

# City of Richmond

*City Hall  
900 East Broad Street*



## Meeting Minutes

**Tuesday, January 28, 2025**

**3:30 PM**

**5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall**

## **Commission of Architectural Review**

[Access 2025](#) Public Access and Participation Instructions - Commission of Architectural Review

**Attachments:** [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW.pdf](#)

## Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:32p.m.

## Roll Call

**Present --** 7 - \* Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, \* Commissioner Andrew Moore, \* Commissioner Mitch Danese, \* Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, \* Commissioner Erik Bootsma, \* Commissioner Emily Striffler and \* Commissioner Catherine Easterling

**Absent --** 2 - \* Commissioner John Grier and \* Commissioner Larry Nutt

## Approval of Minutes

December 2024

**A motion was made by Commissioner Striffler, seconded by Commissioner Marie Hill, that this be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

## Secretary's Report

Enforcement Report

Administrative Approval Report

## CONSENT AGENDA

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hill, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the Consent Agenda.**

**The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

1. [COA-160011-2025](#) 611 North 26th Street - Revise a previously issued COA; specifically revisions to the proposed addition's dimensions and fenestration pattern.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hill, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met: all other previous conditions issued with the original approval still be adhered to. Those conditions are as follows: the building be constructed true to the plan so that it is lower than the primary building; the lap siding on the rear addition have a different reveal than the lap siding on the original dwelling; final door materials and colors be submitted to Staff for administrative review and approval; final color selection for the new garage be submitted for Administrative Review and approval; hardscaping north of the new garage should have materials compatible the district including concrete, brick, or granite pavers; that the final design and material specifications for the proposed fence be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the demolition of the one-story addition and excavation for the new addition and basement should be done in the most sensitive way possible, to minimize any impacts to the historic dwelling; the applicant should apply for the demolition permit and the building permit concurrently; and that the decorative cornice proposed for the new addition's North 26th Street façade either be identical to the existing building's cornice, or be a simplified design, details provided on the final building plans.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

2. [COA-160009-2025](#) 2220 East Marshall Street - Relocate a segment of existing chain-link fencing.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hill, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met: No new chain-link fencing be installed on the property.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

## **REGULAR AGENDA**

3. [COA-158358-2024](#) 1809 West Grace Street - Reconstruct a covered front porch.

**Attachments:** [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Bootsma, seconded by Commissioner Striffler, to deny this application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report, finding that the use of metal posts and railings on the new porch were not in keeping with the historic materials and forms found in the West Grace Street City Old and Historic District, and that metal porches in the West Grace Street City Old and Historic District are anomalies and incompatible, pre-district alterations. The Commission recommended that any new porch in this location feature elements and materials that either reference the historic 1950s photograph of the building's original porch, neighboring front porches, or the most recent porch that was removed which featured wooden elements compatible with the district.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

4. [COA-160010-2025](#) 2201 Venable Street - Construct a new three story dwelling.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Hill, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met: The underside of the second story porch have a finished appearance such as a breadboard ceiling or other covering; the decking boards be installed perpendicular to the face of the building; the downspouts be round, gutter and downspout specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval; and details on any proposed fencing be submitted for administrative approval.

The motion failed by the following vote:

Yes: (2) (M) HILL, (S) RODRIGUEZ  
No: (5) BOOTSMA, DANESE, EASTERLING, MOORE(S) STRIFFLER  
Excused: (2) GRIER, NUTT  
Recused: (0)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Striffler, to deny the application. The Commission found that that the application did not meet the City of Richmond City Old and Historic District Design and Review Guidelines for New Construction, specifically, Standards for New Construction, Height, Width, Proportion & Massing, #1 & #3, pg. 47, "1. New residential construction should respect the typical height of surrounding residential buildings. 3. The cornice height should be compatible with that of adjacent historic buildings." The Commission found that the proposed three stories was incompatible as designed with the height of neighboring two story historic buildings.

and

New Construction: Corner Properties – Residential, #5, pg. 48, "For residential corner properties, we strongly encourage the use of architectural elements that are typical of residential corner properties in Richmond's historic districts: porches that turn from primary to secondary elevations, corner towers, projecting

bay windows, side entrances (including porticos, and shed roofs, where appropriate), side porches, lighting related to that on the primary elevation, and other similar treatments that treat the secondary corner elevation as an architecturally important elevation.” The Commission found that the proposed building did not adequately address the corner in the ways that are recommended by the Guidelines. They found that there was not adequate treatment that created architecturally important, street-facing elevations.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 6 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling
- No --** 1 - Commissioner Gina Marie Hill

5. [COA-160046-2025](#) 401 West Marshall Street - Construct a new three story multi-family building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)  
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Bootsma, seconded by Commissioner Easterling, to approve this application for the reasons stated in the Staff Report provided that the following conditions are met: Height of the cornice be shown on the building plans, not only for the proposed building, but also 405 West Marshall Street; brick veneer on the east elevation be extended so that the east elevation appears to only feature one material, or some other solution that reduces the visibility of the transition from brick to siding, final design solution and material selections to be submitted to staff for Chair and Vice Chair approval; the ceilings of the front porches have a finished appearance, using breadboard or some other material to cover the joists and hardware; the final window design have either a one-over-one, two-over-two, or six-over-six pane configuration to be in-keeping with historic window design throughout the district. Final window and door specification to be submitted for administrative approval; Location of trash and screening mechanism be included on the final building plans; final cornice detailing and dimensions be submitted to Staff for Chair and Vice Chair Approval; and final railing height and material be submitted to Staff for administrative approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 7 - Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Mitch Danese, Commissioner Gina Marie Hill, Commissioner Erik Bootsma, Commissioner Emily Striffler and Commissioner Catherine Easterling

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

Quarterly Meeting Agenda

1. 2024 Year in Review

2. 2024 UDC Year in Review

3. Commission Training: Hearing Procedures & Visualizing Infill

**Adjournment**

The Regular Portion of the meeting was adjourned at 5:10 p.m.

The Quarterly Meeting was adjourned at 6:15 p.m.