

2. COA-050339-2019

PUBLIC HEARING DATE

March 26, 2019

PROPERTY ADDRESS

1136 West Grace Street

DISTRICT

West Grace Street

Commission of Architectural Review

STAFF REPORT



APPLICANT

S. Nordheim

STAFF CONTACT

C. Jeffries

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Install metal paneling on existing portico.

PROJECT DETAILS

- The applicant requests approval to alter a front portico on a two-story brick Colonial Revival residence in the West Grace Street City Old and Historic District.
- This application is the result of enforcement activity as the work was completed without prior approval.
- The portico was in disrepair and the Classical cornice return and entablature were removed and/or covered with metal paneling.



The City of Richmond assumes no liability either for any errors, omissions, or inaccuracies in the information provided regardless of the cause of such or for any decision made, action taken, or action not taken by the user in reliance upon any maps or information provided herein.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

DENY

PREVIOUS REVIEWS

None.

STAFF COMMENTS

As the alterations to the portico are not consistent with the *Guidelines*, staff recommends denial of the installation of metal paneling and recommends the portico be returned to its historic appearance. Staff requests that the applicant submit elevations and a materials for approval list prior to beginning work on repairing the porch.

STAFF ANALYSIS

Porches,
Entrances and
Doors, #1, pg.
71

Elements that are damaged or loose should be repaired to match the detail of the existing original fabric.

The application states that the existing porch was rotten and required repair. Any damaged elements should be replaced in-kind to match the existing.

Porches,
Entrances and
Doors, #3, pg.

Whenever possible repair and partial replacement of a porch is preferable to complete replacement.

Only damaged elements were removed from the portico. It appears that the columns, roof, and rake cornice were retained.

Porches,
Entrances and
Doors, #4, pg.
71

*Do not remove or radically change
entrances and porches important in defining
the building's overall historic character.*

The decorative pedimented portico with paired Doric columns, Classical entablature, and cornice return, is indicative of the Colonial Revival style. The removal of these decorative elements removes details that are important in defining the building's historic character. Further, the installation of vertical metal cladding radically changes the appearance of the entrance and is not consistent with the Colonial Revival style. Staff recommends denial of the installation of vertical metal panels over the existing portico.

Porches,
Entrances and
Doors, #8, pg.
71

*Do not strip entrances and porches of
historic material and details that should be
retained in any repair or partial replacement.*

Historic photographs of the building depict the portico as it looked before it was recently modified. As such, staff believes that this was the historic appearance of the entrance and these decorative elements should have been retained. Staff recommends denial of the removal of the historic material and recommends the portico be returned to its historic appearance. Staff requests that the applicant submit elevations and a materials for approval list prior to beginning work on repairing the porch.

It is the assessment of staff that the application is not consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

FIGURES



Figure 1. 1136 West Grace St. September, 2017



Figure 2. 1136 West Grace St. February, 2019



Figure 3. 1136 West Grace St, 1984