

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
October 25, 2016 Meeting**

5. **CAR No. 16-146** (J. & S. Breeden) **700 North 27th Street**
Church Hill North Old and Historic District

Project Description: **Construct a garage, a pergola, a deck, and an addition to an existing structure; repaint the existing structure; and replace the existing fences.**

Staff Contact: **M. Pitts**

The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate a property in the Church Hill North Old and Historic District. The existing primary structure is a 2 story, frame, Greek Revival-style dwelling with an English basement constructed ca. 1853. Before the end of the nineteenth century, the structure was extended to the south towards M Street and a Victorian porch was installed. At the rear of the property, there is a two-story, brick carriage house which was constructed in 1880 adjacent to the existing alley and M Street. Historic Richmond Foundation has an easement on the property and has been working with the applicant on the proposed alterations to the property.

The applicant is proposing the following work:

- **Addition:** Construction of a 450 square foot addition on the M Street elevation. The proposed addition would require the demolition of an existing rear porch and stair. The proposed addition will be 22' above grade at its highest point and will extend out 23' from the 2-story portion of the home. The applicant is proposing to set the addition on brick piers and will clad the structure in a combination of Hardie panel and Hardie lap siding in the colors Colonial Revival Gray (#5) and Cajun Red (#25). The windows in the addition are proposed to be aluminum-clad wood casement windows in black. The proposed roof will have a minimal slope and be clad in membrane and will be minimally visible due to proposed parapet walls with metal coping.
- **Deck:** Construct a 90 square foot deck at the rear of the existing single-story portion of the home. The deck will be constructed of wood and set on brick piers. The proposed railing will have horizontal pickets and will be painted white with the top rail painted black. The applicant is proposing to install aluminum-clad wood French doors in black in a new opening to access the proposed deck.
- **Garage:** Construct a 400 square foot garage at the rear of the property adjacent to the existing alley. The proposed garage will have a height of 11'-6" at its highest point and will be 20' by 20'. The structure will be clad in a combination of Hardie panel and Hardie lap siding in Colonial Revival Gray (#5) to match the proposed addition and will be set on a concrete

foundation. The proposed roof will have a minimal slope and be clad in membrane and will be minimally visible due to proposed parapet walls with metal coping. The applicant has proposed a simple metal garage door to be painted black, aluminum-clad wood casement windows in black on the east elevation, and a steel, two-panel door painted black on the south elevation.

- **Pergola:** Construct a wooden pergola to span from the proposed garage to the existing carriage house. The proposed pergola will be painted white and will be a total height of 9'-10".
- **Paint:** Paint all previously painted brick on the primary structure and the carriage house and the brick on the proposed addition Cajun Red (#25). Paint the existing wood siding Classic French Gray (#6). Existing unpainted chimneys to remain unpainted.
- **Fence:** Remove existing wooden picket fence at the front of the property and install a black metal fence 3' in height. The existing wooden picket fence surrounding the rear yard will be replaced in-kind.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions.

Addition: The *Guidelines* state that additions should be subordinate to the primary structure and as inconspicuous as possible (pg. 44, #1). The proposed addition is towards the rear of the home, is small in size in comparison to the primary structure, and is a height lower than the façade. The applicant has also designed the addition to minimally impact the existing structure by not altering the existing roof forms. The *Guidelines* note that new construction should be discernible from the old (pg. 44). The applicant achieves this differentiation through the use of windows with a different light configuration and the use a combination of Hardie panels and Hardie siding. Staff recommends the proposed Hardi siding be smooth and unbeaded.

Deck: The proposed deck meets the Commission's *Guidelines* for decks (pg. 48) as the deck will be painted, incorporates a contemporary rail design, is set on brick piers, and is located at the rear of the structure. The *Guidelines* note that the addition of new openings on a secondary elevation will be considered by the Commission on a case-by-case basis. Staff supports the installation of doors to access the deck as they will be located at the rear of the structure and will be minimally visible from the public right of way.

Garage: The *Guidelines* note that garages should be compatible with the design of the primary building on the site, including roof slope and materials selection; respect the design of outbuildings in the neighborhood; and should be located in the rear (pg. 48, Residential Outbuildings #1-3). The proposed out building will be clad in a similar material as the primary structure and is located at the rear of the property. The proposed garage will have the similar roof form as the existing

outbuilding on the property yet will be differentiated from the historic structure through the material choices. Staff recommends approval of the proposed garage.

Pergola: The *Guidelines* offer very little guidance about small, freestanding structures such as arbors and pergolas. It does, however, note that auxiliary structures should be compatible with the design of the major buildings on the site, and respect the materials and colors of the main structure (pg. 48, Outbuildings 1-4). The *Guidelines* also suggests that new auxiliary structures should be located to the rear or side of the property to emphasize that they are secondary to the main residence. The proposed pergola is subordinate to the house on the site, the proposed design, materials, and color of the pergola complement the residence.

Paint: As the *Guidelines* note gray as an appropriate color for a Greek Revival structure (pg. 58), staff recommends approval of the proposed paint color for the body of the historic structure. The *Guidelines* note that when painting previously painted brick, the colors associated with natural brick are strongly preferred (pg. 59, Historic Masonry #3); therefore, staff recommends approval of the proposed paint color for the previously painted brick. As the *Guidelines* encourage unpainted masonry to remain unpainted (pgs. 59 & 85), staff recommends the new masonry elements remain unpainted.

Fence: The *Guidelines* state that original fences should be retained and new fences should be constructed using materials and designs appropriate to the District (pg. 74, #1, #4). Staff has located an image of the property in 1936 from the Virginia W.P.A Historical Inventory Project which shows a short wooden picket fence at the front of property. As a wooden picket fence has been the traditional fence design on the property dating back to at least 1936, and wooden fences are the prevalent fence material in the district, staff recommends the existing wooden fence be maintained and repaired or replaced in-kind, and the proposed metal fence not be installed.

It is the assessment of staff that the application, with the above noted conditions, is consistent with the Standard for Rehabilitation and New Construction in Sections 30-930.7(b) and (c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the pages cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.