




Staff Report
City of Richmond, Virginia



Commission of Architectural Review

9.COA-156646-2024	Final Review	Meeting Date: 11/26/2024
Applicant/Petitioner	Will Gillette, Baker Development Resources	
Project Description	Construct two new, attached, three-story dwellings	
Project Location		
Address 817 N. 22 nd Street		
Historic District: Union Hill		
<p>High-Level Details:</p> <p>The applicant proposes to construct two, attached dwellings on the east side of 22nd street.</p> <p>The dwellings will be three-stories in height, clad with lap siding, ranked six-over-six windows on the façade and will have a faux gable roof with dormer windows on the third story.</p> <p>The primary entrances will be recessed.</p>		
Staff Recommendation	Approval, with Conditions	
Staff Contact	Alex Dandridge, alex.dandridge@rva.gov, (804) 646-6569	
Previous Reviews	<p>This application was reviewed and deferred at the September 2024 meeting of the Commission. The Commission deferred the application, as there were remaining question regarding the design details of the building's exterior. The Commission asked to see more dimensions and detail on the architectural features, trim, and dormers. The front entrances were discussed, and the Commission had concerns over the recessed entrances appearing flat. A more robust door surround was discussed, as well as the possibility of relocating the entrances to the outer sides of each unit. The Commission also requested that the applicant submit more context detail to better understand the height relationship between the existing and proposed buildings.</p> <p>This application was conceptually reviewed at the July 2024 meeting of the Commission. Commissioners noted that the new construction's height was taller than most historic residential development; but could be acceptable with a "tweaked design". Discussion around the overall design of the building included pushing the design farther to be more eclectic and to better address the recessed entrances. Pushing and pulling the wall plane, including a front porch, and the idea an English basement was mentioned as potential inclusions in the design.</p>	
Conditions for Approval	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A dimensioned door surround and window hoods detail be submitted for chair and vice chair review to ensure that it is 	

	<p>proportionately correct to the overall building.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Downspouts be rounded. • Gutter and downspout specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval. • The treated wood rails and decks be painted or opaquely stained. • Information on the proposed material treatment of recessed entrance and steps be submitted for Administrative Review and approval. • Final window specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.
--	--

Staff Analysis

Guideline Reference	Reference Text	Analysis
Standards For New Construction, page 46	<i>All new residential and commercial construction, whether in the form of additions or entire buildings should be compatible with the historic features that characterize the setting and context. To protect the context of the surrounding historic district, new construction should reference the materials, features, size, scale, proportions, and massing of the existing historic buildings in its setting.</i>	<p>The new construction will be located mid-block, fronting 22nd Street between Venable and Burton streets. The adjacent block of Venable Street is an intact block primarily composed of two-story, Italianate, and Victorian-influenced, detached frame dwellings. Directly to the south is the two-story, former Perkinson's Ice Cream factory that has been renovated and converted to housing. The adjacent block of Burton Street is composed of the rear yards of the dwellings fronting Venable and contains a two-story ADU and garage and utility buildings. Directly across 22nd Street is vacant land, part of which will be redeveloped with three-story dwellings recently approved by the Commission. The Perkinson Ice Cream factory, the only context building on the block face, is a two-story, stuccoed building with a recessed entry. It is set at the property line on 22nd and Burton streets.</p> <p>The new construction will be three stories in height, three bays wide, and set close to the sidewalk. In lieu of a porch, the new dwellings will have recessed entries with decorative surrounds. The dwellings will be frame, with ranked windows.</p> <p>In the last submission, the building featured recessed front entrances. The Commission suggested that the recessed front entrances be more substantial, featuring a more robust door surround and a differing material within the vestibule. The Commission also suggested that the entrances be relocated to the sides of the building so that they could be partially open rather than recessed. The applicant has responded to the Commission by incorporating a more ornate door surround around the two entrances. The door surrounds will have two fluted pilasters supporting a classically inspired entablature.</p> <p>There are examples of recessed entrances with ornate door surrounds thought City Old and Historic Districts (See Figure 7).</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that a dimensioned door surround and window hoods detail be submitted for chair and vice</u></p>

		<u>chair review to ensure that it is proportionately correct to the classical tradition.</u>
Standards For New Construction: Siting, page 46	<i>2. New residential infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns of the surrounding block. The minimum setbacks evident in most districts reinforce the traditional street wall.</i>	<p>The site plan provided indicates that there will be a 10" front yard setback from the property line on 22nd Street. The application also refers to the prior development pattern for the property which was a brick commercial building set close to the street facing Venable and a series of frame and brick in-fill buildings between the corner and the factory fronting 22nd. This array of buildings was set close to the property line.</p> <p>The proposed set back pattern is consistent with the historic development pattern of the property and the remaining historic building on 22nd Street.</p>
Standards For New Construction: Form, page 46	<i>1. New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the historic district. Building form refers to the specific combination of massing, size, symmetry, proportions, projections, and roof shapes that lend identity to a building.</i>	<p>Massing: The proposed three-bay width is a common massing found in the district.</p> <p>Symmetry: The new construction is symmetrical with its three-bay organization of vertically ranked windows and entries.</p> <p>Proportions: The proposed dwellings are taller than existing historic residential and commercial buildings on this subject block in Union Hill. Most of the buildings in the surrounding blocks are two stories in height.</p> <p>Projections: The buildings do not have any projections.</p> <p>Roof shapes: The roof shape is not typical of historic buildings within Union Hill but has been approved on nearby new construction as a nod to the traditional gable roof with dormer windows found in the City's OHD's.</p>
Standards For New Construction: Form, page 46	<i>2. New residential construction should maintain the existing human scale of nearby historic, residential construction in the district.</i>	<p>As proposed, the new construction will feature human scale elements in its first story fenestration pattern and recessed entry with a decorative surround. While the dwellings are set near the sidewalk and lack a yard and front porch, typically associated with residential development in the district, the simple surround at the recessed entrances anchors the façade at a human scale.</p> <p>During the last review, the Commission discussed the appropriateness of including a front porch in the design, and the idea of a more substantial door surround if the entrances remain recessed. Specifically, the Commission and Staff recommended that the door surround be more substantial than was proposed, and the material the inside the vestibule be different such as bead board.</p> <p>The applicant has revised the plans, retained the recessed entrances, but included a more substantial and ornate door surround.</p>
Standards for New Construction: Height, Width, Proportion & Massing, page 47	<i>1. New residential construction should respect the typical height of surrounding residential buildings.</i> <i>2. New residential construction should respect the vertical orientation typical of</i>	<p>Most of the historic dwellings in this block of Venable Street, on both the north and south sides, are two stories in height except for two-dwellings that are set on English basements. The only remaining, adjacent, historic building on 22nd Street is two-stories in height.</p>

	<p><i>other residential properties in surrounding historic districts. New designs that call for wide massing should look to the project's local district for precedent. For example, full-block-long row house compositions are rare in Richmond. New residential buildings that occupy more than one third of a block face should still employ bays as an organizational device, but the new building should read as a single piece of architecture.</i></p> <p><i>3. The cornice height should be compatible with that of adjacent historic buildings.</i></p>	<p>The historic dwellings on the block are three-bays wide with ranked windows on the façade. The proposed three-bay arrangement on the new construction is compatible with historic patterns in the surrounding area.</p> <p>During the last review, the Commission emphasized the importance of including a dimensioned context drawing with the next submission. The applicant has included measurements of the neighboring building.</p> <p>The proposed building will be approximately 24 feet from the ground level to the second story cornice, while the neighboring building at 815 North 22nd Street has a max height of 22 feet.</p>
Standards for New Construction: Materials & Colors, page 47	<p><i>2. Materials used in new residential construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district.</i></p>	<p>The new dwellings will be clad in horizontal siding, which generally resembles other types of horizontal siding found within the district.</p> <p>The foundations will be parged and painted tan/gray, trim and soffits will be composite, exterior doors will be wooden, windows will be aluminum clad wood, the roof will be standing seam metal on the façade and TPO on the remainder, front rails will be Richmond Rail, and the rear deck and railings will be treated wood.</p> <p>Windows will have a six-over-six pane configuration with simulated divided lights. Staff recommends that final window specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.</p> <p>Gutter and downspout information was not provided in the application.</p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the downspouts be rounded.</u></p> <p><u>Staff recommends that gutter and downspout specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.</u></p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the rear treated wood rails and decks be painted or opaquely stained.</u></p> <p><u>Staff recommends that the final windows have SDL's and that the final specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval.</u></p>
Standards For New Construction: Doors and Windows, page 56	<p><i>2. The size, proportion and spacing patterns of door and window openings on free-standing new construction should be compatible with patterns established in the district.</i></p>	<p>The dwellings will have single, ranked windows in a three-bay arrangement on the façade. The north elevation is the only elevation that will be largely visible. Staff finds that the fenestration pattern is generally in keeping with the pattern found in the district.</p>
Site improvements and hardscaping		<p>Based on the site plan submitted in the application, the dwelling will be set close to the property line and there will be recessed entrances and a single step to the sidewalk.</p>

		Staff recommends that information on the proposed material treatment of recessed entrance and steps be submitted for Administrative Review and approval.
Standards for New Construction, Residential, Fences & Walls, pg. 51	<p>1. Fence, wall, and gate designs should reflect the scale of the historic structures they surround, as well as the character of nearby fences, walls, and gates.</p> <p>2. Fence, wall, or gate materials should relate to building materials commonly found in the neighborhood.</p> <p>3. Privacy fences along the side and rear of a property should be constructed of wood of an appropriate design. Privacy fences are not appropriate in front of a historic building.</p>	<p>The context elevation provided appears to indicate that a board fence will be installed along 22nd Street between the new dwelling on Venable Street and the proposed new dwellings at 817 N. 22nd Street.</p> <p>Staff recommends that details on any proposed fencing be submitted for Administrative Review.</p> <p>The proposed fencing will screen the trash receptacles.</p>

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation and New Construction outlined in Section 30-930.7 (b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.

Figures



Figure 1. 2201 Venable Street, ca. 1880s commercial building demolished in 1977. The infill along 22nd Street to the factory building is visible.



Figure 2. 1905 Sanborn Map



Figure 3. 1952 Sanborn Map



Figure 5. Southeast corner of Venable Street and N. 22nd Street.

Figure 4. Northeast corner of N. 22nd Street and Cedar Street.



Figure 6. Southeast corner of Venable Street and N. 22nd Street.

Figure 7. 608 North 24th Street. Recessed entrance with door surround.

