



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

5.COA-152522-2024	Final Review	Meeting Date: 8/27/2024
Applicant/Petitioner	Brian Stone	
Project Description	Rehabilitate an existing building, replace vinyl windows with new vinyl windows, and alter the size of existing masonry openings.	
Project Location		
Address: 2903 East Marshall Street		
Historic District: St. John's Church		
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <p>The applicant proposes to rehabilitate a brick row house circa 1880.</p> <p>Exterior alterations include replacement windows, decking, fencing, and repair.</p> <p>The original windows were removed from the building prior to the district's designation.</p> <p>Work on the property has already started prior to applying for a Certificate of Appropriateness.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Partial Approval	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov, (804) 646-6569	
Previous Reviews	None.	
Conditions for Approval	<p><u>Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Any replacement windows be wood or aluminum clad wood, fit within the original masonry openings, and have a one-over-one light configuration to match the appearance of the original windows documented in the historic photograph. All architectural features of the porch including the turned posts, corbels, brackets, and spindle work be repaired or replaced with an exact match. New decking boards be installed perpendicular to the face of the building and be tongue and groove. All unpainted masonry remains unpainted. <p><u>Staff recommends denial of:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Infilling any portion of the existing masonry openings on the building with brick. The proposed replacement vinyl windows. The installation of light posts in the front yard. 	

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Building Elements, Windows, pg. 69.	<p>5. Original masonry openings for doors and windows should be maintained. Infilling original masonry openings is strongly discouraged</p> <p>7. Windows should only be replaced when they are missing or beyond repair. Any reconstruction should be based on physical evidence or photo documentation</p> <p>8. The number, location, size or glazing pattern of windows should not be changed by cutting new openings, blocking out windows or by installing replacement sash that do not fit the original window. Changes to existing windows or the addition of new windows along a secondary elevation will be considered by the Commission on a case-by-case basis.</p> <p>10. The architectural appearance of original windows should be used as a model for new windows. Changes in the sash, depth or reveal, muntin configuration, frame or glazing is strongly discouraged. New glass should not be tinted or receive reflective coatings.</p> <p>11. Because the material cannot be manufactured to model effectively the appearance of historic windows, vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic buildings in historic districts</p>	<p>The applicant proposes to alter the size of original masonry openings on the building. Specifically, the applicant proposes to shorten two existing window openings on the first story by infilling the lower portion with brick. The lower portion of the openings had been previously infilled with metal paneling; however, the dimensions of the original masonry openings were still evident. This alteration was likely undertaken pre-district designation. <u>Staff recommends denial of infilling any portion of the existing masonry openings on the building with brick.</u></p> <p>Documentation demonstrates that the building's original one-over-one windows were removed long ago and replaced with six-over-six vinyl windows. The applicant proposes to replace the existing white six-over-six vinyl windows with new black six-over-six windows; the first story façade windows will not fit the original window openings.</p> <p>The guidelines discourage the use of vinyl windows on historic buildings.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends denial of the proposed replacement vinyl windows.</u></p> <p><u>Staff recommends that any replacement windows be wood or aluminum clad wood, fit within the original masonry openings, and have a one-over-one light configuration to match the appearance of the original windows documented in the historic photograph.</u></p> <p>On a site visit, staff noticed that the rear masonry window openings have been altered with course of infill brick at the top of the opening. The original arched opening has been flattened. <u>Staff recommends the denial of this alteration and that the work be reversed.</u></p>
Building Elements, Porches, Entrances & Doors, porch and Entrance Repair, pg. 71	<p>1. Elements that are damaged or loose should be repaired to match the detail of the existing original fabric.</p> <p>2. Hardware and locks that are original or important to the historical evolution of the building should be reused.</p> <p>3. Whenever possible repair and partial replacement of a porch is preferable to complete replacement</p>	<p>The existing front porch features turned posts and decorative brackets, corbels, and spindle work. The railings are a simple design and do not appear to be original to the building. Based on images submitted by the applicant and a staff site visit, there are many porch elements that need repair.</p> <p>The front porch is ornate and a character defining feature of the building. <u>Staff recommends that all architectural features of the porch including the turned posts, corbels, brackets, and spindle work be repaired or replaced with an exact match.</u></p>
Building Elements, Porches, Entrances & Doors, Entrance and Porch Removal, Replacement and	<p>4. Do not remove or radically change entrances and porches important in defining the building's overall historic character.</p>	<p>The application states that the decorative elements of the porch will be retained and repaired.</p> <p>The applicant proposes to replace the decking boards on the front porch with new wooden decking boards. <u>Staff recommends that the new decking boards be installed</u></p>

<p>Reconstruction pg. 71</p>	<p>7. When replacing a railing on a historic building which has lost its railing, the first step is to look for documentary evidence which records the appearance of that railing. If no documentary evidence survives, look for physical evidence (this may benefit from the help of a design professional).</p> <p>8. Do not strip entrances and porches of historic material and details that should be retained in any repair or partial replacement.</p> <p>14. Do not remove original doors and door surrounds and color should match the original door.</p>	<p><u>perpendicular to the face of the building and be tongue and groove.</u></p> <p>The existing concrete stairs will be replaced in-kind.</p> <p>A new bead board ceiling will replace the existing on the front porch.</p> <p>Woodwork will be painted Greek Villa (off-white).</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that all unpainted masonry remain unpainted.</u></p>
<p>New Construction, Fences & Walls, pg. 51</p>	<p>1. Fence, wall, and gate designs should reflect the scale of the historic structures they surround, as well as the character of nearby fences, walls, and gates.</p> <p>2. Fence, wall, or gate materials should relate to building materials commonly found in the neighborhood.</p>	<p>The applicant proposes to install a low metal fence in the front yard of the building.</p> <p>The applicant proposes to install light posts in the front yard flanking the front sidewalk. This is not a common feature within the district. <u>Staff recommends denial of the installation of light posts in the front yard.</u></p>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures

Figure 1. 2903 East Marshall Street.



Figure 2. 2903 East Marshall Street and adjacent buildings.



Figure 3. 2903 East Marshall Street Existing Conditions.



Figure 4. 2903 East Marshall Street Existing Conditions.



Figure 5. 2903 East Marshall Street, rear, Existing Conditions.



Figure 6. 2903 East Marshall Street Historic Photo, 1950s

