

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
August 23, 2016 Meeting**

5. **CAR No. 16-122** (A. Holloway)

**2428 Venable Street
Union Hill Old and Historic District**

Project Description: **Rehabilitate an existing structure to include the replacement of windows and doors, painting of the structure and the construction of an addition at the rear.**

Staff Contact:

M. Pitts

The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate an existing home in the Union Hill Old and Historic District to include the construction of a two story addition at the rear of the structure. The existing Italianate structure has been modified through the years to include the installation of vinyl siding on the side and rear elevations, the installation of fiber cement siding on the front elevation, the replacement of all windows and doors, and the altering of openings including the first floor front windows. The applicant is pursuing rehabilitation tax credits for this project.

The applicant is proposing to replace the existing vinyl replacement windows with 1/1 wood windows and aluminum storm windows. All windows will be located in existing opening except the first floor windows on the façade. The existing first floor windows are in altered openings. The applicant will restore the historic openings by lengthening the existing openings by 2'-2". The applicant proposes to replace the existing front steel door with a wooden four panel door.

The applicant is proposing to construct an addition at the rear of the structure. There is currently a single story addition at the rear of the structure. The applicant proposes to construct a second story addition above the existing addition and also a two story addition to the east of the existing addition. The addition will be setback 6" from the existing east and west wall faces and the two story addition will be inset 1 foot from the rear wall. The addition will be clad in board and batten wood siding and will be set on a parged concrete foundation. The proposed additions will have flat roofs and will connect to the existing shed roof. The proposed 2nd story addition will be 20' in height and the two story addition will be 19'-6" in height.

The applicant proposes to paint the structure as follows:

- Siding on the Façade: Morris Room Grey (SW0037) which is similar to Sawdust #8 on the Commission's paint palette
- Porch Ceiling: Rising Tide (Valspar 4008-3-A)
- Trim: Pure White (SW7005)
- Front and Rear Doors: Heirloom Red (Valspar 1010-3) which is similar to Roycroft Copper Red #29 on the Commission's paint palette

- Porch Floor: Deep Twilight Blue (Valspar 4007-6C) which is similar to Bungalow Blue #32 on the Commission's paint palette.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions.

Rehabilitation of Windows and Doors: The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* note that original windows should be retained; the number, location, size or glazing pattern of windows should not be changed by cutting new openings, blocking out windows, or installing inappropriately sized replacement sashes; and vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic buildings in historic districts (pg. 65, #1, #8, #11). The existing windows are not original to the structure as they are inappropriate vinyl replacement windows. Staff supports the installation of the wood windows as they are an appropriate material for the District. Additionally, staff supports the replacement of the steel front door with a wooden door which is consistent with historic doors in the district. On the façade, the first floor windows are inappropriately sized due to changes to the window openings prior to the establishment of the Old and Historic District. Staff supports the restoration of the window openings to their original size on the first floor with the condition that the window head heights align with the front door transom.

Building Addition: The *Guidelines* state that additions should be subordinate to the primary structure and as inconspicuous as possible (pg. 44, #1). The proposed addition is at the rear of the home and is at a lower height than the existing structure. The proposed addition does not result in any loss of historic fabric as the windows to accommodate the addition are not original windows and the existing siding is vinyl siding. The Guidelines note that new construction should be discernible from the old (pg. 44), and the proposal achieves this through the use of board and batten siding and setting the addition back from the existing building walls. As details of the proposed board and batten siding were not provided, staff recommends approval be conditioned on details of the siding being provided for administrative review and approval.

Painting: Staff finds the proposed color scheme is appropriate for the Italianate home. As no paint color was provided for the siding on the addition, staff recommends the proposed board and batten siding be painted Morris Room Grey to match the siding on the façade.

As the applicant is pursuing rehabilitation tax credits for this project, staff recommends the Commission's approval should be conditioned upon the work being performed in conformance with the Part II Tax Credit application approval and conditions. In addition, the applicant should submit any additional conditions subsequently imposed by DHR or the National Park Service to CAR staff for administrative review and approval.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the above noted conditions, is consistent with the Standard for Rehabilitation in Sections 30-930.7(b) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.