

**COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
STAFF REPORT
September 22, 2015 Meeting**

10. **CAR No. 15-122** (H. Fraim)

**600 W. 19th Street
Spring Hill Old & Historic District**

Project Description:

Rehabilitate house and garage

Staff Contact:

K. Chen

The applicant requests approval to rehabilitate a house and garage located in the Springhill Old and Historic District. The rehabilitation of the house includes replacing vinyl siding smooth fiber cement siding, replacing deteriorated windows with vinyl sash, repairing and painting brick work, repairing a wood fence and removing a chain link fence, reconfiguring an enclosed porch, and repairing or replacing in-kind and extending existing concrete sidewalks. The garage rehabilitation includes the removal of two later additions and the installation smooth fiber cement siding.

Siding

The house is currently clad with vinyl siding and asphalt shingles over the historic lap wood siding. The underlying wood siding is in poor condition and missing in some areas. Smooth fiber cement siding with a 5" reveal that matches the historic siding will be installed. The siding will be painted #5 Colonial Revival Gray and the trim will be painted #41 Classic Light Buff. The *Guidelines*, page 56, discourage the use of fiber cement siding as a substitute for original wood siding and suggest that it should be restricted to secondary elevations.

Windows

The historic windows are in poor condition and the proposal is to replace all of the windows with 2/1 vinyl windows. The proposal to replace the windows is generally in keeping with the *Guidelines* for Window Replacement and/or Reconstruction, page 65, except for #10 and 11. The photographs provided with the application and the site visit suggest that the historic muntin configuration is 1/1 sash on the façade and 2/2 sash on the remaining elevations. The 2/1 sash appear to be inappropriately repaired/replaced 2/2 sash. The use of vinyl windows is not appropriate in historic districts.

Roofing

The roof of the one-story wing on the rear of the house and on the front porch will be replaced with membrane roofing. These roofs are not visible.

Garage

The one-bay, one-story garage is located at the southwest corner of the property with an overhead door facing Springhill Avenue. The garage has a shed roof and is clad with a variety of sidings – vinyl, sheet metal and Masonite board. The

proposal is to clad the garage with smooth, fiber cement siding to match the house. The proposal is consistent with the *Guidelines* for Residential Outbuildings on page 48.

Enclosed porch

There is an enclosed porch located on the southwest corner of the dwelling. This was probably a screened porch that was enclosed at a later date with 1/1 windows with varying head heights and sills that are too close to the floor. The proposal is to install new 1/1 windows at a consistent head height. The new windows will be of a uniform size and spacing, and the sill height will be raised to accommodate seating on the interior.

The proposal to tuck point and repaint the brick foundation and chimneys is in keeping with the *Guidelines* for painting historic masonry on page 59. The brick work will be painted either #29 Roycroft Cooper Red or #30 Deep Maroon.

The proposal to remove the chain link fence, repair and paint the board fence, repair, pare, and paint the concrete block retaining wall, and repair or replace in-kind and extend the existing concrete sidewalk is consistent with the *Guidelines* for Site Improvements on pages 72 and 74. A new powder coated square picket railing will be installed next to the steps and the fence and retaining wall will be painted colors contained in the approved palette on pages 60-61.

Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions:

- The wood siding on the façade be repaired and retained if possible
- Wood or aluminum clad 1/1 or 2/2 simulated divided light windows be installed.

The *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines* Standards for Rehabilitation – Residential Construction found on page 55 place an emphasis on the repair and retention of historic material and features. The majority of work described in the application qualifies as repair and retention of historic materials or the removal and replacement of non-historic materials and poor workmanship.

It is the assessment of staff that with the applicant's acceptance of the above conditions the proposal is consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation outlined in Section 114-930.7(c) of the City Code, as well as with the *Richmond Old and Historic Districts Handbook and Design Review Guidelines*, specifically the page cited above, adopted by the Commission for review of Certificates of Appropriateness under the same section of the code.