic lite configuration with true or simulated divided lites with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar and the replacement windows on the front façade be 1/1 with ogee lugs to match the historic windows.

It is the assessment of staff that the application is consistent, with the noted conditions, with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Sections 30-930.7(b) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.