



Commission of Architectural Review

1. COA-176757-2025	Final Review	Meeting Date: 12/16/2025
Applicant/Petitioner	Jason Norfleet	
Project Description	Rehabilitate front elevations	
Project Location		
Address: 1109 West Franklin Street		
Historic District: West Franklin Street		
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <p>The applicant proposes to rehabilitate a Georgian Revival, masonry building at 1109 West Franklin Street.</p> <p>The extant building is a brick, two-and-one-half stories, mansard front roof, four-bay front, striated base, molded cornice with swag frieze, Palladian and pedimented dormers, oriel, stone lintels. Georgian Revival; early twentieth century.</p> <p><i>The applicant will be submitting plans to the Virginia Department of Historic Resources to pursue historic tax credits.</i></p>		
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, Alex.Dandridge@RVA.gov, (804)646-6569	
Previous Reviews	The commission conceptually reviewed this application at their November 2025 meeting. The commission supported the rehabilitation of the building with no major recommendations.	
Staff Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Any subsequent conditions issued by the Virginia Department of Historic Resources during the historic tax credit process be submitted to CAR staff for review and approval. • new metal gate between the two buildings be simple in design; the design to be submitted with the final review or later for administrative review and approval. • All original windows will be retained and repaired in-kind. • All new replacement windows be wood or aluminum-clad wood with a light configuration that matches that of the other original windows such as two-over-two or one-over-one. • If the applicant expands the scope of work to include the 	

	<p>reconstruction of the covered front porch, it must be based on historic photographs, such as the 1950s photograph provided by staff, and/or original building plans.</p>
--	---

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
<p>Standards for New Construction, Fences & Walls, Page 51</p>	<p><i>1. Fence, wall, and gate designs should reflect the scale of the historic structures they surround, as well as the character of nearby fences, walls, and gates.</i></p>	<p>There is an existing one-story hyphen that connects 1109 & 1111 West Franklin Street. This connector piece is painted brick and has a sloped slate roof. It was constructed in 1968 and is not original to the site. To rehabilitate the two buildings back to two detached single-family buildings, the applicant proposes removal of the nonoriginal hyphen. Staff supports the removal of the hyphen, finding that it will restore the integrity of the two buildings.</p> <p>A new metal gate will be installed in place of the hyphen to secure the side yard between the two buildings.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the new metal gate be simple in design; the design to be submitted with the final review or later for administrative review and approval.</u></p>
<p>Standards for Rehabilitation, p. 59</p>	<p><i>5. Retain original windows including both functional and decorative elements such as frames, sash, muntins, glazing, sills, hood molds, paneled or decorated jambs and moldings, shutters and exterior blinds.</i></p> <p><i>7. Repair damaged elements instead of replacing them. Use materials that match the original in type, or use physically and chemically compatible substitute materials that convey the same appearance as the surviving elements or sections. Use available documentation when reconstructing missing elements. Pictorial, historical or physical documentation can be helpful.</i></p>	<p>The applicant proposes to retain all existing windows on the building, and to reopen several bricked-in windows on the side elevations, as well as the enclosing of an east elevation side door and replacement the front door assembly.</p> <p>Specifically, on the façade, the extant front door assembly consists of a commercial-style double door. The plans submitted show the installation of a simple 3ft. wide single door with two 1ft. wide, plate glass side lights, and a transom window. Staff was unable to locate documentation of the original front door assembly. Because documentation of the original front door does not exist, the front door and sidelights should be simple in design and constructed using appropriate materials such as wood for the front door and wood or aluminum clad wood for the side lights.</p> <p>On the south elevation, four second-story, bricked in windows will be replaced with new one-over-one windows within the original window openings.</p> <p>Two bricked-in windows on the first-floor will be replaced with two new one-over-one windows within the original windows' openings.</p>

		<p>Towards the left side of the south elevation, a first-floor door will be replaced with a new full light door, and the bricked-in transom above the door will be replaced with a new transom window, underneath the original transom's brick arch.</p> <p>At the basement level of the south elevation, three windows will be replaced with new windows within the original windows' openings.</p> <p>On the rear elevation, four vertically aligned windows will be replaced with new one-over-one windows within the existing window openings, and one bricked-in basement level window will be replaced with a new window within the original window openings.</p> <p>On the rear of the widest, front portion of the building, a bricked-in second story window will be replaced with a new one-over-one window in the original window opening.</p> <p>One bricked in window on the left-hand side, first-floor of the south elevation's projecting bay will be replaced with a new one-over-one window.</p>
<p>Porches & Porch Details, page 49</p>	<p><i>1. Porch railings and balustrades are important character-defining features of historic buildings. The proportions of these railings are a significant contributing feature to the appearance of both the individual structure and the character of the entire neighborhood.</i></p>	<p>Currently, 1109 & 1111 West Franklin Street share a joined uncovered front porch constructed of brick and enclosed by a simple black metal rail. There is a center brick stair with stone treads. This configuration is not original to the site and was done when the two buildings were joined together.</p> <p>The applicant proposes to separate the two front porches. Once separated the new porches will remain brick and uncovered with their own sets of front stairs and retain the same extant black metal rail design.</p> <p>Staff supports the separation of the two porches, as this is not an original configuration.</p> <p>While a complete front porch rebuild is not proposed in the scope of the application, staff found photographic documentation of the original front porch design of 1109 West Franklin Street. The original front porch was a full-width covered front porch with an upper balustrade with turned balusters supported by Corinthian columns. The lower porch railings feature a robust upper and lower banister with turned balusters that matched the upper balustrade. <u>If the applicant expands the scope of work to include the reconstruction of the covered front porch, it must be based on historic photographs, such as the 1950s photograph provided by staff, and/or original building plans.</u></p> <p>Staff finds that as proposed, the metal rail and uncovered porch design for both buildings is simple in design and is appropriate in that it is unobtrusive and does not detract from the remaining character-defining features of the buildings.</p>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures



Figure 1. 1950s image of 1109 West Grace Street showing the original front porch.



Figure 2. Façade of 1109 West Grace Street, November, 2025.



Figure 3. Hyphen between 1109-1111 West Franklin Street to be removed, November, 2025.



Figure 4. Rear of 1109 West Grace Street, November, 2025.