



City of Richmond

City Hall
900 East Broad Street

Meeting Minutes - Final Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, April 24, 2018

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

BEGINNING AT 3:30 PM

Call to Order

Ms. Pitts called the April 24th meeting of the Commission of Architectural Review to order at 3:30 pm. The Commission selected Mr. Bond to serve as acting Chair by a majority vote.

Roll Call

Present -- 6 - * David C. Cooley, * Sanford Bond, * Gerald Jason Hendricks, * Neville C. Johnson Jr., * Carey L. Jones and * Ashleigh N. Brewer
Absent -- 3 - * James W. Klaus, * Andrew Ray McRoberts and * Joseph Yates

Approval of Minutes

January 16, 2018 (Quarterly Meeting)

The January quarterly meeting minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

February 27, 2018

The February minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

March 27, 2018

The March minutes will be approved at the next meeting.

Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Pitts announced that the Commission held a quarterly meeting two weeks ago where Mr. Green shared some suggested changes to the guidelines. Ms. Pitts further announced that staff will provide a revised version of the guidelines to Mr. Yates at the next Commission meeting.

Ms. Pitts announced that former Commissioner Bryan Green is being replaced with Ms. Ashleigh Brewer.

Administrative Approvals

Ms. Pitts announced that the building permits have come in for three attached homes on East Franklin Street. Ms. Pitts further noted that building permits have, likewise, come in for work on 36 East Marshall Street and 101 North 29th Street.

Enforcement Report

Ms. Pitts mentioned that little enforcement action had occurred other than staff's decision to respond to complaints as they are received.

Other Committee Reports

Joshua Son, the Secretary to the Urban Design Committee, announced that the signage of Monroe Park had been approved and would be returning for final review in the near future. Mr. Son suggested that signage should be kept off of the structure of the Checker's House and appear as a free-standing donor sign. Mr. Son further announced the approval of the Huguenot Flatwater ADA Ramp that would be up for final review. Mr. Son also noted that Mr. Klaus will replace Mr. Green as cross-over from the Commission of Architectural Review to the Urban Design Committee and will be an active member of the UDC at the UDC's next meeting.

Ms. Chen announced that on next month's agenda there will be a request to remove part of the parcel for the White House of the Confederacy.

Please Note

Public comment on cases brought before the CAR will be heard after the applicant's explanatory remarks of the case and before CAR deliberation. Applicants and individuals wishing to comment on specific aspects of a given case are asked to briefly address issues related to the application.

CONSENT AGENDA

Acting Chairman, Sanford Bond, invited the Commission to suggest projects that they would like to move from the regular agenda to the consent agenda.

- a) Mr. Bond made a motion, seconded by Mr. Johnson, to move the first item, COA-033477-2018, 401 North 27th Street to the consent agenda. The commission approved moving the item.
- b) Mr. Bond made a motion, seconded by Mr. Johnson, to move the second item, COA-033420-2018, 2410-2412 M Street to the consent agenda. The commission approved moving the item.
- c) Mr. Bond made a motion, seconded by Mr. Johnson, to move the third item, COA-033451-2018, 3021 Monument Avenue to the consent agenda. The commission approved moving the item.
- d) Mr. Bond made a motion, seconded by Mr. Cooley, to move the seventh item, COA-033469-2018, 3406 East Broad Street to the consent agenda. The commission approved moving the item.
- e) Mr. Bond made a motion, seconded by Ms. Jones, to move the ninth item, COA-033491-2018, 307 North 28th Street to the consent agenda. The commission approved moving the item. Mr. Cooley recused himself.
- f) Mr. Bond made a motion, seconded by Mr. Johnson to move the thirteenth item, COA-033403-2018, 501 West Broad Street to the consent agenda. The commission approved moving the item. Mr. Hendricks voted against the motion.

Public Comment:

The Chairman asked for public comment on the consent agenda which included items:

COA-033477-2018, 401 North 27th Street; COA-033420-2018, 2410-2412 M Street; COA-033451-2018, 3021 Monument Avenue; COA-033469-2018, 3406 East Broad Street; COA-033491-2018, 307 North 28th Street; and COA-033403-2018, 501 West Broad Street.

Danielle Porter, representing Historic Richmond, expressed her approval of the Commission's work at the Wills Store, which she emphasized is one of the oldest and most significant buildings in Church Hill. Ms. Porter further noted that the building is believed to be the oldest commercial building in Richmond. Ms. Porter announced that she is looking forward to a restored Wills Store and another restaurant to dine in at Church Hill.

Public comment closed.

Ms. Pitts briefly mentioned that item eight, COA-033493 at 2105 East Marshall Street, had been withdrawn from the agenda by the applicant.

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Hendricks, that the Consent Agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

1 [COA-033477-2018](#) 401 North 27th Street - Rehabilitate a mixed use building.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Hendricks, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the paint color for the doors be submitted for administrative review and approval; details of the proposed door be submitted for administrative review and approval; the proposed door design for the East Marshall Street storefront be revised and submitted for administrative review and approval to reflect the photographic evidence in regard to the proportions and style of the doors; any replacement windows be wood with true divided lites; details of the proposed signage be submitted for administrative review and approval; and the proposed hood exhaust vent be installed at the rear of the structure to minimize the visibility of the proposed hood from the public right of way. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

2 [COA-033420-2018](#) 2410-2412 M Street - Rehabilitate a double house to include relocation of a side stoop.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Hendricks, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be partially approved. The Commission partially approved the application as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission denied the proposed paint scheme and recommended the applicant submit a paint scheme for the structure to be administratively reviewed and approved that is consistent with the Commission's paint guidelines for Italianate structures to include one body color for the entire structure or one color for the body of each home. The Commission approved the rehabilitation of the siding, replacement of the doors, and relocation of the stoop provided the following conditions are met: the work be performed in conformance with the Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions; and any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service be submitted to CAR staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

3 [COA-033451-2018](#) 3021 Monument Avenue - Replace existing stairs.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Hendricks, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the deck railing be Richmond rail or the pickets be placed on the inside of the handrail for a more finished appearance; the sub-decking for the deck be screened with wood lattice or with brick piers; the existing opening heads and widths be maintained; details of the proposed doors be submitted for administrative review and approval; the work be performed in conformance with the Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions; and any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service be submitted to CAR staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

7 [COA-033469-2018](#) 3406 East Broad Street - Restoration of windows on a single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Hendricks, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the in-kind replacement be defined as wood, true divided lite window sashes of the same lite configuration and proportions of the historic windows and details of the design of the wood window to replace the vinyl window be submitted for

administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 9 [COA-033491-2018](#) 307 North 28th Street - Rehabilitate a single family home to include construction of a wood stoop in the rear yard.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Hendricks, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the original wood siding be consolidated on the façade; fiber cement siding be installed only on secondary elevations and be smooth and un-beaded; paint colors be submitted for administrative review and approval; if windows are to be replaced, the applicant must return with a window survey and specifications for the new windows for administrative review and approval; the head heights of the windows and doors on the first story of the rear elevation should align; and the new stoop should be centered on the door opening and all exposed wood surfaces should be painted or stained. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 13 [COA-033403-2018](#) 501 West Broad Street - Demolish existing fast food restaurant.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Hendricks, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the applicant return with a conceptual plan for the property after the University's Master Plan is complete; a plan be submitted for administrative review and approval for the proposed temporary parking lot design to meet the Commission's parking lot standards (pg. 77) by including appropriate screening; and a demolition permit not be issued until the requested site plan is submitted and approved and any zoning modifications for a parking lot are secured. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

REGULAR AGENDA

4 [COA-33405-2](#) 818 North 25th Street - Construct a shed and pergola in the rear yard.
[018](#)

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Charlie Field, stated that his intention is to create accessible parking. Mr. Field noted that the Commission had approved a pergola similar to the pergola at the site of the proposed construction three or four doors down from Mosby and Venable. Mr. Field further admitted that the pergola would qualify as a car port.

Mr. Bond asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Mr. Cooley expressed relative approval of the construction of the pergola, recognizing the pressing need for parking in the area and suggested that the Commission is mincing words by opposing the construction of the pergola. Mr. Johnson, on the other hand, concluded that the pergola would qualify as a car port, with Ms. Chen confirming that a car port is not appropriate for a historic district. Mr. Johnson further elaborated that allowing this pergola to be constructed would set a precedent that would adversely affect the community.

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Hendricks, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be partially approved. The Commission partially approved the application as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission denied the proposed pergola as its size and siting do not respect the pattern found in the district for pergolas. The Commission approved the proposed shed for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the siding be smooth and without a bead and paint colors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

No -- 1 - David C. Cooley

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

5 [COA-033435-](#) 5-9 North 5th Street - Enlarge an existing glass atrium.
[2018](#)

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Steve Blashfield, the architect representing the applicant, explained that his construction plans responded to the concerns of people entering the church who find the door almost invisible from the street, due to it being recessed within the curtain wall. Mr. Blashfield expressed that his goal is to open up the space and allow some reconfiguration within the space, extending the curtain wall in a straight line to prevent the awkward transition in the corner that renders the door invisible. He insisted that his construction plans would not affect significant elements of the structure but stated that he is glad to comply with recommendations of staff. He maintained that his intent to preserve the church would only have a reversible impact in the long term and, therefore, conform to the standards that are used in applying modifications to historic structures. Mr. Blashfield assured that he would not wish to damage the brick on the face of the church.

Vernon Mays, representing the Church Design Committee, stated that he considers the

proposed construction to be a modest alteration that would just make the entrance more welcoming and hospitable by bringing the door around and covering the stairwell. He further stated that the proposed construction would create more direct access into the space and improve the flow in both directions towards the church and down towards the office space and elevator that serves the higher floors.

Mr. Bond asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced commission discussion. Mr. Cooley noted that he found the proposed construction doable. Mr. Hendricks stated that the construction needs to be deferential to the main body of the church, and Mr. Johnson expressed both an understanding of the approach of the applicant and about the way that the construction would cause the church to appear from the street. Mr. Johnson noted that the original design was intended to differentiate this structure and that this differentiation should be maintained. Mr. Bond agreed with the importance of not getting in the way of the church. Due to the above concerns, Mr. Hendricks made a motion to defer the item to allow the applicant to respond to staff concerns.

A motion was made by Hendricks, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be deferred to allow the applicant the opportunity to revise the plans to respond to the concerns raised in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

6 [COA-033457-2018](#) 2201 East Franklin Street - Install a halo lit blade sign.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Catherine Easterling, representing the River City Sign Company, stated that a smaller sign was approved by the National Park Service and The Department of Historic Resources as part of their tax credit application for the building. She noted that the company has submitted a request for approval of the larger sign but have not heard back.

Tom Dickey, a building owner in the area of the proposed signage, insisted that externally lit signs would clash more with surroundings than internally lit signs and noted that DHR had approved halo signs before.

Martha Broughton, a resident in the area, explained that the sign is setting precedent, appears unnecessary, and disrupts a residential area.

Cyane Crump, representing HRF, stated that her reservations about the signage stemmed from failing to understand what the sign would actually look like.

Mr. Bond asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Mr. Cooley did not object to the internal illumination. Mr. Johnson and Mr. Bond, on the other hand, stated that allowing the sign would contradict Commission guidelines and set a precedent that would condone internal illumination in other locations in the future; however, both Mr. Johnson and Mr. Hendricks acknowledged that the sign's internal illumination would be subtle. The Commissioners acknowledged that it is necessary to adapt to new technology but still adhere to Commission guidelines.

A motion was made by Johnson, Jr., seconded by Jones, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the proposed sign project a maximum of 4 feet from the building corner rather than the proposed 4.5 feet; the proposed sign be externally illuminated in a manner to be administratively reviewed and approved by staff rather than the proposed internal illumination; the work be performed in conformance with the Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions; and any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service be submitted to CAR staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

No -- 1 - David C. Cooley

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

- 8 [COA-033493-2018](#) 2105 East Marshall Street - Install a chain between existing concrete posts.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was withdrawn

- 10 [COA-033481-2018](#) 2109 Cedar Street - Rehabilitate a single family home and construct a rear addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The applicant, Charles Tysinger, stated that he supported staff recommendations, with the exception of the recommendation concerning the chimneys. Mr. Tysinger noted that he would need to make further assessments from a safety standpoint and learn from engineers what would be viable. If staff recommendations are found to be consistent with the engineers' assessment, he would be more than glad to follow staff recommendations.

Mr. Bond asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. The Commissioners agreed that they should adhere to staff recommendations.

A motion was made by Cooley, seconded by Johnson, Jr., that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the original wood siding be consolidated on the façade; fiber cement siding be installed only on secondary elevations and be smooth and un-beaded; paint colors be submitted for administrative review and approval; the chimneys be retained; the front slope of the gable roof be field formed standing seam metal; the roof profile at the junction the gable roof and the shed roof not be altered; the location of mechanical units be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; 6/6 wood or aluminum clad windows with true or simulated divided lights with interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar between the glass be installed on the historic portion of the dwelling; the 2/2 clad wood windows with simulated divided lights to include interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar be installed on the addition to differentiate it from the historic

building; the 1977 photograph and any physical evidence that is revealed when the asphalt siding is removed be used to reconstruct the entry and porch roof and columns above the concrete deck; the porch roof be flat lock metal; a 6-panel wood door with a single-light transom and divided sidelights be installed at the front entry; and the addition be differentiated from the historic dwelling by stepping the side walls in approximately 1 foot on each side. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

11 [COA-033455-2018](#) 3020 East Franklin Street - Construct two single family attached homes.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Zach Kennedy, the owner and builder for the project, discussed plans concerning the front porch, and 3rd floor cornice height.

Danielle Porter, representing Historic Richmond, briefly mentioned the letter that she had sent to the Commission concerning the proposal.

Mr. Bond asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Mr. Cooley expressed interest in how the large panels of hardie material would be attached. Mr. Hendricks admitted that he has no issue with the short window by the door, because the proposed construction is not a historic replication. He noted that the narrow windows in the recess help to designate a hierarchical rhythm to the façade. However, Mr. Hendricks expressed concern about the window trim and landscaping. Ms. Pitts noted that the property will be required to undergo a special use permit process and that the Department of Public Works will look at the type of street improvements. The applicant joined the discussion to briefly explain landscaping plans.

A motion was made by Hendricks, seconded by Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: the siding be smooth and without a bead. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks and Neville C. Johnson Jr.

No -- 1 - Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

12 [COA-033489-2018](#) 512 West 19th Street - Construct a single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Chad White, the owner, expressed support for staff's recommendations.

Mr. Bond asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he called the question.

A motion was made by Hendricks, seconded by Cooley, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: any hardscaping details if a front walkway is proposed be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the head height of the window on the first story of the rear elevation align with the head height of the adjacent door; details of the dimension of the trim be submitted for administrative review and approval; details of the proposed front porch columns to include dimensions be submitted for administrative review and approval; and the rear stoop be painted or opaquely stained a color to be administratively approved by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Gerald Jason Hendricks, Neville C. Johnson Jr. and Carey L. Jones

Abstain -- 1 - Ashleigh N. Brewer

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- 14 [COA-033492-2018](#) 2113 Cedar Street - Construct a new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Jerry Heeral, the applicant, expressed agreement with staff recommendations.

Mr. Bond asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Commissioners expressed support for the applicant's proposal.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

- 15 [COA-033494-2018](#) 3629 East Broad Street - Construct a single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Enoch Pou, representing Development Entities, emphasized his openness to staff's recommendations. He only noted that in compliance with zoning regulations, at least one off-street parking space would be necessary. He mentioned that there is absolutely no rear alley access from Government Road and no access from the alley in the area around the proposed construction. He further admitted that the neighboring property would share an alley with the property at the side of the proposed construction. Ms. Jones suggested that stairs to the front porch be moved to allow for parking on the side of the building. Mr. Johnson agreed.

Mr. Bond stated that a contemporary design would be appropriate for the project.

Mr. Field, a member of the public, stated a topographic survey may be required to understand how the building will be sited. Mr. Pou agreed, stating that he is not yet at

that stage.

Mr. Bond asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Commissioners expressed support for the project continuing if the applicant applied staff's recommendations.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

- 16 [COA-033501-2018](#) 815 North 22nd Street - Rehabilitate a mixed use structure and construct a rear addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Sam Tuttle, the owner, answered clarification questions. Mr. Bond raised concerns regarding the proposed inset entrance. Mr. Tuttle explained that he was proposing to introduce material that is inset with the window opening that relates to what would be on the interior where one would enter the building. He noted that he adjusted his perspective on what he would build after meeting with some of the community members.

Public comment: Nancy Lambert, a resident of the area, commended Sam Tuttle for listening to the community. Ms. Lambert admitted that she is not concerned with trash piling up in inappropriate areas. She further noted that the lack of space in Union Hill is getting ridiculous.

End public comment.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

- 17 [COA-033504-2018](#) 413 Chimborazo Boulevard - Construct a new single family home.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Mark Baker, representing Baker Development Resources, stated that he agrees largely with staff recommendations, but he wished to demonstrate that his proposed window construction is consistent with the fabric of the neighborhood.

Mr. Bond asked if there was any further public comment. There being none, he commenced Commission discussion. Commissioners wished to broaden their understanding of the proposed window alignment.

This Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conceptually reviewed

Adjournment

Mr. Bond adjourned the meeting at 6:37 p.m.