

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
August 22, 2017, Meeting**

5. COA-021088-2017 (M. Kittrell)

**8-10 East Main Street
Zero Blocks East and West Franklin Street
Old and Historic District**

Project Description:

**Construct a second story addition
on an existing 1-story garage.**

Staff Contact:

M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval to construct a rooftop addition on an existing garage at the rear of a property in the Zero Blocks East and West Franklin Street Old and Historic District. The primary building is a brick, three-story, Queen Anne multifamily structure build ca. 1895. The existing garage is a single story brick structure with a flat roof with a stepped parapet. The garage was altered in 2003 when the Commission approved the creation of three new vehicular openings in the west elevation. The applicant is proposing to construct a second story frame addition which will be accessible by a set of exterior stairs. The addition will have a hip roof clad in asphalt shingles. The applicant is proposing to clad the addition in fiber cement board and batten siding. On the west elevation, the applicant is proposing a shed dormer with a standing seam metal roof, multi-lite windows, and fiber cement panels. The applicant is proposing simulated divided lite, aluminum clad windows. The structure will be visible from the adjacent alley and Foushee Street and minimally visible from North 1st Street. There are numerous outbuildings along the subject alley including a two story brick carriage house with a hipped roof immediately across the alley and two 2-story brick carriage houses with flat roofs on the properties to the east of the subject lot.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions. Staff has reviewed the proposed structure under the Commission's guidelines for residential additions and residential outbuildings found on pages 46-51 of the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*. The *Guidelines* note that additions should be subordinate in size to their main buildings and as inconspicuous as possible by being located at the rear of a building (pg. 46, Siting #1). Though the proposed addition is the same size as the existing garage, it is substantial smaller than the primary structure on the property and is located at the rear of the property. The *Guidelines* state that additions should not obscure or destroy original architectural elements (pg. 47, Materials & Colors #1). The existing garage has been altered and reconstructed over time. Staff recommends the applicant incorporate the existing stepped parapet wall on the west elevation in the proposed design in a manner to be administratively reviewed and approved as staff believes this roof form was an original architectural feature of the garage. The *Guidelines* note that newly constructed outbuildings should respect the siting, massing, roof profiles,

materials and colors of existing outbuildings in the neighborhood (pg. 51, Residential Outbuildings #2). With the proposed addition, the outbuilding will be of the same scale and with the same roof form as the historic outbuilding immediately across the alley. Though the outbuildings and the majority of primary structures in the neighborhood are of brick construction, staff supports the use of the frame construction as the *Guidelines* note that additions should be differentiated from the old (pg. 5, #9) which the applicant has achieved by the use of the different materials for the addition.

It is the assessment of staff that, with the conditions above, the application is consistent with the Standards for New Construction outlined in Sections 30-930.7 (c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.