

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
August 22, 2017 Meeting**

12. COA-018248-2017 (K. Orfalea)

**508 W. Marshall Street
Jackson Ward Old and Historic District**

Project Description: Amend plans for a new single-family home.

Staff Contact: M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval to amend previously approved plans for a new single family home in the Jackson Ward Old and Historic District. On January 24, 2017, the Commission conditionally approved the construction of a new single family home on this vacant property. Since the approval, the ownership of the parcel has changed. On June, 27, 2017, the applicant returned to the Commission to request approval of the following modifications to the structure:

- The façade and 20 feet back on the side elevations will be clad in brick. Previously, the structure was proposed to be clad in all fiber cement lap siding.
- At the rear of the structure, the applicant is proposing a 1st floor deck, 2nd story balcony, and a rooftop deck constructed of composite materials. The applicant is proposing a spiral staircase to provide access from the first floor deck to the rooftop deck.
- The applicant is proposing larger gliding windows and French doors at the rear of the structure.

The Commission deferred the application at the June meeting to allow the applicant to modify the design for the façade and to address some of the concerns raised by staff. Specifically, the Commission had concerns about the composition of the front door and sidelites, the lack of window headers, the lack of details in the cornice, and the alignment of windows and porches at the rear. In response to the Commission's concerns, the applicant modified the plans as follows:

- Centered the front door with sidelites on both sides
- Proposed precast concrete headers on the façade windows
- Added detail in the cornice of rectangular brackets
- Extended the second story balcony and aligned the windows and doors at the rear

Staff recommends approval of the application as submitted with the noted conditions.

Change in Materials: The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* note that materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with the original materials used throughout the district (pg. 45, Materials & Colors, #2). As brick is a material found on structures in the district,

staff supports the use of this material on the structure. The applicant has included dimensions on the site plan which show the brick portion of the side elevation will extend past the recessed portion of the adjacent home; therefore staff believes the change in material from brick to siding will not be visible from the public right of way. Staff recommends that the applicant submit the proposed brick color for administrative review and approval.

Rear Decks and Balconies: The proposed first floor deck meets the Commission's Deck Guidelines (pg. 48). Staff recommends details of the railing be submitted for administrative review and approval. The applicant has modified the plans to extend the width of the 2nd story balcony to align with the deck below which is a building form found in the district. The Commission's *Guidelines* note that the new construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the District (pg. 44, Form #1). Though staff had concerns that exterior spiral staircases and rooftop decks are not building forms found in the District on single family homes, the Commission did not share these concerns as they saw the proposed modifications as appropriate for contemporary and compatible new construction.

Rear Windows and Doors: The *Guidelines* note that the size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings on new construction should be compatible with patterns established in the district (pg. 46, Doors & Windows #3). The applicant has modified the placement and size of the windows and doors at the rear to vertically align these elements. Staff recommends details of the proposed window and door materials be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval.

Changes to the Façade: The applicant has responded to the Commission's concerns about the front entry by centering the front door and including sidelites on both sides of the entry which is similar to the composition of the entry across the street at 509 West Marshall Street. Staff has concerns that the proposed "dental" block is not consistent with the placement of dentils in historic cornices in the District and is not consistent in form with brackets found in the district. Staff recommends the Commission approve the previously approved cornice without the proposed "dental" block element.

Staff recommends the Commission's approval be conditioned on the following additional items which were included in the previous approval:

- The fiber cement siding be smooth and unbeaded.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the noted conditions, is consistent with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Section 30.930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of code.