



Meeting Minutes - Final
Commission of Architectural Review

Tuesday, February 28, 2017

3:30 PM

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

1 Call to Order

2 Roll Call

- Present --** 8 - * Commissioner David C. Cooley, * Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, * Sanford Bond, * Bryan Green, * Nathan Hughes, * James W. Klaus, * Andrew Ray McRoberts and * Joseph Yates
- Absent --** 1 - * Gerald Jason Hendricks

3 Approval of Minutes

October 25, 2016

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Hughes, that the October 2016 minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus and Andrew Ray McRoberts
- Excused --** 1 - Sanford Bond
- Abstain --** 1 - Joseph Yates

November 22, 2016

A motion was made by Green, seconded by Klaus, that the November 2016 minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 5 - Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates
- Abstain --** 2 - Commissioner David C. Cooley and Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor
- Recused --** 1 - Sanford Bond

December 12, 2016

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Yates, that the December, 2016 minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye --** 6 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Bryan Green, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates
- Abstain --** 1 - Nathan Hughes

Recused -- 1 - Sanford Bond

January 24, 2017

A motion was made by Hughes, seconded by Aarons-Sydnor, that the January 2017 minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus and Joseph Yates

Abstain -- 2 - Bryan Green and Andrew Ray McRoberts

Recused -- 1 - Sanford Bond

4 National Register Nomination

[NR 2017-2](#) Philip Morris Blended Leaf Complex Historic District

Attachments: [Nomination Form](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Ms. Chen read the National Register Nomination for the Phillip Morris Blended Leaf complex on Jefferson Davis Highway and stated that they received the nomination form as a courtesy from the Department of Historic Resources because the City is a Certified Local Government and DHR seeks the Commission's opinion on these nominations. Ms. Chen gave a brief description of the contributing building and stated that staff has reviewed the nominations and feels that they are in keeping with the multiple property documentation and that the buildings are eligible under Criterion A for industry and Criterion C for specialized industrial architecture.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired if RPS has an intended use for these and Ms. Chen stated that she is not aware of one at this time.

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Hughes, that this Report be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

5 Other Business

Secretary's Report

Ms. Pitts stated that they have some items for the Commission to review which include some new construction application examples that were crafted by staff and Yessenia Revilla, another staff member, to share with applicants. Ms. Pitts stated that she is hoping that the Commission will look at the documents to see if it is missing anything and asked the Commissions thoughts on anything else that would be beneficial for the applicant. It was the consensus of the Commission that this document could be very useful.

Mr. Yates stated that if any of the members had any changes or additions that contact Ms. Pitts next week so that they may be incorporated into the Guidelines.

Mr. Hughes stated that it would be good if they could show the north arrows.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that she would suggest on the site plan to include the overall width of the property facing the streets.

Continuation of the Secretary's Report

Ms. Pitts stated that at the last meeting they reviewed window replacements at 215 W. Clay Street and the Commission denied that request noting that the applicant can work with staff while repairing the windows to determine if there are any sashes there that are deteriorated beyond repair. Ms. Pitts stated that the applicant has appealed the Commission's decision to City Council and stated that staff has crafted the Commission's response and has met with the councilwoman from the district who has also met with the applicant and expressed her opinion that she would not be patroning the legislation for the appeal. Ms. Pitts stated that she is not sure if the applicant has met with any other council person regarding an appeal.

The Commission briefly discussed the new policy pertaining to talking to applicants about their projects prior to the meetings in the interest of full disclosure.

Ms. Pitts stated that she and another Commission member will be attending the Church Hill Association meeting in March 21st to share with them what the Commission does and what items can be administratively approved.

Mr. Green stated that he was presenting a project to the Monument Avenue Preservation Society and had mentioned that the Commission was interested in making presentations to neighborhood groups. MAPS then asked if someone could come and talk to them about what the Commission does.

Administrative Approvals

Ms. Pitts stated that Ms. Jeffries crafted two documents with guidelines for the administrative approval of two items that are often placed on the consent agenda and asked if the Commission would review the documents and vote on them to see if these are items that staff can administratively review and approve with these additional guidelines which were based on the conditions that are typically placed on these items by the Commission.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor inquired about the decking and stated that with synthetic siding they always ask for a smooth finish but this is not the case for synthetic decking, and inquired if there was a reason for that or if the Commission should be consistent. Ms. Pitts stated this question came up when Ms. Jeffries was trying to find pictures to put in the document as staff was noticing the same thing. She added that the Commission has consistently approved synthetic decking with texture and stated that if this is something that the Commission is concerned about staff can incorporate this into the document. Ms. Pitts also stated that staff was unsure if it is traditionally smooth and asked Mr. Cooley's opinion. Mr. Cooley stated that the brand AZEK which is pictured is a PVC with a grain texture and stated that it was a fake wood tongue and groove that has been removed from the market because it started swelling. Mr. Cooley stated that wood tongue and groove decking is quite smooth.

The Commission had a brief discussion about the decking material for the guidelines.

A motion was made by Mr. Klaus to approve the new procedure that staff can administratively approve decking materials per the guidelines. The motion was seconded by Mr. Cooley and passed unanimously. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor made a friendly amendment that decking be smooth grain.

A motion was made by Ms. Aarons-Sydnor that they include in the guidelines for administrative approval of fiber cement siding. The motion was seconded by Mr. Yates and passes unanimously.

Mr. Cooley stated that the guidelines state that any original wood siding should be used on the primary façade if possible and stated that they should encourage applicants to purchase wood because the fronts of the houses should be as authentic as possible.

Ms. Pitts stated that they discussed that all new construction be required to go through conceptual review and stated that today's agenda has items that are a result of this change.

Enforcement Report

Ms. Jeffries stated that they have been following up with quite a few enforcement items this month and added that they are working with several property owners to abate violations including receiving several applications for next month's meeting.

Other Committee Reports

Mr. Green stated that they had a large agenda for the UDC meeting last month and that all items went through the Planning Commission. Mr. Green stated that the UDC reviewed an outdoor patio encroachment at the Handcraft Building at 1500 Roseneath, renovation and addition to Richmond Fire Station #21, final review of the Richmond Turnpike roadway improvements including amendments regarding rails and materials, final review of the Reedy Creek Headquarters renovations, final review of the 17th Street Farmer's Market Plaza including continuing modification to the plaza materials and design, and the final review and revision to Monroe Park Plan which was improved with the exception of the change to the master plan of the trees that have already been cut down.

CONSENT AGENDA

Ms. Pitts stated that for the first item on the consent agenda the applicant had some concerns about the staff's recommendations and inquired if they could pull that item and put it on the regular agenda.

Mr. Green made a motion to move agenda item #1 for 2411 M. Street from the consent agenda to the regular agenda. The motion was seconded by Ms. Aarons-Sydnor and passed.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor made a motion to move agenda item #10 for 811 Jessamine Street from the regular agenda to the consent agenda. Mr. Yates inquired if the full chimney is visible from the rear or is it the chimney that projected from the roof and Ms. Pitts stated that it was the chimney that projected from the roof and is visible coming down Jessamine. Ms. Pitts stated that the application is to remove the windows that are currently in the structure. The motion was seconded by Mr. Klaus and passed, Green opposed.

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Hughes, that the consent agenda be approved as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

- | | | |
|---|---------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------|
| 2 | <u>CAR No.
2017-021</u> | 701 Mosby Street - Open bricked in openings and restore doors. |
|---|---------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------|

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Hughes, that the application be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the garage door grid pattern also be used for the opening with the glass curtain wall and door; and a fence enclosure be installed around the outdoor dining area, the design and color to be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 3 [CAR No. 2017-024](#) 140 Virginia Street - Install sliding glass windows to enclose existing terrace on a commercial building.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Hughes, that the the application be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 4 [CAR No. 2017-029](#) 717 North 24th Street - Remove vinyl siding, storm door, and awnings, restore wood siding on front elevation, install fiber cement siding on secondary elevation

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Hughes, that the application be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 5 [CAR No. 2017-030](#) 2405-2407 Cedar Street - Remove vinyl siding, replace with hardiplank, restore wood siding on front elevation if possible

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Hughes, the application be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the siding be smooth, unbeaded, and installed with a reveal consistent with the historic reveal; the wood siding be restored on the front elevation, if possible; paint colors be submitted for administrative review and approval; and the painted areas that will not be affected by the removal of the siding be painted over or otherwise removed. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 6 [CAR No. 2017-031](#) 812 North Robinson Street - Rehabilitate storefront.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Hughes, that the application be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: details of signage and colors be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the work be performed in conformance with the Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions; and any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 10 [CAR No. 2017-025](#) 811 Jessamine Street - Replace windows and remove chimney.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Hughes, that the application be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: details of the proposed windows including dimensions and lite configuration be provided to staff for review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

REGULAR AGENDA

- 1 [CAR No. 2017-018](#) 816 North 23rd Street - Replace front and back doors.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Hughes, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be partially approved for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission approved the installation of the rear door and deferred the review of the front door to allow the applicant the opportunity to work with staff to determine an appropriate front door. The motion carried by the following vote:

- 7 [CAR No. 2017-006](#) 2230 Venable Street - Construct five new multi-family structures.

Attachments: [Application and Plans - 2/28/17](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report - 2/28/17](#)

[Application and Plans - 1/24/17](#)

[Staff Report - 1/24/17](#)

Nine citizens spoke in support of the project and five citizens spoke against the project.

A motion was made by Yates, seconded by Hughes, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: a dimensioned parapet detail for the 2 story building be provided for administrative review and approval; the 3 story buildings be clad in lighter shades of brick to relate to the 2 story building; the applicant work with CAR staff, Land Use Administration staff, and Department of Public Works staff during the Plan of Development Review to address potential concerns with the encroachment in the Carrington Street right of way in a manner that maintains the pedestrian orientation of the Carrington Street elevation; the siding be smooth and un-beaded; and the windows be simulated or true divided lite. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 5 - Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Nathan Hughes, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

No -- 3 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Bryan Green and James W. Klaus

- 8** [CAR No. 2017-019](#) 517 North 29th Street - Replace porch decking, railing, roofing, soffit, and gutter.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Green, seconded by Yates, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: the porch roof have hand formed standing seams. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

Recused -- 1 - Commissioner David C. Cooley

- 9** [CAR No. 2017-020](#) 902 North 25th Street - Construct a new two story porch in rear, one story entry porch, and add fiber cement siding.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Cooley, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the condition of

the wood siding under the stucco be assessed in coordination with CAR staff and if possible, a sufficient amount of existing wood siding be salvaged and installed with the historic reveals on the façade and if not possible, the siding on the façade be replaced in-kind with wood siding of a reveal consistent with the historic reveal; the fiber cement siding on the secondary elevations be smooth, unbeaded, and installed with a reveal consistent with the historic reveal; the proposed siding color be submitted to CAR staff for administrative review and approval; both sides of the roof of the front gable be standing seam metal; the bracketed cornice be retained; the siding area surrounding the windows and shutters be minimized by increasing the window size or number or altering the layout of the windows and shutters in a manner to be reviewed and approved by CAR staff; the front porch be constructed of the existing historic material or match the historic design in form and materials; and the shutters be of proper dimension to cover the window. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

No -- 1 - Bryan Green

11 [CAR No. 2017-026](#) 3901 Hermitage Road - Replace roof.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)

A motion was made by Aarons-Sydnor, seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: a tile with a French tile profile be used unless the applicant, in consultation with staff, is unable to locate the product then the proposed half round tile may be used. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

12 [CAR No. 2017-027](#) 812 Jessamine Street - Replace porch decking, railing, and columns.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Cooley, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: Tuscan columns to match the appearance in the 1993 photograph be installed and the proposed composite material be submitted to staff for administrative review and approval; the proposed railing match the 1993 photograph to include a turned balustrade without a center post that breaks the rail; and the applicant work with staff to determine an appropriate substitute material for the railing, to be reviewed and approved by staff, that has a less glossy finish and smaller installation brackets than the proposed Fiberon HomeSelect railing. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

13 [CAR No. 2017-028](#) 2712 Monument Avenue - Replace brick front steps with granite.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by McRoberts, seconded by Klaus, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the brick stairs be retained or new brick stairs at the proposed consistent tread depth and riser height be installed in a brick to be reviewed and approved by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

No -- 1 - Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor

14 [CAR No. 2016-165a](#) 2504 West Grace Street - Replace all windows.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Aarons-Sydnor, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be partially approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report. The Commission approved the installation of aluminum clad wood windows on the façade with the condition that the four windows visible from the rear alley be replaced with 6/6 simulated or true divided lite wood or aluminum clad wood windows. The Commission denied maintaining any visible vinyl windows. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

15 [CAR No. 2017-023](#) 125 North 25th Street - Modification to previously approved plans to include the demolition of an existing addition and construction of a new addition.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)
[Site Map](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: the existing

chimney from the 1890 addition remain or be reconstructed at the same height as existing; the roof height for the replacement 1890 addition match that of the historic addition; and window location on the north elevation match that of the 1890 addition. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

- 17 [CAR No. 2017-015](#) 533 Mosby Street -- Construct a new single family dwelling and a garage.

Attachments: [Application and Plans - 2/28/17](#)

[Site Plan](#)

[Staff Report - 2/28/17](#)

[Application and Plans - 1/24/17](#)

[Staff Report - 1/24/17](#)

A motion was made by Cooley, seconded by Bond, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following condition is met: the HVAC equipment be located in the rear yard or the applicant confirm the equipment will not be visible from the public right of way once the structure is constructed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

- 16 [CAR No. 2016-114](#) 2411 M Street - Construct a new 3 story mixed use building with an enclosed rooftop amenity room and terraces

Attachments: [Application and Plans - 2/28/17](#)

[Site Plan](#)

[Staff Report - 2/28/17](#)

[Application and Plans - 12/13/16](#)

[Staff Report - 12/13/16](#)

[Application & Plans - 7/26/16](#)

[Staff Report - 7/26/16](#)

Four citizens spoke for the project and four citizens spoke against the project.

A motion was made by Klaus, seconded by Cooley, that this Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved as submitted for the reasons cited in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met: doors be included at the corner of M and North 24th Street; the design for the structure at the intersection of Jefferson Avenue and M Street be the alternate design; and the design for the remainder of the structure be the original design. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 8 - Commissioner David C. Cooley, Rebecca S. Aarons-Sydnor, Sanford Bond, Bryan Green, Nathan Hughes, James W. Klaus, Andrew Ray McRoberts and Joseph Yates

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

This application was conceptually reviewed

18 [CAR No. 2017-022](#) 813 North 24th Street - Construct one single family dwelling on a vacant lot.

Attachments: [Application and Plans](#)

[Site Map](#)

[Staff Report](#)

Mr. McRoberts stated that it is an inspired design and added that he like the fact that the architect is drawing from the community and neighborhood and stated that it has a great Greek revival feel without some of the problems that comes along with the design like a 6 foot step up to access it. Mr. McRoberts stated that he thinks it looks great and the applicant did a good job.

Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that the design is wonderful and added that she had two minor comments. Ms. Aarons-Sydnor stated that she would be open to taking advantage of all the land on the lot in terms of the setbacks and getting more house and stated that she would suggest that the applicant go with a lighter color roof, maybe a grey instead of a black.

Mr. McRoberts inquired if the Williamsburg Blue was a traditional color for Greek revival and Ms. Pitts stated that they do have it noted in the Greek revival that medium blue is an appropriate Greek revival color. Mr. Klaus stated that he is fine with the color.

Mr. Cooley stated that he likes the brick foundation but added that the parged CMU is a little disappointing to see. He then complemented the windows being 74 inches tall on the first floor and 66 inches tall on the second floor which gives it a look of a taller building and stated that not many people pick up on that subtlety. Mr. Cooley stated that the Commission encourages the wood louvered shutters to be operable.

Mr. Yates stated that the proportions on the front are handsome and that it really recalls a good small Greek revival town house.

Mr. Green stated that he really likes the way the applicant handled the addition and not doing the roof with truss. He then added that with the brick across the front maybe it needs to turn back 6ft on the side and bring it around the corner. Mr. Green also stated that they can take the first bay of windows on the side and line them up vertically and stated that it would be nice on the entry porch to put a half pilaster on the wall.

Mr. Hughes stated that he likes what he sees and inquired what the applicants are going to do with the back yard whether they are putting parking back there or trash. Mr. Blow stated that it will be a patio and a small play area for family and a space for trash or parking if the Commission wants that. Mr. Hughes stated that he wanted to make sure that they detail all of that in their plan.

Adjournment

Mr. Yates adjourned the meeting at 8:40 pm

