

City of Richmond

*City Hall
900 East Broad Street*



Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, September 26, 2023

3:30 PM

Virtual Meeting Link: <https://tinyurl.com/35z4ervs>

5th Floor Conference Room of City Hall

Commission of Architectural Review

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:30 p.m.

[PDRPRES
2023.063](#) Access and Participation Instructions - Commission of Architectural Review

Attachments: [Public Access and Participation Instructions -COMMISSION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW.pdf](#)

Roll Call

Present -- 7 - * Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, * Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, * Commissioner Andrew Moore, * Commissioner Sean Wheeler, * Commissioner John Grier, * Commissioner Mitch Danese and * Larry Nutt

Absent -- 2 - * Commissioner Kathleen Morgan and * Commissioner Lawrence Pearson

OTHER BUSINESS

Approval of Minutes

Administrative Approval Report

Enforcement Report

Secretary's Report

Mr. Dandridge shared that there are not any Meeting Minutes ready for approval. Mr. Dandridge presented the Administrative Approval Report. Also, Mr. Dandridge shared that the synthetic barrel tile was installed on the roof at 905 Belmont Avenue. This project was presented at the March 2023 CAR meeting.

Ms. Chen gave a presentation on the Westwood neighborhood. This presentation is a consideration to begin the process of designating a new City Old and Historic District.

- A. [PDRPRES
2023.062](#) Westwood Historic District - Consideration to begin the process of designating a new City Old and Historic District.

Attachments: [Westwood OHD Request.pdf](#)

- B. [PDRPRES
2023.061](#) Paint Subcommittee - Review work completed during subcommittee sessions (August - September).

Mr. Dandridge mentioned that the Paint Subcommittee has had meetings in August and September. Staff would like to discuss results of the Paint Committee meetings at the October Quarterly Meeting on Tuesday, October 10, 2023.

CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to move item #5 2205 West Grace Street to the Consent Agenda.

Mr. Wheeler asked to move 3302-3308 East Marshall Street to the end of the agenda.

Mr. Danese said he needs to leave early. Mr. Wheeler withdrew the motion.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Larry Nutt

5. [COA-135639-2023](#) 2205 West Grace Street - Construct a one-story, rear garage.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve the application for the reasons cited in the staff report provided the following conditions are met:

Final material specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval to include brick, garage door design, and final color specifications; new rear privacy fence be submitted for administrative review and approval; and any subsequent changes to the footprint or setback of the garage require by zoning be resubmitted to CAR staff for Chair and Vice-Chair approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Larry Nutt

REGULAR AGENDA

1. [COA-135962-2023](#) 3302-3308 East Marshall Street - Result of a Notice of Violation: Reconstruct two, one-story, commercial storefronts in conjunction with previously approved new construction.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

3304 and 3306 East Marshall Street were eclectic, one-story commercial buildings that were recently demolished without a permit or COA. The block has small-scale 1 and 2-story buildings. The demolished buildings were from the early 1900s. In September 2021, CAR Approved plans for new development on the site of these parcels. In May 2023, CAR approved building permits for the new project. Two new buildings are proposed for the site, one will each flank the reconstructed buildings on the west and east sides.

Todd Dykeshorn, the architect for the project, said they wanted to keep the east wall of the second building, but found lots of spalling brick. Dykeshorn said they initially only wanted to keep the building facades not the whole buildings. He commented that the buildings were not in good condition.

The owner of the properties owners, Casey White, commented that he had planned to

stabilize the façade but found less than desirable materials.

Ms. Jenny Joyce from Historic Richmond said the demolished buildings were the last original buildings on the block. She thinks the City should have higher penalties for demolitions. She believes more care and attention should be taken toward historic buildings.

A resident from the block believes more salvaged materials should be used for the reconstruction of the two buildings. He said the demolition greatly effects the appearance of the neighborhood.

Ms. Blythe King, a resident on the block, said the two demolished storefronts had historic integrity for the neighborhood. She wanted to hold a memorial for the two lost buildings.

Ms. Nancy Lampert, a resident of Union Hill, knows of another time a similar situation occurred. She thinks there should be two sets of consultants when developers want to add to a historic building.

Commissioner Danese made a motion to defer the project due to a lack of information on materials for the reconstructed buildings. Ms. Rodriguez seconded the motion.

Commissioner Rodriguez believes the project should be considered Conceptual.

Commissioner Wheeler questioned if the project is approved, would the previously approved COA would still be valid?

Commissioner Danese wondered if the application should be denied and resubmitted as Conceptual.

Secretary Dandridge said he thinks the project should be deferred. Depending on the amount of detail submitted in the next application, the project could either be put on Conceptual or Final review.

Commissioner Wheeler suggested that the whole project should be one story to keep the project small scale.

The Commission had a discussion about adding Subcommittees for further discussing and approving elements of this project.

Commissioner Wheeler and Commissioner Danese debated if this application should be seen as a new project.

Commissioner Brewer believed the project should all be presented as a whole plan for the site. She said the project can be redone as a new project but the demolished buildings should be reconstructed.

Commissioner Wheeler said the two buildings need to be reconstructed, not just the facades. He said he believes the 2021 COA is not valid since the two buildings that were to be incorporated in the project are no longer standing.

Commissioner Nutt commented that the proposed renderings based on pre-existing materials from the demolished buildings.

Commissioner Rodriguez said it is impossible to exactly replicate the buildings since most of the materials are gone.

Secretary Dandridge said, the reconstruction of the two buildings may be about replicating character and feel of the buildings for the block.

Each of the Commissioners present voted in favor of deferring the project.

A motion was made by Commissioner Danese, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to defer the application to allow the applicant additional time to resubmit information to the Commission. Additional information should include the entire scope of work proposed for the parcel, a list of final exterior material and color specifications for the new construction and reconstructed buildings, and any other information that would be useful for the commission.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Larry Nutt

2. [COA-135963-2023](#) 616 West 20th Street - Construct a new single-family detached dwelling.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

Commissioner Moore asked Staff's opinion of the shingle siding in the gable vent.

Staff said that they agree it is more compatible than the previously proposed vertical siding.

Mr. William Gillette, the applicant, said he does not have any issues with the Staff recommendations. The project will need to go through zoning and receive a special exception.

Commissioner Moore made a motion to approve the project. Ms. Brewer seconded the motion.

Commissioner Moore asked about specific materials for the project.

Secretary Dandridge said vinyl trim can be approved for new construction. The new building will be set back from the public street.

Commissioner Wheeler asked to have a condition added that says "no vinyl, no k-style gutters, and that the shingles on roof mimic the pattern of shingles under the gable."

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

Air conditioning units need to be screened or located behind the house; that the balusters are fitted into the top and bottom rails around the new rear deck; final window, door and paint color specifications be submitted for administrative review and approval; windows be wood or aluminum clad; final material specifications submitted to staff for approval, not to include any vinyl materials;

gutter system not include k-style gutters; and asphalt shingles on the roof mimic pattern of the fiber cement shingles on the front gable face.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Larry Nutt

3. [COA-135629-2023](#) 13 East Broad Street - Construct a new, five-story commercial building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

This project was reviewed conceptually at the July 2023 CAR Meeting. The previous building on the lot burned in the 1980s. Since the last review, the applicant has added a cornice on top of the building, and a cornice line above the third floor. The applicant also added additional plantings and signage to break up the panels on the first floor.

Commissioner Moore asked for clarification on the signage.

Ms. Cyane Crump, Director of the Historic Richmond Foundation, is grateful for the thought put into this project.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

Final treatment of the recessed, metal paneled E. Broad Street entrance be submitted to Staff for Chair and Vice Chair approval, such as final signage, plantings, or other exterior materials/features.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 7 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier, Commissioner Mitch Danese and Larry Nutt

4. [COA-135633-2023](#) 500 North Allen Avenue - Install a paneled mural on the Allen Avenue façade of a corner building.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

The application is for a mural that will be a community project for the Orchard House School. At a community event, students will have the opportunity to add to the mural panels.

Commissioner Grier asked about the possibility of installing the mural on the right recessed portion of the building.

Ms. Elizabeth LaFoon, applicant for the project, said they considered installing the mural on the side of the building, but believe the middle will be more visible.

Commissioner Rodriguez believes the side elevation would be very visible from either direction on Monument Avenue.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Brewer, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

That the mural be installed in the mortar, as stated in the application; the mural should use as few fasteners as structurally possible; that the mural be installed in a way that it does not obstruct the character-defining elements on the façade: jack arches, keystones, belt course and stone sills; that the mural should stay below the brick belt courses and below the third floor; that there should be a 1” to 2” gap between the mural panel and the brick wall to allow for air flow and proper ventilation between the panels; and final placement of the mural should be submitted to Staff for administrative approval. Final placement may include the southern façade of the northern projecting bay of the building (allowing for greater panel width).

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier and Larry Nutt

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

6. [COA-135643-2023](#) 3119 Monument Avenue - Construct a roof over rear porch.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to approve the application for the reasons stated in the staff report provided that the following conditions are met:

Final exterior material and color specifications submitted for administrative review and approval.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 6 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore, Commissioner Sean Wheeler, Commissioner John Grier and Larry Nutt

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

7. [COA-135960-2023](#) 211 North 27th Street - Result of a Notice of Violation: Alter a front yard, concrete curb, veneering it in thin brick.

Attachments: [Application & Plans](#)
[Staff Report](#)

This application is the result of a violation. Secretary Dandridge had been in contact with the applicant in July 2023. The applicant completed the project without a COA. The applicant covered a cracked curb in front of their house with a thin brick veneer. Secretary

Dandridge recommended denial of the project and that the curb be repaired.

The applicant brought pictures and mentioned many brick walls in the neighborhood. The homeowner thinks the addition of the brick on the curb is an improvement. He mentioned an untouched brick wall below the steps. The owner knew he was in a CAR district, but though he was just making a repair.

Commissioner Wheeler commented that he didn't think the brick looked bad but was concerned about the thin brick as it could pose issues in bad weather.

The Commissioners discussed the compatibility of the brick cladding.

A motion was made by Commissioner Brewer, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to deny the application for the reasons stated in the staff report.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye -- 4 - Commissioner Ashleigh N. Brewer, Commissioner Coleen Bulter Rodriguez, Commissioner Andrew Moore and Larry Nutt

No -- 2 - Commissioner Sean Wheeler and Commissioner John Grier

Excused -- 1 - Commissioner Mitch Danese

Adjournment

Meeting ended at 7:08 p.m.