

14. COA-070155-2020

PUBLIC HEARING DATE

April 28, 2020

PROPERTY ADDRESS

3629 East Broad Street

DISTRICT

Chimborazo Park

APPLICANT

Center Creek Homes

STAFF CONTACT

C. Jones

Commission of
Architectural Review

STAFF REPORT



PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Construct two new, single-family detached residences.

PROJECT DETAILS

- The applicant proposes to construct two new, single-family houses on a lot to be created through a subdivision. The proposed new house numbers are 3631 and 3633 East Broad Street.
- Each of the houses will be two bays wide, two stories tall, and 2,280 square feet in size, with a rear walkout basement.
- The house proposed at 3631 East Broad has a one-story, full-width front porch, dark windows and metal roofing, minimal trim profiles, and a metal porch with horizontal elements. Fenestration includes a vertical bay of paired windows and a bay with a single door and window.
- The house proposed at 3633 East Broad has a shallow projecting bay with paired windows, and a single door with cantilevered front entry canopy and a single bay above it.

Primary exterior materials include: smooth fiber cement lap siding with a 6" reveal; 1/1 painted or aluminum double-hung windows, painted trim, and pre-finished aluminum standing seam metal roofing. The basement walls are proposed as brick-form concrete with a dark painted finish.



The City of Richmond assumes no liability either for any errors, omissions, or inaccuracies in the information provided regardless of the cause of such or for any decision made, action taken, or action not taken by the user in reliance upon any maps or information provided herein.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

The applicant is seeking **Conceptual Review** for this project. Conceptual review is covered under Sec. 30-930.6(d) of the City Code: The commission shall review and discuss the proposal with the applicant and make any necessary recommendations. Such Conceptual Review shall be advisory only. Commission staff reviewed the project through the lens of the "Standards for New Construction" on pages 44, and 46-56 of the Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines utilizing the Guidelines presented below.

PREVIOUS REVIEWS

The Commission has previously reviewed construction of a new, single-family house submitted by a previous applicant. The Commission has not previously reviewed this application.

SURROUNDING CONTEXT

The proposed new construction is located at the northern terminus of East Broad Street. East of the project site

is a wooded area. Immediately to the west, at 3629 East Broad, is a two-story brick double house with a false mansard roof. Directly across the street, on the north side of East Broad, is a large modern apartment development. The majority of the houses on this terminus block of Broad Street are frame with a mixture of shed and false mansard roofs. Most are two stories in height and three bays wide with one-story, full-width porches. There is a mix of historic houses and new construction, though with the exception of the apartment development, they all maintain a consistent streetscape.

STAFF COMMENTS

Staff recommends that:

- the door opening on the proposed façade at 3633 be relocated to the other bay to create a pattern and depth that is consistent with the neighboring properties.
- on the façade of 3633, the window sill and head heights be horizontally aligned
- the first floor windows should be taller than the second story windows; staff requests a detailed window and door schedule be provided for final review
- the applicant utilize a flat-lock metal roof for the front porch
- the applicant relocate the downspout to the side of the column so that it is less visibly intrusive

STAFF ANALYSIS

Siting, pg. 46, #s2-3	<i>2. New residential infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns of the surrounding block. The minimum setbacks evident in most districts reinforce the traditional street wall.</i>	Based on the site plan submitted by the applicant, it appears the houses will have a similar setback to the house at 3629 East Broad Street.
	<i>3. New buildings should face the most prominent street bordering the site.</i>	The proposed new houses will both face East Broad Street, the only street bordering the site.
Form, pg. 46 #s1-3	<i>1. New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the historic district.</i>	The applicant proposes two, rectangular-shaped single family dwellings. Both houses will be two bays wide and staff notes that the majority of the houses on the block have a three-bay form – though staff notes that the semi-attached residential buildings at 3629 E Broad Street have the same fenestration and numbers of bays as the proposed new construction.
	<i>2. New residential construction should maintain the existing human scale of nearby historic residential construction in the district.</i>	The proposed houses are two stories in height, in keeping with the surrounding properties. Staff further notes that the site is sloped and, based on the context elevation, the houses will be lower in height than those in the surrounding area.
	<i>3. New residential construction and additions should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps into their design.</i>	The house proposed at 3631 has a one-story full-width porch and front stairs similar to other houses on the block. It will also have a subtle cornice line. The house proposed at 3633 has a shallow projecting bay and a canopy above the single entrance door. It will have a solid band as a simplified cornice line. Staff notes that the entrance porch is shallower than the neighboring properties and suggests that the door opening could be relocated to the other

bay to create a pattern and depth that is consistent with the neighboring properties.

Both houses will have front steps as part of their design.

Height, Width, Proportion, & Massing, pg. 47, #s1-3

1. New residential construction should respect the typical height of surrounding residential buildings.

The houses proposed at 3631 and 3633 will be 27'-6" and 26'-5" above grade. According to the context elevation, the neighboring house at 3629 is 28'-5" above grade. As noted above, the site slopes down to the east.

2. New residential construction should respect the vertical orientation typical of other residential properties in surrounding historic districts.

Both proposed houses have vertically aligned fenestration patterns on the façade, side, and rear elevations.

Staff recommends that on the façade of 3633 the window sill and head heights be horizontally aligned.

Staff recommends the first floor windows should be taller than the second story windows and requests a detailed window and door schedule be provided for final review.

3. The cornice height should be compatible with that of adjacent historic buildings.

The cornice height at 3631 will be lower than the neighboring building. The simplified cornice line at 3633 will be between 3629 and 3631.

Materials and Colors, pg. 47, #s2-4

2. Materials used in new residential construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district.

For the house at 3631, the applicant proposes a shed roof covered in TPO with a false mansard covered in black standing seam metal. The siding is proposed to be fiber cement lap siding, white, with white trim pieces. The foundation will be brick pattern concrete painted dark grey or black. The windows will be clad wood in black with white trim. The porch roof will have the same roof as the main porch, square white columns with a recess, and a black horizontal steel railing.

3. Paint colors used should be similar to the historically appropriate colors already found in the district.

4. Vinyl, asphalt, and aluminum siding are not permitted for use in City Old and Historic Districts. Other synthetic siding materials with a smooth, untextured finish may be allowed in limited cases, but approval by the Commission is always required.

The house proposed for 3633 will have a shallow sloped roof covered in white TPO, dark blue lap siding, and a dark grey/black brick pattern concrete foundation. The windows will be clad wood, painted white (no trim). Decorative details include hardi flat panels in grey and a metal canopy in bronze.

New Construction, Porches and Porch Details, pg. 49, #5

Porch roofs are encouraged to utilize standing- or flat-lock metal seam roofs that are hand-seamed, or closely approximate handseaming. Seams that, in section, are large, rectangular seams, reminiscent of pre-formed seams utilized on prefabricated industrial or commercial structures, are not

Staff recommends the applicant utilize a flat-lock metal roof for the porch. Staff also recommends the applicant relocate the downspout to the side of the column so that it is less visibly intrusive.

acceptable. Membrane roofs are acceptable substitutes for flat-lock seamed metal roofs.

Mechanical
Equipment, pg.
68

The visual impact of new mechanical equipment should be minimized to protect the historic character of the district.

The applicant proposes to locate the HVAC equipment between the two houses. The HVAC equipment and trash receptacles will be screened by a four-foot high wood fence.

FIGURES



Figure 1. 3629 East Broad Street and vacant area proposed for new construction.



Figure 2. View of proposed new construction from Government Road.



Figure 3. 3627-3629 E. Broad Street.



Figure 4. 3619-3623 E. Broad Street.



Figure 5. 3614-3616 E. Broad Street.



Figure 6. 3612-3608 E. Broad Street.