



Commission of Architectural Review

2. COA-188219-2026	Meeting Date: 7/28/2026
Applicant/Petitioner	Shelby Haydel
Project Description	Enclose second-story rear deck with new roof and screening
Project Location	
Address: 3009 E Broad St	
Historic District: St. John's Church	
High-Level Details: The applicant proposes to convert an existing 2nd story deck to a screened-in porch with a roof at the rear of a Queen Anne style home built in 1900. The screen will be an aluminum frame screen in front of existing railing with a TPO roof.	
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions
Staff Contact	Gregory Kerr, Gregory.Kerr@RVA.gov, (804)646-5806
Previous Reviews	Construction of the existing rear deck was approved by the Commission in June 2011.
Staff Recommendations	Staff recommends that - The screens are installed on the interior of the railing as to not obscure the rail, like its context found in the neighborhood. - Final gutter and downspout specifications be submitted for staff review and approval. Gutters should be half round or square with rounded downspouts.

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Porches and Porch Details, pg.46	<i>1. New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the historic district. Building form refers to a combination of massing, size, symmetry, proportions, projections and roof shapes that lend identity to a building. Form is greatly influenced by the architectural style of a given structure.</i>	The plans indicate that the screens for this screen porch will be installed between new 6x6 posts. This fits within the historical context of the home and the neighborhood. The neighboring homes feature similarly designed back porches, some of which include a similar screen installation. <u>Staff recommends that the screens are installed on the interior of the railing as to not obscure the rail, similar to its context found in the neighborhood.</u>
Porches and Porch Details, pg. 49	<i>2. Typical deck railings, consisting of nailed-up stock elements, are not approved as they are not based on a compatible historical model found in Richmond's Old and Historic Districts.</i> <i>5. Porch roofs are encouraged to utilize standing- or flat-lock metal seam roofs that are hand-seamed, or closely approximate hand-seaming.</i>	The proposed porch railing is utilizing the existing one, which is a traditional Richmond rail consistent with historic and neighborhood precedent. The proposed roof is made of TPO for the rear porch which a suitable material for porch roof installations. While the guidelines suggest metal roofing for new porch roofs, TPO and other membrane roofing are typical substitute materials for historic metal roofs. Furthermore, the porch is located at the rear, minimally visible, and has more utilitarian appearance. <u>Staff recommends approving the proposed roof and roofing material.</u> To reduce visual impact, <u>staff recommends that the TPO roofing be a dark color, and not white.</u> Information was not submitted regarding the installation of gutters on the new rear porch roof. <u>Staff recommends that final gutter and downspout specifications be submitted for staff review and approval. Gutters should be half round or square with rounded downspouts.</u>
Entrance and Porch Removal, Replacement and Reconstruction, pg. 71	<i>13. Porch enclosures to aid in energy conservation are only appropriate on secondary elevations. Solid materials are not recommended for use in enclosure projects since they can radically alter the historic appearance of a porch. Glass enclosures which reveal decorative porch elements are strongly preferred.</i>	The porch is planned to be enclosed by screens on all sides, which is appropriate for the second floor elevation that the porch exists upon. Additionally, the screened elevation keeps some visual access to the back of the home where the porch is located. <u>Staff recommends approval of screened-in porch, as it is consistent with district precedent and will maintain an open appearance.</u>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures



Figure 1: Back view of screened porch on 3005 E Broad St



Figure 2: Existing back porch on 3009 E Broad St



Figure 3: Existing 2nd Story Elevation of the back porch on 3009 E Broad St