



**Staff Report**  
**City of Richmond, Virginia**



**Commission of Architectural Review**

12. COA-107845-2022	<b>Conceptual Review</b> <b>Meeting Date: 3/22/2022</b>
<b>Applicant/Petitioner</b>	Manuch Amir
<b>Project Description</b>	Construct a new 2-story rear garage.
<b>Project Location</b>	
<b>Address: 3820 Hermitage Rd.</b>	
<b>Historic District: Hermitage Rd.</b>	
<b>High-Level Details:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The applicant is proposing to construct a two-story outbuilding to the rear of a ca.1928 Italian Renaissance Revival Style Single-Family Dwelling.</li> <li>The outbuilding will feature a one-car garage, workshop space, and second-story living quarters.</li> </ul>	
<b>Staff Recommendation</b>	<b>Conceptual Review</b>
<b>Staff Contact</b>	Alyson Oliver, <a href="mailto:alyson.oliver@RVA.gov">alyson.oliver@RVA.gov</a> , 804-646-3709
<b>Previous Reviews</b>	<p>A request for a rear, detached, two-story garage was approved by CAR in October 2015. The applicant has noted the following changes from the originally approved design:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Proposed façade materials have been updated. The original design proposed an all-brick building. The new design incorporates fiber-cement shingles and board and batten panels.</li> <li>The original design included a second story porch with an exterior stair. This has been removed from this design. The new design includes a port-cochere.</li> <li>The locations of the windows have been revised.</li> <li>The garage door design has been revised.</li> </ul>
<b>Staff Recommendations</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The design incorporate materials that better matches the existing dwelling, such as stucco or brick. Final material and color selection to be submitted to staff for review and approval.</li> <li>The proposed design be updated to include a hipped, Spanish-style roof, to match the existing dwelling.</li> <li>Staff requests that final window specifications be submitted to staff for review and approval.</li> </ul>

## Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Residential Outbuildings, Pg. 51, #1-3	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <i>Outbuildings, including garages, sheds, gazebos and other auxiliary structures, should be compatible with the design of the primary building on the site, including roof slope and materials selection.</i></li> <li>2. <i>Newly constructed outbuildings such as detached garages or tool sheds should respect the siting, massing, roof profiles, materials and colors of existing outbuildings in the neighborhood.</i></li> <li>3. <i>New outbuildings should be smaller than the main residence and be located to the rear and/or side of the property to emphasize that they are secondary structures.</i></li> </ol>	<p>The proposed outbuilding will be located to the rear of the existing dwelling, which is compatible with other outbuildings in the surrounding area. Staff also notes that the scale of the proposed outbuilding is compatible with other outbuildings found in the surrounding area.</p> <p>The existing dwelling, which was built circa 1928, features an Italian renaissance revival design. Its plan is rectangular with a flanking porte-cochere and side porch. It is clad in stucco and has a hipped, Spanish-style roof with barrel tiles.</p> <p>The proposed outbuilding is clad in fiber-cement shingles and board and batten panels. <b><u>Staff recommends that the applicant incorporate a material that better matches the existing dwelling, such as stucco or brick. Final materials selection and color to be submitted to staff for review and approval.</u></b></p> <p>The proposed outbuilding features a cross-gable roof clad in barrel tiles. Staff is supportive of the proposed materials but notes that the roof form is not compatible with the existing dwelling. <b><u>Staff recommends the proposed design be updated to include a hipped, Spanish-style roof, to match the existing dwelling.</u></b></p> <p>The proposed design will features a porte-cochere, which will be minimally visible and is compatible with the design of the existing dwelling.</p> <p>The windows on the outbuilding are six-over-one, which matches the windows on the existing dwelling. <b><u>Staff requests that final window specifications be submitted to staff for review and approval.</u></b></p>

# Figures



Figure 1. Existing Dwelling



Figure 2. Previously approved outbuilding.



Figure 5. Ca. 1950s image from Assessor's office



Figure 6. Ca. 1970s image from HRF