

11. COA-078396-2020

PUBLIC HEARING DATE

September 22, 2020

PROPERTY ADDRESS

3135 West Franklin Street

DISTRICT

Monument Avenue

APPLICANT

J.B. Cadwallender

STAFF CONTACT

Carey L. Jones

Commission of Architectural Review

STAFF REPORT



PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Construct a new single-family residence on a vacant portion of a developed lot.

PROJECT DETAILS

- The applicant proposes to construct a new single-family dwelling on the same parcel as an existing 1906 two-family residence.
- The proposed house will be two stories tall, two bays wide with a sloped roof.
- Decorative details include a one-story, full-width porch supported by 8x8 square posts and a potential screened rear porch.
- On the façade, the applicant proposes a pair of windows in a projecting bay and a single window and door. On the right elevation, the applicant proposes an irregular window pattern, and no windows on the left elevation. On the rear elevation, the applicant proposes a set of paired windows, and either four large doors or a screened-in porch.
- Proposed materials include white TPO membrane on the roof, 7” lap siding on the body, and a parged foundation.
- The project requires a Special Use Permit (SUP).



The City of Richmond assumes no liability either for any errors, omissions, or inaccuracies in the information provided regardless of the cause of such or for any decision made, action taken, or action not taken by the user in reliance upon any maps or information provided herein.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

The applicant is seeking **Conceptual Review** for this project. Conceptual review is covered under Sec. 30-930.6(d) of the City Code: The commission shall review and discuss the proposal with the applicant and make any necessary recommendations. Such Conceptual Review shall be advisory only. Commission staff reviewed the project through the lens of the “Standards for New Construction” on pages 44, and 46-56 of the Richmond Old and Historic District Handbook and Design Review Guidelines utilizing the Guidelines presented below.

PREVIOUS REVIEWS

The Commission has not previously reviewed this application.

SURROUNDING CONTEXT

The south side of the 2300 block of West Franklin Street is developed with a mix of two- and two-and-one-half-

story residences on raised foundations. Buildings are brick or masonry, typically 3 bays, and either attached row houses or detached single family homes, most of which have a one-story, full-width porch. The majority of buildings on the block have a false mansard roof, some with dormers. The predominant architectural style is Colonial Revival, and many building have Classical entrance and cornice elements. There is a two-story five-bay stucco apartment building adjacent to the project site. There are no buildings addressing the north side of West Franklin Street, as the lots face Monument Avenue.

STAFF COMMENTS

Staff recommends that:

- The applicant simplify the window patterns and style and consider a three-bay configuration on the façade
- The applicant include roof design elements and a heavy fascia board or other element to serve as a terminal design feature to be more in keeping with the surrounding context
- The applicant use masonry on the body of the house to be in keeping with the materials found in the surrounding district

STAFF ANALYSIS

Siting, pg. 46, #s2-3	<p><i>2. New residential infill construction should respect the prevailing front and side yard setback patterns of the surrounding block. The minimum setbacks evident in most districts reinforce the traditional street wall.</i></p>	The applicant proposes to set the building back 15'-7/16". This is consistent with the existing building on the lot.
	<p><i>3. New buildings should face the most prominent street bordering the site.</i></p>	The proposed building faces W. Franklin Street, the prominent street bordering the site.
Form, pg. 46 #s1-3	<p><i>1. New construction should use a building form compatible with that found elsewhere in the historic district.</i></p>	The applicant proposes a two-story, two-bay, rectangular-shaped house. Staff notes there are a variety of building widths found on the subject block, however the adjacent building is three bays wide, as are the majority of the single-family dwellings on the block. While staff recognizes that the proposed building is narrower, as it will be located on a lot that will be subdivided from an existing lot, staff also finds that there are examples of narrow three-bay buildings and recommends <u>the applicant consider a three-bay configuration to be in keeping with the dominant pattern in the surrounding district.</u>
	<p><i>2. New residential construction should maintain the existing human scale of nearby historic residential construction in the district.</i></p>	Based on the conceptual street view provided by the applicant, the building is generally in keeping with the height of the surrounding buildings.
	<p><i>3. New residential construction and additions should incorporate human-scale elements such as cornices, porches and front steps into their design.</i></p>	The applicant proposes vertically aligned openings, a one-story full-width porch, and front stairs. The applicant does not propose a cornice line detail, in keeping with the more modern design. Staff notes that the surrounding properties incorporate a variety of design elements, including a heavy, undecorated cornice line in keeping with the urban Colonial Revival style, or medallions in keeping with the

		<p>Art Deco style.</p> <p>The subject block is characterized by buildings with a dominant roof element, primarily mansard roofs with or without dormers. Staff recommends <u>the applicant consider revising the design to incorporate similar elements. Staff recommends the applicant include a heavy fascia board or other element to serve as a terminal design feature to be more in keeping with the surrounding context.</u></p>
Height, Width, Proportion, & Massing, pg. 47, #s1-3	<p>1. <i>New residential construction should respect the typical height of surrounding residential buildings.</i></p>	<p>The proposed building is 25'-7" in height. The conceptual street view indicates the other building on the lot is approximately 27'-11".</p>
	<p>2. <i>New residential construction should respect the vertical orientation typical of other residential properties in surrounding historic districts.</i></p>	<p>The applicant proposes a vertically aligned fenestration pattern on the façade, in keeping with other properties in the surrounding area.</p>
	<p>3. <i>The cornice height should be compatible with that of adjacent historic buildings.</i></p>	<p>Based on the conceptual street view provided by the applicant, the cornice height will be compatible with the surrounding buildings.</p>
Materials and Colors, pg. 47, #s2-4	<p>2. <i>Materials used in new residential construction should be visually compatible with original materials used throughout the district.</i></p> <p>3. <i>Paint colors used should be similar to the historically appropriate colors already found in the district.</i></p>	<p>The applicant proposed fiber cement lap siding on the exterior of the building. Staff notes that there are no wood sided buildings in the surrounding area; instead, they are masonry. <u>Staff recommends the applicant utilize a masonry material to be in keeping with the surrounding area.</u></p>
New Construction, Doors and Windows, pg. 49 #3	<p>3. <i>The size, proportion, and spacing patterns of doors and window openings on free standing, new construction should be compatible with patterns established within the district.</i></p>	<p>Staff finds the paired windows on the front elevation and the irregular window patterns on the side and rear elevation are not in keeping with the district. Staff recognizes that the applicants prefer a simplified and modern design, however staff also finds that the single bay of paired windows is not a fenestration pattern or style found in the surrounding area. Staff recommends <u>the applicant consider revising the fenestration pattern to be consistent with the patterns found in the surrounding area.</u></p>
Mechanical Equipment, pg. 68	<p><i>The visual impact of new mechanical equipment should be minimized to protect the historic character of the district.</i></p>	<p>The site plan provided by the applicant indicates the HVAC units will be located in a side yard behind a fence.</p>

FIGURES



Figure 1. 1950 Sanborn Map



Figure 2. 3135 W. Franklin Street, existing building on the lot.



Figure 3. 3135 W. Franklin Street, location of proposed new construction.



Figure 4. View west along W. Franklin Street towards the proposed new construction.



Figure 5. 3100 Block W. Franklin St, south side



Figure 6. 3100 Block W. Franklin St, north side