

City of Richmond

*City Hall
900 East Broad Street*



Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, July 25, 2023

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Commission of Architectural Review

[PDRPRES
2023.047](#) Public Access & Participation Instructions - Commission of Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW.pdf](#)

Call to Order

Commission Chair, Sean Wheeler called the meeting to order at 3:31p.m.

Roll Call

- Present --** 6 - * Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., * Commissioner Andrew Moore, * Commissioner Sean Wheeler, * Commissioner Lawrence Pearson , * Commissioner John Grier and * Commissioner Mitch Danese
- Absent --** 3 - * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez and * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan

Secretary's Report

The CLG training was last Wednesday. Several Commissioners were able to attend the training. Staff and Commissioners received guidance and potential outreach ideas.

A subcommittee was formed last meeting with Commissioners Morgan and Rodriguez to lead discussions on paint palette guidelines. There will be follow up meetings with them on August 10th and September 9th. They will present their findings at the September CAR meeting for Commissioners to review and discuss.

An informational CAR flyer was sent out to all properties in City Old & Historic Districts last week and there have been a lot of responses received by staff.

The Land Use, Housing, & Transportation Committee nominated to reappoint Commissioner Rodriguez for her position on the Commission and nominated Larry Nutt to serve in Commissioner Johnson's current position. They will review these nominations and vote to appoint them in their upcoming meeting. This is Johnson's last meeting.

CAR elections – Wheeler opened the floor for nominations.

Administrative Approval Report

Dandridge presented the administrative approval report. There were only 5 administrative approvals this month.

Commissioners had no questions.

Enforcement Report

Staff is working to abate 2515 E. Grace Street where a mini-spilt was installed on a roof without screening. Work to remove illegally installed asphalt shingles at 905 Belmont to replace them with CAR approved synthetic barrel tile that resembles the original will be starting soon. 313 N. Monroe St. is working with contractors to install metal coping to bring the project into compliance with CAR approval. Two violations were abated this month: 100 W. Leigh Street – Removed windows on front façade were rebuilt and installed to match the original; 3909 Hermitage Road – illegally installed driveway was removed and reseeded with grass lawn.

OTHER BUSINESS**CAR Elections**

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Grier to keep Commission Chair Wheeler and Commission Vice Chair Moore in their current positions.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

CONSENT AGENDA

The consent portion of the meeting began at 4:00pm.

Alex Dandridge reread the announcement for virtual public meetings.

Commission Chair Wheeler asked if the Commissioners wished to move any items from the Regular Agenda to the Consent Agenda or vice versa.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Pearson, to move 305 Brook Rd. to the consent agenda.

The applicant is not comfortable with the staff conditions about color.
Moore withdrew his motion.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Moore, seconded by Commissioner Pearson to move Item #4 414 W. Marshall Street to the Consent Agenda.

The applicant is not present.

Wheeler says the work is not going to be visible in the public right-of-way.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – Wheeler, Johnson, Moore, Danese, Grier, Pearson
Absent – 3 – Brewer, Morgan, Rodriguez

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler to move Item #6 1201 E. Clay Street to the Consent Agenda.

The applicant is comfortable with staff conditions.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – Wheeler, Johnson, Moore, Danese, Grier, Pearson
Absent – 3 – Brewer, Morgan, Rodriguez

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Johnson to move Item #10 2210 Jefferson Ave. to consent

The applicant is comfortable with staff conditions.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye – Wheeler, Johnson, Moore, Danese, Grier, Pearson

Absent – 3 – Brewer, Morgan, Rodriguez

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve consent agenda as amended.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson , Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

1. [COA-132793-2023](#) 2235 Venable Street - Construct a side and rear fence.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this item with the following conditions:

Applicant work with staff to determine a final site plan for the fence, and final color and site plan to be administratively approved.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson , Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

2. [COA-132792-2023](#) 820 N. 23rd Street - Construct a shed in a rear yard.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this item with the following conditions:

The rear shed be painted to match the color scheme of the primary building on site.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson , Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

3. [COA-132791-2023](#) 972-974 Pink Street - Construct an attached two-story dwelling onto the side elevation of an existing dwelling.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this item with the following conditions:

The TPO roofing for the front porch match the light, white color of the front porches at 970-972 Pink Street; any new electrical meters and associated wires and conduits be located on a secondary elevation, not on a primary façade; windows with divided lights either be true divided lights, or simulated divided lights (SDL's); and final exterior colors be submitted for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

5. [COA-132636-2023](#) 414 W. Marshall Street - Remove a rear addition and deck; construct a new two-story rear addition and deck.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this item with the following conditions:

The proposed addition will be no taller than the existing building; that the current first-floor addition is removed with the gentlest means possible, as to not damage any historic materials on the primary building; any fiber cement siding should be smooth, and unbeaded; and final materials be submitted to staff for review and approval, all final colors be submitted and reviewed by staff.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

6. [COA-132658-2023](#) 1201 E. Clay Street - Rehabilitate a steam room including the roof structure; add 1/4" laminated secondary glazing on all exterior windows.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[1201 E. Clay St Staff Report.pdf](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this item with the following conditions:

The applicant carefully reconstruct the brick wall with historic mortar and joint profiles.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

7. [COA-132790-2023](#) 2210 Jefferson Avenue - Remove a deteriorated front porch; reconstruct to match using substitute materials.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Danese, to approve this item with the following conditions:

The new metal roof be flat-lock and be painted a color found on the Commission's approved color pallet; final materials and color submitted for administrative review and approval; the original roof structure be retained and its form not be altered; composite decking boards be installed perpendicular to the face of the building; a composite front porch rail be used that does not feature bulky connectors; and the applicant work with staff on choosing an appropriate substitute rail material and design.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

REGULAR AGENDA

4. [COA-132789-2023](#) 305 Brook Road - Paint the exterior of a commercial building and install signage.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Alex Dandridge presented this application.

The applicant, Liz Kincaid, approached the podium. She and her designers believe the chosen color palette will elevate the Arts District. The designers were unable to be present.

Johnson understands the design choices. He has no problems with the design.

Dandridge said the building doesn't have much articulation so the sills being unpainted or painted a grey color can help break up the façade.

Wheeler thinks a darker color would hold up due to the staining that's already there.

Wheeler opened the floor for public comment. There was none.

A motion was made by Commissioner Johnson, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve this item with the following conditions:

The stone/engineered stone sills on the front façade of 307 Brook Road remain

unpainted, or painted a gray color that is lighter than the proposed body color; any color selections submitted to staff for review and approval; for the wall sign: the letters be applied to a wooden or metal sign board that is then secured to the front façade in order limit the number of penetrations into the face of the building; and the projecting signage be installed in the exact location of the existing signage as to use the existing holes in the brick and mortar in order to not further damage or disturb historic material.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Neville C. Johnson Jr., Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner Lawrence Pearson, Commissioner John Grier and Commissioner Mitch Danese

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

8. [COA-132788-2023](#) 13 E. Broad Street - Construct a new, five-story commercial building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Alex Dandridge presented this application.

The applicant, Rick Fischl with SMBW representing VPM approached the podium. VPM Located in Chesterfield, want to move its headquarters into Richmond. They want to create a community asset with their building. They are in the process of the POD entitlement process with other City departments. They have met with local civic associations and City councilmembers Robertson and Jordan. Only half of the site is within the CAR's purview, as only the north portion is within a City Old and Historic District.

Commissioner Danese asked about the material on the façade that resembles stone.

Rick Fischl explained that is was concrete, engineered stone.

Commissioner Grier asked if the alley that bisects the lot was a public alley, and if so, would it remain open to the public.

Rick Fischl explained that there would be not public access and the perimeter of the building would be secured.

Commissioner Grier asked if the building was aiming to achieve any kind of LEED certifications for energy efficiency. Would there be highly reflective surfaces?

Rick Fischl explained that they were aiming for LEED silver and that nothing will be super opaque or out of the character of the district.

Commissioner Johnson asked about the accessibility of parking and if that would be mostly off of Grace Street?

Rick Fischl explained, yes. It's not navigable on the Foushee alley. The alley at 1st St. is only 14 ft. wide with dominion poles. They are exploring the possibility of keeping some of the parking open to the public, as well.

Commissioner Wheeler opened the floor for public comment.

Cyane Crump, Executive Director of the Historic Richmond Foundation spoke in support of the project. She hopes the project budget allows for the highest quality of materials.

Commissioner Wheeler believes that the project looks great. CAR will need alley elevations from the public right-of-way, as that is within CAR purview. Wheeler explained that the top cornice is rendered in the same color scheme as the bottom two-floors and would like to see it differentiated compared to the base.

Commissioner Moore agreed with the articulation of 3rd and 4th level. Moore believed that the top two floors could be further recessed using a different color or material. The overall façade composition, intrigued by 4 bay composition logic, reads better in diagram than the renderings. The building could be a little less glass-focused. Moore is concerned about starkness of metal panels on the ground floor. It feels unfriendly. The other angled walls on Broad are filled with glass, so the while the form is correct, the materiality is off.

The Commission reviewed this item in an advisory capacity.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:12pm.