

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
May 24, 2016 Meeting**

23. CAR No. 16-068 (J. Crone)

**506 W. 19th Street
Springhill Old and Historic District**

Project Description: Construct a new single family dwelling

Staff Contact: K. Chen

The applicant requests conceptual review and comment to construct a new single-family dwelling on a vacant lot in the Springhill Old and Historic District.

The proposed new construction will be a 2 ½-story, three-bay, frame, Craftsman inspired dwelling with a full façade porch and set on a brick foundation. The building is set on a brick foundation. The asphalt shingle clad gable roof will be broken by a centered shed roof dormer. The roof terminates in an undecorated box cornice. The full façade front porch has square posts, a simple cornice and a standing seam metal clad shed roof. The porch will have a brick foundation and concrete deck. The dwelling will be clad with Hardie Plank lap siding and trim. The colors indicated Heathered Moss and Sail Cloth are similar to colors found on the approved paint palette, page 60-61 in the *Guidelines*. The drawings indicate that the windows will have a 3/1 lite configuration but no dimensions or specifications were included. The dwelling is located on a block with two-story frame Craftsman-style dwellings. The house directly to the left is a one-story, Bungalow and to the right is a 2 ½-story Late Victorian dwelling.

The applicant is seeking **Conceptual Review** for this project. Conceptual review is covered under Sec. 30-930.6(d) of the City Code: *The commission shall review and discuss the proposal with the applicant and make any necessary recommendations. Such Conceptual Review shall be advisory only.* Commission staff reviewed the project through the lens of the “Standards for New Construction: Residential” on pages 44 and 45 of the *Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* and the resulting comments follow.

Staff Findings based on Commission of Architectural Review Guidelines

STANDARDS FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION

All new residential and commercial construction, whether in the form of additions or entire buildings, should be compatible with the historic features that characterize their setting and context. To protect the context of the surrounding historic district, new construction should reference the materials, features, size, scale, proportions, and massing of the existing historic building or buildings in its setting. However, compatibility does not mean duplicating the existing buildings

or environment. In order to avoid creating a false sense of history, new construction should also be discernible from the old. Perhaps the best way to think about a compatible new building (or addition) is that it should be a good neighbor; one that enhances the character of the existing district and respects its historic context, rather than being an exact (and misleading) reproduction of another building.

Staff found in general that the proposed new construction is compatible with the historic features that characterize its setting and context. The setting and context is characterized by two-story, three-bay, frame, Craftsman-style dwellings. The new construction references materials and features found in its setting – namely the use of frame, a brick foundation, and simple ornamentation. The proposed design does appear to be more vertically oriented than the adjacent buildings with a more dominant roof form. This appearance may be exaggerated in the drawing and the height of the roof line in reality will be less dominant. A perspective drawing might better illustrate the impact of the roof.

Staff has not reviewed the conceptual design with Zoning for compliance.

General Comments:

- Hardie or other fiber cement siding and trim must be smooth and un-beaded
- Windows must be true divided or simulated divided light. Vinyl windows do not meet the *Guidelines*.

The following items will need to be included for final review:

- 1) A dimensioned site plan was included but a revised site plan should be presented that shows the setbacks of the adjacent properties and their relationship to the proposed new construction. The site plan should also locate exterior mechanical equipment and trash receptacles.
- 2) Materials, details and dimensions for mechanical equipment screening.
- 3) Rear and right side elevations need to be provided.
- 4) Vertical dimensions indicating the relationship of the finished grade to the height of the foundation and porch as well as the height of the cornice and peak of the roof.
- 5) Dimensions for the windows and doors and their placement above finished-floor elevation.
- 6) A dimensioned context drawing illustrating the vertical relationship of the proposed new construction and the adjacent buildings.
- 7) Details and dimensions for all trim and decorative elements, including porch columns and cornice, roof cornice and dormer.
- 8) Vertical and horizontally dimensioned plans and elevations of the garage. Door and windows dimensions and specifications should be included along with materials and colors.
- 9) Details of the privacy fence, to include color selection. The 8-foot height shown on the drawings will require a Zoning variance.

10) A detailed statement of how the project conforms to the *Guidelines*.