



Commission of Architectural Review

6. COA-175481-2025	Conceptual Review	Meeting Date: 11/25/2025
Applicant/Petitioner	Jason Norfleet	
Project Description	Rehabilitate front elevations of two existing buildings and construct two rear, attached ADUs.	
Project Location		
Address: 1109-1111 W Franklin		
Historic District: West Franklin Street		
High-Level Details:	<p>The applicant proposes to rehabilitate two Georgian Revival, masonry buildings at 1109 & 1111 West Franklin Street.</p> <p>1109 West Franklin Street: Brick, two-and-one-half stories, mansard front roof, four-bay front, striated base, molded cornice with swag frieze, Palladian and pedimented dormers, oriel, stone lintels. Georgian Revival; early twentieth century.</p> <p>1111 West Franklin Street: Brick, two-and-one-half stories, mansard front roof, two-bay front, modillioned cornice, round arch windows with fan lights, Palladian window, gabled dormers with Palladian unit and arch motif. Georgian Revival; early-twentieth century.</p> <p>In addition to rehabilitation of the two primary buildings on the site, the application is proposing two attached, two-story ADUs at the rear of the properties.</p> <p><i>The applicant will be submitting plans to the Virginia Department of Historic Resources to pursue historic tax credits.</i></p>	
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, Alex.Dandridge@RVA.gov, (804)646-6569	

Previous Reviews	In November 2017, The Commission approved an application to amend previously approved plans to change exterior cladding material in the rear of the building at 1111 W Franklin
Staff Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rear ADUs use either a flat roof form or a gable roof form, rather than the hipped roof form, as these forms would more likely be read as a complete roof form if only one unit were to be constructed. • The elevations of the ADUs that are clad in HardiPanel use either stucco or the same-colored brick used on the other elevations, or that the HardiPanel be used on the house facing elevation only, and the colored brick and/or stucco be used on the more visible alley facing elevation. • new metal gate between the two buildings be simple in design; the design to be submitted with the final review or later for administrative review and approval. • All original windows will be retained and repaired in-kind. • The infill brick within the first-floor south elevation's extant door be painted to match the color of the building. • All new replacement windows be wood or aluminum-clad wood with a light configuration that matches that of the other original windows such as two-over-two or one-over-one. • A front door with a larger width, and narrower side lights be used in the front door assembly at 1111 West Franklin Street.

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
New Construction, Residential Outbuildings, pg. 51	<p>1. <i>Outbuildings, including garages, sheds, gazebos and other auxiliary structures, should be compatible with the design of the primary building on the site, including roof slope and materials selection.</i></p> <p>2. <i>Newly constructed outbuildings such as detached garages or tool sheds should respect the siting, massing, roof profiles, materials and colors of existing outbuildings in the neighborhood.</i></p>	<p>The applicant proposes to construct two new, two-story accessory dwelling units at the rear of 1109-1111 West Franklin Street. The attached accessory dwelling units are contemporary in design and feature single pane metal clad windows and a combination of cladding material including brick and fiber cement paneling.</p> <p>The primary buildings are masonry with generally flat, low-slope roofs. Most accessory buildings in the immediate area have a flat or gable roof.</p> <p>The proposed accessory dwelling units will have a hipped roof which is divided in half by a parapet wall. The applicant clarified that the units are designed to be constructed separate from one another. Staff finds the hipped roof split by a center parapet wall is an incompatible design with the district, and if the units were constructed individually, one unit would look incomplete, or cut in half.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the applicant use either a flat roof form or a gable roof for the units. Furthermore, a flat roof or gable roof would more likely read as a complete roof form if only one unit were to be constructed.</u></p>

Standards for New Construction, Materials & Colors, Page 53	2. <i>Materials used in new construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the surrounding neighborhood.</i>	The HardiPanel is not a common cladding material within the district. <u>Staff recommends that the elevations of the ADU that are clad in HardiPanel use either stucco or the same-colored brick used on the other elevations, or that the HardiPanel be used on the house facing elevation only, and the colored brick and/or stucco be used on the more visible alley facing elevation.</u>
Standards for New Construction, Fences & Walls, Page 51	1. <i>Fence, wall, and gate designs should reflect the scale of the historic structures they surround, as well as the character of nearby fences, walls, and gates.</i>	<p>There is an existing one-story hyphen that connects 1109 & 1111 West Franklin Street. This connector piece is painted brick and has a sloped slate roof. It was constructed in 1968 and is not original to the site. To rehabilitate the two buildings back to two detached single-family buildings, the applicant proposes removal of the nonoriginal hyphen. Staff supports the removal of the hyphen, finding that it will restore the integrity of the two buildings.</p> <p>A new metal gate will be installed in place of the hyphen to secure the side yard between the two buildings.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the new metal gate be simple in design: the design to be submitted with the final review or later for administrative review and approval.</u></p>
Standards for Rehabilitation, p. 59	<p>5. <i>Retain original windows including both functional and decorative elements such as frames, sash, muntins, glazing, sills, hood molds, paneled or decorated jambs and moldings, shutters and exterior blinds.</i></p> <p>7. <i>Repair damaged elements instead of replacing them. Use materials that match the original in type, or use physically and chemically compatible substitute materials that convey the same appearance as the surviving elements or sections. Use available documentation when reconstructing missing elements. Pictorial, historical or physical documentation can be helpful.</i></p>	<p>1109 West Franklin Street</p> <p>The applicant proposes to retain all existing windows on the building, and to reopen several bricked-in windows on the side elevations, as well as the enclosing of an east elevation side door and replacement the front door assembly.</p> <p>Specifically, on the façade, the extant front door assembly consists of a commercial-style double door. The plans submitted show the installation of a simple 3ft. wide single door with two 1ft. wide, plate glass side lights, and a transom window. Staff was unable to locate documentation of the original front door assembly. Because documentation of the original front door does not exist, the front door and sidelights should be simple in design and constructed using appropriate materials such as wood for the front door and wood or aluminum clad wood for the side lights.</p> <p>On the south elevation, four second-story, bricked in windows will be replaced with new one-over-one windows within the original window openings.</p> <p>Two bricked-in windows on the first-floor will be replaced with two new one-over-one windows within the original windows' openings.</p> <p>Towards the left side of the south elevation, a first-floor door will be replaced with a new full light door, and the bricked-in transom above the door will be replaced with a new transom window, underneath the original transom's brick arch.</p>

Commented [KC1]: East elevation is the façade and it appears all of those windows are being retained. I think you are describing the south elevation.

Commented [AD2]: Decide on first-floor or first-story

	<p>At the basement level of the south elevation, three windows will be replaced with new windows within the original windows' openings.</p> <p>On the rear elevation, four vertically aligned windows will be replaced with new one-over-one windows within the existing window openings, and one bricked-in basement level window will be replaced with a new window within the original window openings.</p> <p>On the rear of the widest, front portion of the building, a bricked-in second story window will be replaced with a new one-over-one window in the original window opening.</p> <p>One bricked in window on the left-hand side, first-floor of the south elevation's projecting bay will be replaced with a new one-over-one window.</p> <p>1111 West Franklin Street</p> <p>The applicant proposes to retain all existing windows on the building, and to reopen several bricked-in windows on the side elevations, as well as the enclosing of a south elevation side door and replacement the front door assembly.</p> <p>Specifically, two vertically aligned, bricked-in door openings on the south elevation will be reopened with new transoms and fixed, full-light doors will be installed in the original openings.</p> <p>A transom window will be reinstalled above a first-floor side door on the projecting bay on the south elevation.</p> <p>One smaller extant door on the first floor of the south elevation will be infilled with recessed brick. <u>Staff recommends that the infill brick within the first-floor south elevation extant door be painted to match the color of the building.</u></p> <p>Two bricked-in windows on the north elevation will be reopened and two new windows will be installed within the dimensions of the original window openings, retaining the original arched brick tops. It appears that the original openings no longer retain granite sills like the other original windows on this elevation</p> <p>All original windows will be retained and repaired in-kind.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that all new replacement windows be wood or aluminum clad wood with a light configuration that matches that of the other original windows such as two-over-two or one-over-one.</u></p> <p>The extant front door assembly consists of an original ornate fanlight and a commercial-style double door. The plans submitted show the retention of the extant fanlight and the installation of a simple 3ft. wide single door with two 2ft. wide large, plate glass side lights. Staff was unable to locate documentation of the original front door assembly. Because the original</p>
--	---

Commented [KC3]: East elevation is the façade and there is not a door being enclosed

		<p>front door assembly opening is quite large, staff finds that a larger front door with more narrow side lights may be more appropriately scaled for the building. <u>Staff recommends that a front door with a larger width and narrower side lights be used in the front door assembly.</u> Because documentation of the original front door doesn't exist, the front door and sidelights should be simple in design and constructed using appropriate materials such as wood for the front door and wood or aluminum clad wood for the side lights.</p>
<p>Porches & Porch Details, page 49</p>	<p><i>1. Porch railings and balustrades are important character-defining features of historic buildings. The proportions of these railings are a significant contributing feature to the appearance of both the individual structure and the character of the entire neighborhood.</i></p>	<p>Currently, 1109 & 1111 West Franklin Street share a joined uncovered front porch constructed of brick and enclosed by a simple black metal rail. There is a center brick stair with stone treads. This configuration is not original to the site and was done when the two buildings were joined together.</p> <p>The applicant proposes to separate the two front porches. Once separated the new porches will remain brick and uncovered with their own sets of front stairs and retain the same extant black metal rail design.</p> <p>Staff supports the separation of the two porches, as this is not an original configuration.</p> <p>While a complete front porch rebuild is not proposed in the scope of the application, staff found photographic documentation of the original front porch design of 1109 West Franklin Street. The original front porch was a full-width covered front porch with an upper balustrade with turned balusters supported by Corinthian columns. The lower porch railings feature a robust upper and lower banister with turned balusters that matched the upper balustrade. <u>Staff recommends that the applicant consider the reconstruction of the front porch at 1109 West Franklin Street, based on photographic documentation.</u></p> <p>The original design of the front porch at 1111 West Franklin was not found.</p> <p>Staff finds that as proposed, the metal rail and uncovered porch design for both buildings is simple in design and is appropriate in that it is unobtrusive and does not detract from the remaining character defining features of the buildings.</p>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures



Figure 1. Façade of 1109 West Franklin Street, Nov. 2025.



Figure 2. Façade and west elevation of 1111 West Franklin Street, Nov. 2025.



Figure 3. Facades of 1109 & 1111 West Franklin Street, Nov. 2025



Figure 4. Connector piece/hypen between 1109 & 1111 West Franklin Street, Nov. 2025



Figure 5. 1109 West Franklin Street, 1950s.



Figure 6. Façade of 1111 West Franklin Street, 1950s.



Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Figure 7. Rear of 1109 & 1111 West Franklin Street, Nov. 2025



Figure 8. Looking northwest down subject alley, N